

**Second Session - Thirty-Ninth Legislature**  
**of the**  
**Legislative Assembly of Manitoba**  
**Standing Committee**  
**on**  
**Agriculture and Food**

*Chairperson*  
*Mr. Tom Nevakshonoff*  
*Constituency of Interlake*

**Vol. LX No. 3 – 10 a.m., Monday, June 9, 2008**

ISSN 1708-6647

**MANITOBA LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY**  
**Thirty-Ninth Legislature**

<b>Member</b>	<b>Constituency</b>	<b>Political Affiliation</b>
ALLAN, Nancy, Hon.	St. Vital	N.D.P.
ALTEMEYER, Rob	Wolseley	N.D.P.
ASHTON, Steve, Hon.	Thompson	N.D.P.
BJORNSON, Peter, Hon.	Gimli	N.D.P.
BLADY, Sharon	Kirkfield Park	N.D.P.
BOROTSIK, Rick	Brandon West	P.C.
BRAUN, Erna	Rossmere	N.D.P.
BRICK, Marilyn	St. Norbert	N.D.P.
BRIESE, Stuart	Ste. Rose	P.C.
CALDWELL, Drew	Brandon East	N.D.P.
CHOMIAK, Dave, Hon.	Kildonan	N.D.P.
CULLEN, Cliff	Turtle Mountain	P.C.
DERKACH, Leonard	Russell	P.C.
DEWAR, Gregory	Selkirk	N.D.P.
DOER, Gary, Hon.	Concordia	N.D.P.
DRIEDGER, Myrna	Charleswood	P.C.
DYCK, Peter	Pembina	P.C.
EICHLER, Ralph	Lakeside	P.C.
FAURSCHOU, David	Portage la Prairie	P.C.
GERRARD, Jon, Hon.	River Heights	Lib.
GOERTZEN, Kelvin	Steinbach	P.C.
GRAYDON, Cliff	Emerson	P.C.
HAWRANIK, Gerald	Lac du Bonnet	P.C.
HICKES, George, Hon.	Point Douglas	N.D.P.
HOWARD, Jennifer	Fort Rouge	N.D.P.
IRVIN-ROSS, Kerri, Hon.	Fort Garry	N.D.P.
JENNISSON, Gerard	Flin Flon	N.D.P.
JHA, Bidhu	Radisson	N.D.P.
KORZENIOWSKI, Bonnie	St. James	N.D.P.
LAMOUREUX, Kevin	Inkster	Lib.
LATHLIN, Oscar, Hon.	The Pas	N.D.P.
LEMIEUX, Ron, Hon.	La Verendrye	N.D.P.
MACKINTOSH, Gord, Hon.	St. Johns	N.D.P.
MAGUIRE, Larry	Arthur-Virden	P.C.
MALOWAY, Jim	Elmwood	N.D.P.
MARCELINO, Flor	Wellington	N.D.P.
MARTINDALE, Doug	Burrows	N.D.P.
McFADYEN, Hugh	Fort Whyte	P.C.
McGIFFORD, Diane, Hon.	Lord Roberts	N.D.P.
MELNICK, Christine, Hon.	Riel	N.D.P.
MITCHELSON, Bonnie	River East	P.C.
NEVAKSHONOFF, Tom	Interlake	N.D.P.
OSWALD, Theresa, Hon.	Seine River	N.D.P.
PEDERSEN, Blaine	Carman	P.C.
REID, Daryl	Transcona	N.D.P.
ROBINSON, Eric, Hon.	Rupertsland	N.D.P.
RONDEAU, Jim, Hon.	Assiniboia	N.D.P.
ROWAT, Leanne	Minnedosa	P.C.
SARAN, Mohinder	The Maples	N.D.P.
SCHULER, Ron	Springfield	P.C.
SELBY, Erin	Southdale	N.D.P.
SELINGER, Greg, Hon.	St. Boniface	N.D.P.
STEFANSON, Heather	Tuxedo	P.C.
STRUTHERS, Stan, Hon.	Dauphin-Roblin	N.D.P.
SWAN, Andrew, Hon.	Minto	N.D.P.
TAILLIEU, Mavis	Morris	P.C.
WOWCHUK, Rosann, Hon.	Swan River	N.D.P.

**LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA  
THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON AGRICULTURE**

**Monday, June 9, 2008**

**TIME – 10 a.m.**

**LOCATION – Winnipeg, Manitoba**

**CHAIRPERSON – Mr. Tom Nevakshonoff  
(Interlake)**

**VICE-CHAIRPERSON – Mr. Drew Caldwell  
(Brandon East)**

**ATTENDANCE – 11 QUORUM – 6**

*Members of the Committee present:*

Hon. Messrs. Struthers, Rondeau

Messrs. Caldwell, Dyck, Eichler, Goertzen, Ms. Howard, Mr. McFadyen, Ms. Melnick, Mr. Nevakshonoff, Ms. Selby

*Substitutions:*

Hon. Mr. Rondeau for Hon. Ms. Wowchuk

Hon. Mr. Lemieux for Hon. Mr. Rondeau at 11:14 a.m.

**APPEARING:**

Hon. Jon Gerrard, MLA for River Heights

Mr. Cliff Graydon, MLA for Emerson

Mrs. Mavis Taillieu, MLA for Morris

**WITNESSES:**

Mr. Adrien Grenier, Private Citizen  
Mr. Paul Grenier, Private Citizen  
Mr. Marcel Hacault, Private Citizen  
Mr. George Camara, Camara Enterprises  
Mr. Joe Van Schepdael, Van Schepdael Farms  
Mr. John Nickel, Private Citizen

**WRITTEN SUBMISSIONS:**

Mr. Adrien Grenier, Private Citizen

Mr. Paul Grenier, Private Citizen

Mr. Marcel Hacault, Private Citizen

**MATTERS UNDER CONSIDERATION:**

Bill 17–The Environment Amendment Act  
(Permanent Ban on Building or Expanding Hog  
Facilities)

\* \* \*

**Mr. Chairperson:** Good morning. Will the Standing Committee on Agriculture and Food please come to order. This meeting has been called to consider Bill 17, The Environment Amendment Act (Permanent Ban on Building or Expanding Hog Facilities).

We have a number of presenters registered to speak to this bill as noted on the list before you on the table and posted at the entrance of the room.

Also, as was announced in the House on June 4, the committee will sit until noon, and we will sit again on the following occasions: this evening at 6 p.m.; tomorrow night, Tuesday, June 10, at 6 p.m.

Before we go any further, I have a note for the committee. Members are no doubt aware that we have had a large volume of presenters registered to speak to bills this session. I would like to take a moment to thank the staff of the Clerk's office, Pat Malynyk, Karen Kawaler and Arlene Finkel for their hard work and dedication in recording and tracking all of the information required to maintain those lists. This process would not work so smoothly without them, and I want them to know that their efforts are appreciated.

For the information of all in attendance, this committee had previously agreed to hear out-of-town presenters first.

Also, we have had a request from presenter No. 260, George Camara, who has to leave the province later today and will be unable to present at any time other than this morning. He has asked if the committee would allow him to speak this morning. What is the will of the committee? Should we have him present after the three French presentations?  
*[Agreed]*

Before we proceed with presentations, we do have a number of other items and points of information to consider. First of all, if there is anyone else in the audience who would like to make a presentation this morning, please register with staff at the entrance of the room.

Also, for the information of all presenters, while written versions of presentations are not required, if you are going to accompany your presentation with written materials, we ask that you provide 20 copies.

If you need help with photocopying, please ask our staff.

As well, I would like to inform presenters that, in accordance with our rules, a time limit of 10 minutes has been allotted for presentations with another five minutes allowed for questions from committee members.

Also, in accordance with our rules, if a presenter is not in attendance when their name is called, they will be dropped to the bottom of the list. If the presenter is not in attendance when their name is called a second time, they will be removed from the presenters' list.

Prior to proceeding with public presentations, I would like to advise members of the public about speaking in committee. Our meetings are recorded to provide a transcript. Each time anyone wishes to speak, I have to say that person's name to signal the *Hansard* recorders to turn microphones on and off.

Thank you for your patience. We will now proceed with public presentations.

Last week we received requests from several presenters to make their presentations in French with the assistance of our translation staff. During our meeting last Friday, the committee agreed to hear the following three French presentations this morning. We have Adrien Grenier, No. 26; Paul Grenier, No. 61; Marcel Hacault, No. 310.

We will be using what we call consecutive translation for these presentations. This means we will have the presenter say a few sentences in French. Then our translator will respond in English, and so forth. I ask for the presenters' and the committee's patience with this process.

I'll now call Mr. Adrien Grenier to the microphone.

**Mr. Ralph Eichler (Lakeside):** Again, just coming back to your opening comments, Mr. Chairperson, I do want to also put on the record our thanks for the work and efforts that not only the Clerk's office has shown but the government side.

We did reach an agreement on Friday not to strike anyone off the list and move them to the bottom of the list as a result of two things: the number of presenters that had actually filed and the way in which our committees are called is many-a-times uncertain about when they'll be allowed to present. The other issue was the World Pork Congress was on. A number of those people are

returning today, and a number of people have not even realized that their name has been called to come to committee.

So, again, I want to thank the Clerk's office, and hopefully those people will now have the opportunity to have their voice heard in a significant way, which they certainly wanted to make sure their voices are heard; so not only the Clerk's office but the government side in working with us in order to make sure the democratic moves are, in fact—their voices are heard within the province of Manitoba. So thanks to everyone on the committee for that.

\* (10:10)

### Committee Substitution

**Mr. Chairperson:** Thank you, Mr. Eichler. Before we begin, I have one substitution: Mr. Rondeau in for Ms. Wowchuk.

\* \* \*

**Mr. Chairperson:** Okay. Good morning, Mr. Grenier.

**Mr. Adrien Grenier (Private Citizen):** Bonjour.

**Mr. Chairperson:** Do you have any written materials for the committee?

**Mr. Grenier:** Oui, j'ai une vingtaine de copies ici.

*Yes, I have about 20 copies here.*

**Mr. Chairperson:** Thank you. You have the floor, sir. You may begin.

### *Bilingual presentation*

**Mr. Adrien Grenier:** Je me présente devant vous aujourd'hui pour vous communiquer mon opposition au Projet de loi 17.

*I am here today to present my opposition to Bill 17.*

*Permettez-moi de plaider ma cause.*

*Allow me to plead my case.*

*D'abord, un peu d'histoire.*

*First, a bit of history.*

*Je suis propriétaire d'une porcherie de 4000 cochons.*

*I am the owner of a hog farm with 4,000 animals.*

*Le début était typique de notre génération et les grand-grand-parents sont arrivés avec un boeuf.*

*The beginning was typical of our generation; my great-grandparents arrived with one cow.*

Ils ont ajouté des cochons, des poules.

*They added pigs and chickens.*

Ils ont commencé à défricher le terrain.

*They started to clear the land.*

La ferme a passé de génération à génération.

*The farm passed from generation to generation.*

Mon grand-grand-père a acheté le premier boeuf de race pour augmenter la production de la crème.

*My great-grandfather bought the first breed cow to increase dairy production.*

Mon père a changé à la livraison de lait en vrac et a bâti une étable plus moderne.

*My father changed it to a bulk dairy production and built a more modern barn.*

Personnellement, j'ai ajouté une nouvelle étable.

*Personally, I added a new barn.*

Et le troupeau augmente.

*And the herd is growing.*

Et nous défrichons et cultivons plus de terrain, encore.

*And we are still clearing more and cultivating more land.*

Maintenant c'est l'embauche des employés qui entre en jeu.

*Now the hiring of employees enters the picture.*

Mes fils s'intéressent à l'entreprise.

*My sons are interested in the family business.*

Aujourd'hui la ferme est plus diversifiée qu'avant. Elle a des vaches laitières et la porcherie.

*Today the farm is more diversified than before. We have dairy cows and the hog operation.*

Deux fermes familiales, deux différentes voies et on travaille ensemble.

*Two family farms, two different tracks and we work together.*

L'avantage de cela, c'est que la porcherie fournit de l'engrais pour la production du lait et c'est tout nécessaire et ça se complémente très bien.

*The advantage is that the hog operation provides the fertilizer for the milk production, this is necessary and they complement each other very well.*

Les fermes grandissent mais le nombre d'opérations diminue toujours.

*The farms are increasing in size but the number of operations is decreasing.*

Peut-être que ça permet aux villages d'augmenter le monde. Souvent c'est un choix d'emploi ou un style de vie qu'ils ne veulent pas. Les heures des fermes sont un peu longues. Pas tout le monde veut être fermier.

*Maybe this allows the towns to increase in size. Often it's a choice between lifestyle and employment that they don't want. Farm hours are rather long. Not everyone wants to be a farmer.*

Les possibilités d'emploi dans les communautés rurales sont sur les fermes laitières ou fermes agricoles ou fermes porcines.

*The possibilities for employment in rural communities are on dairy farms or agricultural farms or hog farms.*

Je répète. Les fermes grandissent et le nombre de fermiers baisse toujours.

*I repeat. Farms are increasing in size and the number of farmers continues to decrease.*

Le résultat, c'est que le fermier n'a plus de voix.

*The result is that the farmer no longer has a voice.*

Le fermier est devenu une minorité parmi une population qui a perdu l'attachement à la terre et la compréhension d'où vient sa nourriture.

*Farmers have become a minority in a population that has lost the connection to the land and the understanding of where its food comes from.*

La population en général ne voit jamais les efforts et les changements à l'industrie porcine et ce qu'on fait pour l'environnement.

*The general public never sees the efforts and the changes made in the hog industry and what we do for the environment.*

C'est facile de mettre le blâme et la responsabilité sur le fermier.

*It's easy to place the blame and the responsibility on the farmer.*

Si le fermier a tort, la population en général n'a rien à faire.

*If the farmer is wrong, then the general public does not have to do anything.*

Donc le moratoire sur les porcheries, au lieu de regarder aux autres sources telles que les villages et les autres industries qui contribuent au problème de phosphate.

*Hence the moratorium on hog operations, instead of looking at other sources such as towns and other industries which contribute to the problem of phosphates.*

Il y a plus de bovins au Manitoba que de porcines. Ça fait, s'ils étaient sérieux—

*There are more cattle in Manitoba than there are hogs, so if they were really serious—*

Mais en tous cas, il y a aussi plus d'animaux à queue plate dans les lacs qui défèquent dedans steady.

*But, anyway, there are more animals with flat tails that defecate in the lakes steady.*

En tout cas, le gouvernement provincial envoie un message négatif au sujet de l'industrie porcine et seulement au sujet de l'industrie porcine.

*Anyway, the provincial government is sending a negative message about the hog industry and only about the hog industry.*

Les résultats du rapport de la Commission de protection de l'environnement ne justifie pas la décision d'établir un moratoire permanent sur l'industrie porcine.

*The results of the Clean Environment Commission report do not justify the decision to impose a permanent moratorium on the hog industry.*

Le moratoire seul ne résoudra pas le problème.

*The moratorium alone will not solve the problem.*

Les autres industries et les centres de concentration de population ont aussi des responsabilités à prendre et des changements à établir.

*Other industries and centres with a concentration of population also have responsibilities to take and changes to make.*

Ces choses ici vont amener—les résultats de cela, ça va donner qu'il n'y aura pas de futur pour les

entreprises agricoles surtout, mais pas seulement pour l'industrie porcine.

*These things will bring—the result will be that there won't be any future for agricultural operations above all, but not only the hog industry.*

Pas de stabilité dans les fermes.

*No stability on the farms.*

Les nouvelles lois de plus en plus restrictives.

*New laws that are more and more restrictive.*

Pas de logique dans les nouvelles lois ou les lois établies à l'encontre des recommandations.

*No logic in the new laws, or laws established contrary to recommendations.*

J'ai perdu confiance dans le gouvernement.

*I have lost confidence in the government.*

C'est une situation très décourageante pour les jeunes qui veulent se lancer en agriculture. Est-ce que c'est la fin de la ferme familiale?

*This is a very discouraging situation for youth who want to go into agriculture. Is this the end of the family farm?*

Si le gouvernement peut si facilement établir un moratoire permanent sur l'industrie porcine, va-t-il ensuite s'attaquer aux autres industries lorsque le moratoire ne produit pas les changements voulus?

*If the government can so easily establish a permanent moratorium on the pork industry, will it then attack other industries when the moratorium doesn't produce the desired changes?*

C'est très facile pour les employés gouvernementaux d'établir les moratoires de toutes sortes, et de nouvelles lois.

*It's very easy for government employees to put moratoriums of all kinds in place, and new laws.*

De leurs bureaux, il est difficile de croire que cette décision aura un impact sur eux.

*In their offices it is difficult to believe that this decision will have an impact on them.*

Je vous assure que les recommandations que vous allez faire et la nouvelle loi qui sera établie continueront d'avoir un impact direct et très prononcé sur ma vie, et sur ma famille.

*I assure you that the recommendations that you make and the new act which will be established will continue to have a direct and very strong impact on my life and on my family.*

En plus le fermier n'a pas le luxe d'un plan de retraite.

*On top of that, farmers don't have the luxury of a retirement plan.*

Tous les jours que je travaille à mon entreprise sont en effet mon gagne-pain mais aussi ma contribution à ma retraite.

*Every day that I work on my farm is in effect my living but is also how I contribute to my retirement.*

Au point où je suis dans ma vie, je vous assure que mon plan de retraite va changer drastiquement avec le Projet de loi 17.

*At this point in my life I assure you that my retirement plan is going to change drastically with Bill 17.*

Évidemment ce point n'est pas important pour vous.

*Evidently this point is not important to you.*

Mais soyez bien assurés que ce n'est pas seulement moi-même et les entreprises agricoles qui vont en souffrir si le projet de loi est adopté. Toute la province va en souffrir.

*But I assure you that it is not just myself and farm businesses that are going to suffer if Bill 17 is adopted. The entire province will suffer from it.*

Juste pour changer le ton un peu, j'ai une petite analogie à vous faire, à vous amener.

*Just to change the tone a little, I have a little analogy for you.*

Monsieur Garidodo est le directeur de l'école de Grand Manitou.

*Mr. Garidodo is the principal of Grand Manitou school.*

Monsieur Stanislaus est l'enseignant du grade 8.

*Mr. Stanislaus is the grade 8 teacher.*

Il garde un pot de bonbons sur son pupitre et s'aperçoit que les bonbons baissent.

*He keeps a jar of candies on his desk and notices that the level of candies is diminishing.*

Ça fait qu'il questionne la classe et ils pointent le doigt à Monsieur Grenier. Ont va l'appeler Gringo.

*So he questions the class and they point the finger at Mr. Grenier. We will call him Gringo.*

Petit Gringo, il n'a pas une grosse voix, il est timide.

*Little Gringo doesn't have a strong voice, he is shy.*

Souvent il ne parle pas fort, ça fait qu'il est facile à blâmer.

*Often he doesn't speak loud, so it is easy to put the blame on him.*

Il est une minorité.

*He's a minority.*

Monsieur Stanislaus décide de sortir Gringo de la classe pour une semaine.

*Mr. Stanislaus decides to take Gringo out of the classroom for a week.*

Les bonbons continuent à baisser.

*The level of candies continues to go down.*

Il plaide sa cause à Monsieur Garidodo, et

*He pleads his case with Mr. Garidodo, and*

Monsieur Gari dit, on va l'expulser de l'école.

*Mr. Garidodo says we're going to expel him from the school.*

Pensez-vous que les bonbons vont continuer à baisser?

*Do you think the candies will continue to diminish?*

Je ne pense pas.

*I don't think so.*

Le projet de loi va sans doute détruire l'industrie porcine du Manitoba.

*Bill 17 is doubtless going to destroy the hog industry in Manitoba.*

Un producteur à la fois.

*One producer at a time.*

Ils mettront à fin une industrie vibrante.

*They will put an end to a dynamic industry.*

Qui apporte des impacts positifs et communautaires et financières au niveau des familles.

*Which has a positive impact on communities and financially within families.*

Très bien. Voici que le moratoire permanent ne produira pas le résultat dont la province a besoin. Le niveau de phosphate du lac Winnipeg ne changera pas.

*Very well. This permanent ban will not produce the result that the province needs. The phosphate level in Lake Winnipeg will not change.*

Et puis après?

*And then what?*

Ça fait que je vous demande d'abord d'abolir le Projet de loi 17.

*So then I ask you to abolish Bill 17 first.*

Merci.

*Thank you.*

**Mr. Chairperson:** Merci, Monsieur Grenier, and that is the extent of my French. I'm sorry, I took Ukrainian in high school, not French, so.

Just for the record I'm going to allow a little bit more time for these presentations given that we have the need for consecutive interpretation.

I open the floor for questions. I call on Mr. Struthers.

**Hon. Stan Struthers (Minister of Conservation):** Thank you very much, Adrien. I appreciate your advice. Agriculture today and always has been an important part of the Manitoba economy, and clean water has been a very important part of agriculture. To that end the Clean Environment Commission said that our framework wasn't strong enough and we need to move to something stronger.

You've made your views on Bill 17 very clear, so what would you advise me that we would go to that's stronger than what we have now if we don't move towards the moratorium of Bill 17?

**Mr. Adrien Grenier:** Oui. Pour commencer il faut abolir le Projet de loi 17. Il n'y a pas de place pour mettre des amendements dans ça.

*First of all, we need to abolish Bill 17. There's no room to amend this bill.*

Le fermier de porcines a déjà plus de règlements que n'importe quelle autre industrie.

*The hog farmer is already subject to more rules than any other industry.*

Pourquoi qu'on veut en mettre plus?

*Why do they want to add more?*

On remplit des plans de fumier toutes les années.

*We fill out plans for dealing with manure every year.*

Ces choses-la peuvent être peut-être regardées mais il y a déjà des règlements pour les regarder.

*These things can perhaps be looked at, but there are already regulations about looking at them.*

Le fermier à porcines ne met pas de phosphates plus que celui à grains, ou celui à lait, ou celui à boeufs.

*Hog farmers do not contribute to any more phosphate than the grain farmer, dairy farmer, or cattle farmer.*

Ça fait, je ne vois pas où il y a de la place qu'on peut changer, faire des amendements pour changer ça ici. Le fermier est déjà le plus réglementé dans l'Amérique du Nord.

*So I don't see where there is any room for change, to make amendments to change this here. Farmers here are already the most regulated in North America.*

Quoi d'autre qu'on peut faire? Mais seulement ce n'est pas un moratoire qui est la réponse.

*What else can we do? But anyway, the answer is not a moratorium.*

Ça répond à la question?

*Does this answer the question?*

**Mr. Struthers:** Merci.

**Hon. Jon Gerrard (River Heights):** Bonjour, Monsieur Grenier.

*Good Morning, Mr. Grenier.*

**Mr. Grenier:** Bonjour.

**Mr. Gerrard:** Bienvenue ici. Comme les autres fermiers de l'industrie porcine, vous avez fait beaucoup de changements pour adresser les préoccupations sur l'environnement.

*Welcome here. Like other hog farmers, you have made many changes to address environmental concerns.*

**Mr. Adrien Grenier:** Oui. Si je compare à la première génération de mes grands-grands-parents,

*Yes. If I make a comparison with the first generation of my great great-grandparents,*



les vaches allaient à la crique et puis elles chiaient dans la crique.

*the cows would go to the creek and shit in it.*

Ensuite peut-être on a mis des bols d'eau dans les étables, ça fait que le fumier était mis dans un tas et puis après ça on l'étendait sur le jardin.

*Later maybe buckets of water were put in the barns and so the manure was piled up and then spread on the garden.*

Dans le jardin qu'on faisait pousser pour manger.

*In the garden where we grew food to eat.*

Après ça la technologie a avancé, les champs sont plus grands.

*After that technology advanced, the fields became bigger.*

On a de la meilleure machinerie pour incorporer notre fumier.

*We now have better equipment to incorporate the manure.*

On prend des échantillons de terre et puis on peut prendre un échantillon de fumier aussi et puis on les match pour mettre la plus haute valeur pour la meilleure récolte qu'on peut avoir sur le terrain.

*We take soil samples and we can also take manure samples and match them so we have the highest value for the best harvest we can get on the land.*

Ensuite—c'était mes parents qui faisaient ça déjà. Ça fait qu'on n'est pas en arrière ici.

*Then—my parents were already doing this, so we're not backward here.*

Moi aujourd'hui on va mettre du phytase—c'est le nom je pense—dans le manger pour baisser le phosphate.

*Now we add phytase—that's the name I think—to the food to reduce the phosphate.*

J'ai un jeune qui veut aller dans, je ne sais pas le nom, mais ça va être compliqué et puis ça va coûter cher quand il va aller à l'école.

*I have a son who wants to go into, I don't know what the name of it is but it will be complicated and it will be expensive when he goes to school.*

Et ça va être pour utiliser des choses qu'on peut faire avec du phosphate.

*And it will be to use things that you can make with phosphate.*

Mais je ne sais pas tout ça. C'est nouveau pour moi ça. Moi c'est une autre génération.

*But I don't know all that. This is new to me, I am from another generation.*

Mais ce n'est pas le moratoire qu'on a besoin.

*But the moratorium is not what we need.*

Thank you.

**Mr. Eichler:** Thank you, Mr. Grenier, for your presentation. My question for you is pretty straightforward, on the nutrient management regulations that've just been tabled, a number of which have not been implemented yet. Do you feel that they have had an opportunity to see whether or not those regulations will do what they want to do in order to clean up Lake Winnipeg?

**Mr. Adrien Grenier:** Je ne pense pas, parce que comme c'est là ces nouveaux règlements-la ça ne fait pas assez longtemps seulement qu'on s'en sert. Ça fait, comment veux-tu—

*I don't think so because as it is now these new regulations are just too new. We haven't been using them for long enough, so how—*

On va les suivre autant qu'on peut. Et il faut que ça soit aussi efficace qu'on peut. La récolte, il faut qu'elle pousse aussi parce qu'on dépense encore 100 000 \$ sur le phosphate.

*We'll follow them as much as we can, and it also needs to be as efficient as possible. The crops had better grow too because we're spending \$100,000 on phosphate.*

**Mr. Graydon:** Mr. Grenier, my French is worse than the chairperson's. However, you did indicate that you were, if I understood right, possibly fourth generation on that farm.

**Mr. Adrien Grenier:** Moi, je suis la quatrième.

*I am the fourth.*

**Mr. Graydon:** And that you were expecting that your sons are showing an interest and they would be the fifth generation?

**Mr. Adrien Grenier:** Ils ont montré un intérêt, qu'ils voudraient, mais ils parlent aussi d'autre chose.

*They've shown an interest but they're also talking about other things.*

**Mr. Graydon:** In the ensuing years that you've been there, obviously from your presentation the technology has changed dramatically from day one until today.

**Mr. Adrien Grenier:** Juste la génération à moi-même, ça a changé beaucoup.

*Just in my generation it's changed a lot.*

On incorpore le fumier aussi vite qu'on peut. On trouve les meilleures manières pour sauver l'azote et le phosphate. On a tous besoin de ces affaires-là, nous autres.

*We've now found a better and faster way to incorporate the manure as fast as we can. We are finding better ways to treat the nitrogen and the phosphate. We all need these things.*

**Mr. Graydon:** With the technology obviously there has been—a fairly large expense came with that technology.

**Mr. Adrien Grenier:** Oui. Un exemple c'est le couvert qu'on met sur le lagoon.

*Yes. An example is the cover that we put on the lagoon.*

Ça nous donne une option aussi qu'on fait, je ne sais pas, un sauvetage sur l'azote.

*This also gives us an option which we are taking, I don't know, a saving on nitrogen.*

**Mr. Graydon:** With the thought in mind now that the fifth generation would want to take over, there would obviously be expansion.

**Mr. Adrien Grenier:** Oui. Quand j'ai bâti ma première étable j'ai pris en hypothèse ou en idée qu'il y avait une possibilité d'en mettre quatre.

*When I built my first barn I had an hypothesis or an idea that there was a possibility of building four of them.*

Le site peut les accommoder, le terrain est là.

*The site can accommodate them, the land is there.*

Il y a des choses à faire. Il y a du terrain à défricher et puis un peu d'ouvrage mais on va y arriver.

*There are things to do. Land has to be cleared and there's some work to do but we'll get there.*

Il a fallu aller en cour juste pour avoir le droit de se faire écouter au conseil.

*We had to go to court just to have the right to be heard at the council.*

Ce n'était pas plaisant.

*It wasn't pleasant.*

Et puis aujourd'hui je ne sais pas ce qui arriverait. Et c'est rendu que la mentalité, c'est que si c'est du porc, ce n'est pas bon.

*I don't know what would happen today. It's gotten so the mentality is that if it's pigs, it's not good.*

Nous autres, on vit d'une journée à l'autre.

*We live from day to day.*

On ne sait pas si le gouvernement vas bannir ça, ça fait que s'il fait ça il y a des pancartes, 12 par 20, que no hog factories in the R.M. Il en a treize de même.

*We don't know if the government will decide to ban it. If they do, there are signs, 12 by 20, that say, no hog factories in the RM. There are 13 like that.*

Ce n'est pas une industrie qu'on pense que c'est si malfaisant que ça ici. Nous autres on vit, on boit l'eau du même puits, ici là.

*We don't think it's such a bad industry as that here. We too live, we drink water from the same well here.*

**Mr. Chairperson:** We are already at 13 minutes into Q and A, so I'll allow one more question to Mr. Grenier.

**Mr. Graydon:** Then can you see, Mr. Grenier, your business or the hog industry investing in any technology to go forward if there is a moratorium?

**Mr. Adrien Grenier:** Non. Comme que c'est là c'est tout négatif. Moi je ne suis pas prêt à mettre le petit peu d'argent que j'ai sauvé dans mon petit peu de vie que j'ai fait.

*No. As it is now it's all negative. I'm not about to put the little money that I have saved into the little living I've made.*

**Mr. Adrien Grenier:** Si on a pas le support de la province, right-to-farm legislation.

*If we don't have support from the Province, right-to-farm legislation.*

On travaille pour se faire dire tous les jours qu'on détruit tout, et puis ce n'est pas vrai ça.

*We're working just to be told daily that we're destroying everything and that is not true.*

Si vous marchiez une semaine dans nos bottines, là.

*If you walked a week in our shoes.*

Et puis savoir qu'est-ce que c'est de mener un tanker et qu'est-ce que c'est un petit spill de cinq gallons ou bien donc.

*You'd find out what it is to drive a tanker and you'd know what a little five-gallon spill is, or—.*

Nous autres, quand on fait ça il faut le faire toute la journée et ça continue toute la nuit et on va le faire dans le moins de temps possible et endommager le moins possible.

*When we do this we have to do it all day and it continues all night and we do it as fast as we can and do the least possible damage.*

Et après ça on va le travailler, et si on a un tracteur qui fait rien le cultivateur va partir et va l'enterrer. On travaille pour avoir la meilleure production qu'on peut.

*And after that we go and work it, and if there's a tractor that does nothing the cultivator will go and bury it. We're working to have the best production we can.*

**Mr. Chairperson:** Okay, I think we have to move on, so I thank you for your presentation, sir.

**Mr. Adrien Grenier:** Merci.

**Mr. Chairperson:** I call Mr. Paul Grenier. Good morning, Mr. Grenier, do you have any written documents for the committee? You do, I see, thank you. You may begin.

### ***Bilingual presentation***

**Mr. Paul Grenier (Private Citizen):** Bonjour. Mon nom est Paul Grenier. J'ai 17 ans.

*Good morning. My name is Paul Grenier. I am 17 years old.*

Vous vous demandez probablement ce qu'un jeune de 17 ans de la campagne vient faire dans la grosse ville.

*You're probably wondering what a young man of 17 from the country is doing in the big city.*

J'ai décidé que je devais me rendre ici aujourd'hui afin de faire ma part pour protéger le futur de cette province.

*I decided that I should come here today to do my part to protect the future of this province.*

Tout un défi pour quelqu'un qui finit son secondaire cette année.

*That is a real challenge for someone who is finishing high school this year.*

Comme jeune Manitobain intéressé à faire ma vie dans le domaine agricole, je dois regarder à mon futur à long terme.

*As a young Manitoban interested in making my life in the agricultural sector I have to look at my long-term future.*

Je dois faire ceci. Au contraire, le parti politique au pouvoir ne regarde que quatre années à la fois, c'est-à-dire, jusqu'à la prochaine élection.

*I must do this. In contrast, the political party in power only looks at four years at a time, that is until the next election.*

Après tout, il semble très important pour ce parti de s'assurer un autre terme.

*After all it seems very important for this party to make sure it has another term.*

Comme jeune de la campagne, je suis habitué de faire le trajet jusqu'à Winnipeg, que ce soit pour des rendez-vous, participer à différents organismes tel que le Parlement-Jeunesse, des activités scolaires ou même rendre visite à des parents et amis.

*As a youth from the country, I am used to making the trip to Winnipeg, whether it be for appointments or to participate in different organizations such as Youth Parliament, school activities or simply to visit family and friends.*

Au contraire, les jeunes de Winnipeg ne connaissent pas cette situation.

*On the other hand, young people in Winnipeg are not familiar with this situation.*

Il y a une plus grande chance que je fasse le trajet d'une heure et demie à Winnipeg que des jeunes de la ville fassent l'inverse.

*It is more likely that I will drive the hour and a half to Winnipeg than it is that young people from Winnipeg will do the reverse.*

Ces trajets m'ont permis de découvrir beaucoup de différences entre l'urbain et le rural.

*Those trips have enabled me to discover many differences between urban and rural areas.*

Par exemple, pour un jeune de la campagne il est essentiel d'obtenir un permis de conduire puisque nous ne profitons pas d'un système de transport publique.

*For example, for a youth from a rural area it is essential to obtain a driver's licence since we do not have a public transportation system.*

Pour les jeunes de la ville qui ont rarement de grandes distances à parcourir, un permis est un privilège.

*For young people from the city, who rarely have long distances to drive, having a driver's licence is a privilege.*

Pour les jeunes de la campagne, c'est une nécessité.

*For young people in the country it is a necessity.*

En plus, j'ai remarqué que la majorité des jeunes de la ville se promènent avec leur téléphone cellulaire.

*I've also noticed that the majority of young people in the city carry around a cell phone.*

Dans la région rurale d'où je viens, nous n'avons même pas de réception.

*In the rural area where I come from we don't even have reception.*

Et nous ne sommes même pas considérés pour le service d'Internet à haute vitesse.

*And we are not even considered for high-speed Internet.*

Mais, malgré ces lacunes je préfère encore la vie dans une région rurale.

*But in spite of these gaps I still prefer life in a rural area.*

Pour moi, la découverte la plus flagrante que j'ai faite est que les gens des régions urbaines sont en majorité ignorants de comment les choses se passent en région rurale.

*The most significant thing I have discovered is that the majority of people from urban areas are unaware of how things work in rural areas.*

Surtout au sujet des entreprises agricoles.

*In particular with regard to agricultural operations.*

En majorité, ils ont l'image qui est trop souvent propagée que les fermiers sont des exploiters de la

nature qui font tout pour l'argent en détruisant l'environnement. Moi, je sais que cette image est complètement fausse.

*The majority of them have the image that is too often propagated that farmers are exploiting nature and that they do everything for money while destroying the environment. I know that this image is completely false.*

Pendant les dernières années j'ai constaté que même dans les régions qui sont fortes en agriculture, les élèves tombent victimes de la propagande et adoptent cette mentalité de fermier exploitateur sans limites.

*In the last few years I have noticed that even in areas where agriculture is strong, students become victims of propaganda and adopt this mentality that farmers are exploiters without limits.*

Ce qui est encore plus triste c'est que plusieurs des jeunes qui font partie d'une entreprise agricole ont peur de parler en défense de l'agriculture et certains ont même honte.

*What is even sadder is that many young people who are part of a farm operation are afraid to speak in defense of agriculture and some are even ashamed of it.*

Ceci se passe dans une école rurale où plusieurs étudiants travaillent sur les entreprises agricoles ou les commerces qui dépendent de l'agriculture.

*This is happening in a rural school where many students are working on farm operations, or for businesses that depend on agriculture.*

Cette dernière année j'ai eu beaucoup de difficulté à parler ouvertement de l'agriculture dans les couloirs de l'école.

*In the past year I've had a lot of difficulty talking openly about agriculture in the hallways of my school.*

Les médias ont fait un travail tel que le fermier a l'air comme un diable.

*The media has done such a job that the farmer now looks like a devil.*

Moi je représente la cinquième génération de ma famille à vivre dans ma petite communauté.

*I represent the fifth generation of my family to live in our little community.*

L'entreprise de notre famille s'est diversifiée.

*Our family's farm operation has diversified.*

Pendant plusieurs années nous pouvions voir une ferme sur chaque quart de section.

*For several years we could see one farm on each quarter section.*

À présent nous avons des entreprises à vaches laitières, vaches à boeuf, bisons, porcs, cerfs, moutons.

*At the present time we have several operations, we've got dairy cows, beef cows, bison, hogs, deer and sheep.*

Moins nombreuses mais plus grandes.

*Not as numerous but larger.*

Ceci offre des possibilités d'emploi au gens de la région, ce qui permet à des jeunes familles de s'établir dans le coin.

*This offers the possibility of employment to people in the region, which allows young families to settle in the area.*

Je dois ajouter que les gens qui vivent dans ma communauté qui ne travaillent pas sur les fermes doivent se déplacer aux prochains villages, le plus proche étant à 50 km, et allant jusqu'à Winnipeg à 150 km d'ici.

*I have to add that the people who live in my community who do not work on farms have to drive to the neighbourhood towns to work, the nearest being 50 km, and some go all the way to Winnipeg which is 150 km away.*

L'autre option est de déménager hors de la province.

*The other option is to move out of the province.*

Et qui est souvent pratiquée.

*Which is very often taken.*

Les terres d'ici sont cultivées depuis au-delà de 100 ans.

*The land there has been cultivated for over 100 years.*

Elles produisent encore de bonnes récoltes et les niveaux de nutriments sont encore très bon.

*It still produces very good crops and the nutrient levels are still very good.*

Oui, nous étendons de l'engrais naturel sur nos terres.

*Yes, we spread natural fertilizer on our land.*

Avec les tests du sol et du purin et en considération du type de sol, nous étendons l'engrais pour qu'il soit effectif, et pas plus.

*Using soil sample testing and liquid manure testing and taking the type of soil into consideration, we spread the fertilizer so that it is effective and no more than that.*

Après tout, nous sommes intéressés à continuer de travailler la terre pour les années à venir.

*After all, we are interested in continuing to work the land in the years to come.*

Notre but est de diminuer le montant d'engrais chimique sur lequel nous devons encore dépendre pour remplacer les nutriments utilisés par les récoltes.

*Our objective is to reduce the amount of chemical fertilizer that we still must depend on to replace the nutrients that are used by the crops.*

Le fait que ma famille prend soin du terrain et de l'environnement en général m'indique qu'il y a un futur pour moi dans le domaine de l'agriculture.

*The fact that my family is taking care of the land and of the environment in general tells me that there is a future for me in the field of agriculture.*

Après toutes ces années, la ferme sur laquelle nous vivons évolue encore.

*After all these years the farm on which we live continues to evolve.*

Mon frère détient un diplôme en agriculture et travaille directement dans l'industrie.

*My brother has a degree in agriculture and works directly in the industry.*

Pour moi-même, je planifie de suivre des études en bio-systems engineering à l'Université du Manitoba.

*As for myself I plan to study bio-systems engineering at the University of Manitoba.*

Je crois que c'est la bonne façon de faire ma part dans le futur de l'agriculture.

*I think it is a good way for me to do my part for the future of agriculture.*

J'ai lu le rapport de la Commission de protection de l'environnement.

*I have read the report of the Clean Environment Commission.*

Nulle part dans le rapport est-ce que c'est indiqué qu'un moratoire devrait être imposé.

*Nowhere in the report does it say that a moratorium should be imposed.*

Le gouvernement agit contrairement à ce que le rapport a recommandé. Pour quelles raisons?

*The government is acting contrary to what the report has recommended. For what reasons?*

Je crois que le gouvernement devrait passer plus de temps et d'effort sur l'éducation.

*I think the government should spend more time and effort on education.*

Les gens ont besoin de réaliser d'où vient leur nourriture.

*People need to understand where their food comes from.*

Nos politiciens doivent immédiatement cesser d'abaisser les industries agricoles, surtout l'industrie porcine.

*Our politicians need immediately to stop putting down agricultural industries, in particular the hog industry.*

L'industrie porcine est l'industrie la plus réglementée et peut-être que les autres industries devraient montrer une telle initiative avant que le gouvernement impose son moratoire sur l'industrie porcine.

*The hog industry is the most regulated and maybe the other industries should now show such initiative before the government imposes its moratorium on the hog industry.*

Le temps est venu où chaque industrie ainsi que les villes doivent prendre la responsabilité pour leurs actions, au même niveau que l'industrie porcine.

*The time has come for each industry as well as urban areas to take responsibility for their actions at the same level as the hog industry.*

Si vous frappez, frappez avec égalité.

*If you're going to strike, strike with equality.*

Merci pour votre temps.

*Thank you for your time.*

**Mr. Chairperson:** Thank you, Mr. Grenier. I open the floor to questions.

**Mr. Gerrard:** Bonjour, Monsieur Grenier. C'est très triste quand c'est difficile de parler d'activités agricoles dans les couloirs de l'école. Il faut faire des changements certainement.

*Thank you, Mr. Grenier. It's very sad when it's difficult to talk about agriculture in the hallways at school. Certainly changes need to be made.*

Je voudrais vous demander, vous êtes intéressé par le bio-systems engineering et est-ce parce qu'il y a des machineries, des autres choses qui sont très importantes pour améliorer l'industrie porcine et il y a de grands changements dans cette direction?

*I would like to ask you, you are interested in bio-systems engineering and, is it because there is machinery and other things that are very important to improve the hog industry and there are many changes being made in that direction?*

Et cette technologie est importante pour protéger l'environnement aussi?

*And this technology is important to protect the environment as well?*

**Mr. Grenier:** Oui, je me lance bien dans ce domaine-là et je me lance puisque c'est un mélange de mes passions.

*Yes, I'm going into this area because it's a mixture of things that I am passionate about.*

Et oui, on va en avoir besoin dans le futur, surtout si le gouvernement continue à vouloir dire que l'agriculture devrait être plus vert, comme on dit.

*And, yes, we will need this in the future, particularly if the government continues saying that agriculture needs to be greener, as they say.*

**Mr. Eichler:** Thank you, Paul, for your presentation. I want to come to the education portion of your presentation. What do you see our role as government leaders in regards to the education of where the food comes from and how it is produced?

**Mr. Grenier:** Je connais du monde qui viennent de la ville et ils pensent qu'un oeuf, ça vient d'une usine.

*I know people who come from the city and they think that an egg comes from a factory.*

Ou du lait, que ça vient aussi d'une usine et non d'une vache.

*Or milk, that it also comes from a factory, not a cow.*

Alors, je trouve que le gouvernement devrait juste faire un effort pour montrer, c'est quoi le processus agricole.

*So I think the government should just make an effort to show what the agricultural process is.*

**Mr. Graydon:** Thank you, Mr. Chairperson, and thank you, Paul, for your presentation today. It's nice to see young people in our communities step forward as you have. Would you say that agriculture today is still a family farm as it was when your ancestors came here and ran it as a sustainable business, as your grandfather and father have done to feed and educate their families?

**Mr. Grenier:** Je dis que oui, ça peut être encore une, les fermes peuvent être encore familiales mais ce qu'il faut faire, c'est encourager les générations futures de continuer.

*I say yes, it can still be one, farms can still be family operations but future generations must be encouraged to continue.*

Avec un moratoire c'est décourageant, nous ne pouvons plus grandir. L'industrie est gelée.

*With a moratorium it's discouraging, we cannot increase in size. The industry is frozen.*

C'est décourageant puisqu'on ne peut rien faire.

*It's discouraging because we can't do anything.*

**Mr. Chairperson:** Seeing no further questions, I thank you for your presentation. I call Mr. Marcel Hacault. I see you have some written materials for us.

### **Bilingual presentation**

**Mr. Marcel Hacault (Private Citizen):** Yes, I do.

**Mr. Chairperson:** You may proceed, sir.

**Mr. Hacault:** Messieurs, Mesdames, députés du comité permanent de l'Assemblée législative,

*Ladies and gentleman, members of the standing committee of the Legislative Assembly,*

j'ai délibéré si je devrais présenter aujourd'hui, mais je suis ici vraiment pour mes jeunes.

*I wondered whether I should present today, but I'm really here for my children.*

Je me présente de nouveau, mon nom est Marcel Hacault. J'ai passé ma jeunesse sur une ferme avec des vaches, des animaux à boeuf, et parfois quelques cochons vers Mariapolis.

*Let me introduce myself again. My name is Marcel Hacault. I spent my youth on a farm where we had cows, beef cattle and sometimes a few hogs near Mariapolis.*

Nous avons de grandes cultures de lin, canola, blé et de l'orge. Nous étions neuf dans famille.

*We had large crops of flax, Canola, wheat and barley. We were a family of nine.*

Avec l'encouragement de mon père j'ai poursuivi des études et j'ai choisi de compléter mon diplôme universitaire en agriculture.

*With encouragement from my father I studied and decided to get a university degree in agriculture.*

Ensuite, bien sûr, je voulais faire la ferme.

*Then of course I wanted to farm.*

Hélas, mon père n'était pas prêt à prendre sa retraite, et j'ai cherché à m'acheter une ferme.

*Unfortunately my father was not ready to retire so I looked for a farm to buy.*

Vu que mon épouse est d'origine Mennonite et moi Francophone nous avons cherché une ferme dans la municipalité de Hanover, où les deux cultures se trouvent.

*Since my wife comes from a Mennonite background and I am Francophone we looked for a farm in the municipality of Hanover where both cultures are to be found.*

La ferme que j'ai acheté était une porcherie, 100 truies naissant-finissant.

*The farm I bought was a pig farm with 100 farrow-to-finish sows.*

La ferme était située sur 46,8 acres, ce qui m'inquiétait un peu.

*The farm was located on 48.6 acres, which was a little worrisome,*

à cause d'un manque de superficie pour répandre le lisier.

*because of the lack of surface to spread the slurry.*

mais je n'avais pas les moyens d'acheter plus de terre, et il me semblait que les voisins en avait beaucoup.

*But I could not afford more land and it seemed to me that the neighbours had a lot.*

Avec cette petite ferme nous avons eu trois enfants et une vie très confortable.

*On this little farm we had three children and lived very comfortably.*

A la fin de vingt ans de production j'ai dû décider mon avenir dans l'industrie porcine.

*After 20 years of production I had to make a decision about my future in the hog industry.*

En 2003 j'ai exploré mes options.

*In 2003 I explored my options.*

Le secteur bancaire m'encourageait de bâtir grand et de m'intégrer avec d'autres producteurs.

*The banking sector encouraged me to build on a large scale and to join with other producers.*

La municipalité m'a dit que je pouvais construire sur mon site mais il faudrait que je sois conforme aux normes provinciales.

*The municipality told me that I could build on my site, but that I would have to comply with the provincial standards.*

Mes options étaient très limitées, alors y'ai décidé de vider mes étables.

*My options were very limited, so I decided to empty my barns.*

De nouveau, la raison que je suis ici c'est parce que mes jeunes n'ont pas décidé encore s'ils veulent continuer en agriculture.

*Once again, the reason I am here is that my children still haven't decided if they want to continue in the agricultural sector.*

Et puis je ne pourrais pas me pardonner si je ne m'étais pas présenté ici pour leur garder l'industrie porcine comme une option agricole.

*And, I couldn't forgive myself if I hadn't come here today to maintain the hog industry for them as an agricultural option.*

Entre-temps des changements de la part du gouvernement sont mis en place.

*In the meantime, changes were being implemented by the government.*

Si je veux continuer en production il faudrait que je construise une citerne de lisier que me permettrait d'être conforme à la norme qui interdit l'épandage de lisier en hiver.

*If I want to continue production I would have to build a slurry tank in order to comply with the requirements that prohibit the spreading of slurry in the winter.*

J'avais aussi besoin d'une autorisation de la municipalité pour modifier la zone de séparation.

*I also needed authorization from the municipality to modify the separation zone.*

Alors, j'étais un peu déprimé, avec le prix du porc dernièrement et la multitude de réglementation il serait très difficile de revenir en production. Mais si je voulais, je pourrais.

*So I was a little depressed, with the price of pork recently, and the many regulations, it would be very hard to go back into production, but if I wanted to I could.*

Arrive la Loi modifiant la Loi sur l'environnement.

*Then came the Environment Amendment Act.*

En préparation j'ai été voir le site web pour confirmer la mission, la vision, les priorités et les valeurs énoncées par le gouvernement.

*In preparation I went to see the Web site to confirm the mission, the vision, the priorities and the values set out by the government.*

Cette loi proposée contredit votre vision.

*This proposed law contradicts your vision.*

Montrez-moi l'évidence de travailler ensemble; et puis vous ne favorisez pas le développement avec la communauté.

*Show me the evidence of working together; and you're not facilitating development with the community.*

Avec votre mission, de nouveau, vous énoncez travailler ensemble.

*With your mission, once again, you talk about working together.*

Et puis vos valeurs:

*And your values:*

L'industrie agroalimentaire du Manitoba est fondée sur les exploitations agricoles familiales.

*The agri-food industry in Manitoba is based on family farms.*



Et puis vous croyez dans les régions rurales, les producteurs agricoles et leurs jeunes.

*And you believe in rural regions, agricultural producers and their young people.*

Alors je ne vois pas que vous êtes même conformes à vos énoncés.

*So I do not see that you even conform to your statements.*

Quand je pense à tout l'argent que l'industrie porcine a investi dans la recherche pour assurer la production durable,

*When I think of all the money the pork industry has invested in research to ensure sustainable production,*

et l'argent et le temps investis par la municipalité de Hanover à planifier le développement de toute la production animale, je suis stupéfait.

*and the money and time invested by the Rural Municipality of Hanover to plan for the development of livestock production, I am stunned.*

Quand je pense à l'importance de la base économique de la production porcine et animale à la province, de nouveau je suis stupéfait.

*When I think of the importance of livestock and pork production for the provincial economy, I am again stunned.*

Quand je compare votre proposition à vos énoncés et à vos valeurs, qu'est qui se passe?

*When I compare your proposal to your statements and your values, what is happening?*

Quand je pense à l'impact que la modification va avoir sur l'environnement je me secoue la tête.

*When I think of the impact that this is going to have on the environment, I shake my head.*

Néanmoins je reconnais que le ministre doit croire que sa proposition mérite d'être considérée.

*Nevertheless, I recognize that the minister must believe his proposal to be worth considering.*

Comme Manitobain je vous décrit mon impact :

*I will describe the impact on me as a Manitoban:*

Pas de chance à continuer dans la production de porcs chez moi, même si je peux faire preuve que je peux être conforme aux nouvelles normes.

*No possibility of pursuing hog production on my farm, even if I can prove that I can comply with the new rules.*

Pas d'options pour mes jeunes à continuer dans l'industrie sans se déplacer.

*No option for my children to continue in the industry without moving away.*

J'ai des étables qui sont vides, et je ne peux pas les remettre en production.

*My barns are empty and I can't put them back into production.*

Et puis, je sens que je suis taxé sur une entreprise qui m'a été exproprié par la province.

*And I feel I'm being taxed on a business that has been taken away from me by the Province.*

Ce que je propose :

Ma solution préférée c'est de jeter la Loi modifiant la Loi sur l'environnement dans la poubelle.

*What I propose:*

*My preferred solution is that the Environment Amendment Act be thrown in the garbage can.*

Encore mieux, faites application pour un permis d'épandage, et répandez-la d'une façon durable.

*Better yet, apply for a spreading permit and then spread it in a sustainable manner.*

Si vous avancez,

*If you go forward,*

Je trouve que je suis victime d'une action d'expropriation,

*I think that I am the victim of an expropriation action.*

Si on lit la définition ça dit, retirer le droit de propriétaire

*If you read the definition it says, to take away the right of ownership*

par la province et je devrais avoir accès à des frais payables pour l'expropriation de mes étables.

*by the Province and I should be eligible to receive compensation for the expropriation of my barns.*

Comme j'ai déjà soumis au ministre des Finances, je demande un paiement du gouvernement de la valeur résiduelle de mes étables,

*As I previously submitted to the Minister of Finance, I request payment from the government for the residual value of my barns,*

tel qu'indiqué sur mes taxes municipales, et les frais de démolition.

*as indicated on my municipal tax assessment, and the demolition expenses.*

Et puis la facture est soumise avec ma présentation.

*And the invoice is submitted with my presentation.*

Je vous prie d'agréer, députés du comité permanent de l'Assemblée législative du Manitoba, l'expression de ma plus haute considération.

*Members of the standing committee of the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba, I remain yours truly.*

**Mr. Chairperson:** Thank you, Mr. Hacault. Questions.

**Mr. Struthers:** Salut, Marcel. It's good to see you again.

I want to express a little bit of frustration, because yesterday we had some presenters who farm in Hanover and, in conversation with those farmers, was told that, in effect, there is a moratorium in Hanover already, and that springs from regulations that were put in place in November of '06 and decisions made at the RM level a number of years ago to put a moratorium of their own in place. So, in effect, even before this Bill 17 ever came forward there was already a moratorium in your RM already, or is that not correct?

**Mr. Hacault:** Tout ce que je peux dire, c'est dans l'année 2003

*All I can say is that in 2003*

en parlant avec la municipalité

*while talking to the municipality*

j'étais dans une des dernières zones où ils auraient accepté une expansion.

*I was in one of the last zones where they would have accepted expansion.*

**Mr. Struthers:** Just in a tongue-and-cheek kind of way then, who would you be asking for money in expropriation?

**Mr. Hacault:** Je ne suis pas avocat, mon frère est avocat.

*I am not a lawyer, my brother is a lawyer.*

L'action de la loi

*The effect of the law*

c'est de retirer mes droits de propriété avec ma terre.

*is to remove my property rights with my land.*

Alors, dans d'autres cas d'expropriation avec les inondations et cetera, la province se disait responsable pour toute la province.

*So, in other cases of expropriation with flooding, et cetera, the Province stated it was responsible for all of the province.*

Alors, ils ont pris charge, une position de leadership, et puis ils ont avancé.

*So they took charge, took a leadership position, and then they went forward.*

Vous semblez vouloir prendre une position de leadership de nouveau, vous prenez charge,

*You seem to want to take a leadership position again, you take charge,*

Alors ça suit que vous autres vous seriez intéressés.

*So it follows that you would be interested.*

**Mr. Gerrard:** Merci, Monsieur Hacault, Marcel. C'est très difficile, la situation que vous avez avec l'expropriation de cette façon. Je voudrais parler un moment de la situation de l'épandage du fumier.

*Thank you, Mr. Hacault, Marcel. It is a very difficult situation you have with expropriation this way. I would like to talk for a moment about the situation concerning the spreading of manure.*

Nous sommes d'accord qu'il faut avoir un changement, arrêter de répandre pendant l'hiver.

*We are in agreement that there has to be a change, a stop to spreading in the winter.*

Mais nous pensons que c'est très important qu'il y ait de l'aide financière du gouvernement pour faire la transition, comme en Ontario par exemple.

*But we think it is very important that there be financial help from the government to make the transition, as in Ontario for example.*

Il me semble que c'est important que le gouvernement travaille avec les gens comme vous qui sont fermiers pour faire des changements qui

sont importants pour tous et pour l'environnement, au lieu de faire des moratoires comme fait cette loi.

*It seems to me that it's important that the government work with farmers like you to make changes that are important for all and for the environment, instead of imposing moratoriums as this law does.*

Et je voudrais avoir vos commentaires.

*And I would like your comments.*

**Mr. Hacault:** Exactement, je suis d'accord et puis même dans votre vision énoncé ça dit travailler avec la communauté, travailler avec le secteur agricole.

*Exactly, I agree, and even in your vision statement it says work with the community, work with the agricultural sector.*

Et puis, il me semble qu'il y a parmi vous qui savez que j'étais le président du conseil porc.

*And, it seems to me that some of you know that I am the past president of the Pork Council.*

Et puis on travaillait beaucoup avec le gouvernement pour trouver des solutions et puis je vous encourage à continuer avec ça.

*And we worked a lot with the government to find solutions and I encourage you to continue with that.*

Et puis encore plus, pour inciter les fermiers à avancer et faire de l'avancement, l'argent aide toujours.

*And still more to encourage farmers to go forward and progress, money always helps.*

**Mr. Eichler:** Thank you for your presentation. I have a quick question. The nutrient management regulations that were just brought in, a number of them haven't been implemented yet, do you feel they've had an opportunity to see if they have, in fact, done their intentions of what they were expected to do? If so, is Bill 17 premature at this time?

**Mr. Hacault:** Je suis d'accord. Je ne pense pas qu'on a vu l'impact environnemental des nouveaux règlements encore.

*I agree. I don't think we have seen the environmental impact of the new regulations yet.*

Et puis je pourrais même dire que peut-être qu'on ne va pas voir l'impact parce que les nouveaux règlements visent l'agriculture et puis je pense que le problème n'est pas avec l'agriculture mais est ailleurs.

*And I could also even say that perhaps we will not see the impact because the new regulations are targeting agriculture and I don't think that agriculture is the problem, it's elsewhere.*

**Mr. Graydon:** Because of your respect and concerns for agriculture, I understand how you would see the devaluation of your property and others in different municipalities where there was opportunity prior to the moratorium.

Would you compare the moratorium to a genocide against agriculture?

**Mr. Hacault:** Je me servirais pas du mot génocide, *I wouldn't use the word genocide,*

mais je me servirais du mot visé,

*but I would use the word targeted,*

et puis, peut-être même discriminatoire

*and maybe even discriminatory*

envers le secteur agricole et les régions rurales et les fermes familiales.

*towards the agricultural sector, rural areas and family farms.*

**Mr. Chairperson:** Seeing no further questions, I thank you for your presentation, Mr. Hacault.

**Mr. Hacault:** Merci bien.

*Thank you very much.*

### Committee Substitution

**Mr. Chairperson:** I have a substitution to make, the honourable Ron Lemieux in for the honourable Jim Rondeau.

\* \* \*

**Mr. Eichler:** Mr. Chairperson, before we call the next presenter, we agreed by leave to hear presenter No. 260. It's his only opportunity to come. We have more presenters of which we have time. I would ask leave of the committee that those presenters that came first be heard first rather than going through each one calling out their name. I know the clerks at the back have had an opportunity to have a number of those people come forward. That way it's a fair process to get through as many as we possibly can, rather than go through the name-calling and at least those that came first would have an opportunity to be heard first.

**Mr. Chairperson:** Mr. Eichler has spoken. Anybody else have any commentary on what he's suggested? *[interjection]* He's sought leave.

**Mr. Struthers:** I think that would be agreeable for the time between now and 12 noon. I think, then, we need to meet and discuss how we move forward from there.

**Mr. Graydon:** I just want clarification that the presentations that were in French are going to be recorded in the *Hansard*, the written presentations as well as the—and I agree with what Ralph and Stan both said.

**Mr. Chairperson:** All right. One moment. Before I rule, or whatever, on your request for leave here, I do have to put it to the crowd that, while we have translation services here, is there anyone else in the room who would like to make a presentation in French?

Seeing none, is the committee agreeable to letting our translators leave at this point? *[Agreed]*

I thank you for your assistance this morning.

Now, in regard to Mr. Eichler's request for leave, we will call the presenter, No. 260, Mr. George Camara, first, and then the Clerk's Assistant will go to the back. We do have a list here that we may proceed with. I am somewhat loathe to leave the practice that I have been practising to date; following the list in a linear manner, but since we only have 40 minutes or so here left in this session, I would consider derivating from that path just for the remainder of the committee meeting this morning. Is that agreeable? *[Agreed]*

So, on that note, I call Mr. George Camara to the microphone. He's No. 260. Mr. Camara, do you have any written materials for the committee?

**Mr. George Camara (Camara Enterprises):** It'll be an oral presentation today.

**Mr. Chairperson:** Okay, oral presentation. You may proceed.

**Mr. Camara:** First of all, thank you very much to the committee. I am actually heading over to the airport right after this presentation and will be gone for the rest of the week. So, again, thank you for allowing me to present.

I live here in the city of Winnipeg. I grew up in the city of Winnipeg, and I had absolutely no idea

what farming meant to not only the city, to the province, but to the country and to the world as a whole. Five years ago, I actually changed my career path and went into agriculture. I deal in the feed industry assisting with feed ingredients to producers, feed mills right throughout North America. Last year, I started my own company, Camara Enterprises. The pig industry accounts for approximately 90 percent of my total income as a corporation. When I look at the presentation I'm going to do today, it's going to be a little bit economically and a little bit environmentally.

The pig industry has been growing at an exponential rate throughout North America over the last few years. If I look at the state of Iowa, which is the largest producing state in North America, producing over 26 million pigs per year—Manitoba produces just over eight million pigs per year—Iowa's demographics for square miles or square kilometres is one-quarter the size of Manitoba, and yet they produce three times the amount of pigs as Manitoba does. When I look at that overall, the quality of the water, everything that's happening, it is working for them.

I look at the producers here, in Manitoba. They are probably some of the best producers in North America when it comes to dealing with feed, the livestock, the environment overall. I do a lot of travelling and I see it right throughout North America. I would say the Manitoba producers are some of the best producers as far as taking care of all the previously stated items that I mentioned.

When I look at the green algae, what has been the whole conversation over Lake Manitoba, green algae has been around for thousands of years. Thousands of years it's been around. B.C., which is considered some of the pristine waters in North America, has green algae. They are probably one of the least pig-producing provinces in the country.

So the question remains: Is a moratorium on pig production in Manitoba going to secure the reduction in the phosphorus levels in Lake Manitoba and reduce the green algae? That is currently the issue that we have on the table, not necessarily the moratorium in reducing the pig numbers in Manitoba.

When I look at—sorry, I just lost my train of thought there for a second. When we look at everything overall, pig production economically is a huge benefit to the province of Manitoba and to the city of Winnipeg. I believe that we need to seriously

look at Bill 17 and maybe make amendments to that bill. A moratorium is not the way to go.

The province of Québec had a moratorium in place starting in 2001. They lifted their moratorium on pig production and new facilities in 2005. Why are we as a province, three years later, looking at putting a moratorium in place when essentially that moratorium was not effective for what they wanted to accomplish? With that I will close.

**Mr. Chairperson:** Thank you, Mr. Camara. Questions?

**Mr. Eichler:** Thank you for your presentation, George. I do want to come back to what you talked about with the Québec moratorium. In your travels and experience, what did you see happen to the industry in Québec as a result of the moratorium?

**Mr. Camara:** Overall, the industry in Québec, since the moratorium was in place, the numbers did drop in Québec. Back in 2005 when it was lifted, we saw the inventories of pigs increase. The last few years pig production has been very profitable for numerous farmers, feed mills and many organizations right throughout the province of Québec, and it will continue to be so moving forward. The moratorium assisted them and allowed them to grow the business and to continue on, feeding Canada and feeding the world.

**Mr. Chairperson:** Seeing no further questions, Mr. Camara, I thank you for your presentation.

**Mr. Camara:** Once again, thank you very much for allowing me to speak.

**Mr. Chairperson:** Okay, Rick has gone to the back of the room and we do have some identifiable order for people who came this morning. So on that basis, I will call presenter No. 104, Mr. Van Schepdael. Joe Van Schepdael.

Mr. Van Schepdael, do you have any written materials for the committee?

**Mr. Joe Van Schepdael (Van Schepdael Farms):** Yes, I did, Mr. Chairman.

**Mr. Chairperson:** You do? Okay. The Clerk will distribute them. You may begin.

**Mr. Van Schepdael:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman; thank you, ladies and gentlemen.

I will start to give you a little bit of history of how I came. By the way, I moved to Canada as an

immigrant in 1953. I do have an accent but I do speak three languages. I have no university degree but all my children have. So that gives you an idea where I come from. I hope you do understand me clearly.

We have eight grandchildren and my sons are really involved in agriculture and in the hog production. My second son has his diploma degree. My oldest son has his degree in agriculture, so has his wife, also, in plant pathology; in other words, they are all very educated. I'm the only one with no degree. What I do, I'm a farmer and I think I did fairly well in Canada and in Manitoba, which is a beautiful province.

My family and I have been in hog farming for 42 years along with grain and oilseed farming. We have plenty of land to utilize the manure of our hogs and replace the nutrients that the crops remove. Additional fertilizer is also used.

Every year, soil and manure tests are taken and used according to recommended requirements and rotation of crops as needed. Manure is custom applied and injected into the soil, not spread on top of the land. This has been our practice for the last 18 years, thus preventing run-off and using all nutrients injected. I believe this is the proper way to utilize and extract the valuable nutrients such as phosphorus and nitrogen. The hog farmers I know in my area and wider out, including colonies, use these up-to-date and preferred practices.

\* (11:30)

Some time ago, I phoned and talked with Mr. Dwight Williamson, director of water sciences, and asked what the phosphorus and nitrogen content was for the municipal lagoons in Manitoba. He said he did not know. He suggested though, and I am not totally accurate on this, that there was approximately 400 municipal lagoons in Manitoba at that time. We are all aware that municipal and city sewage is regularly released and finds its way into our lakes. I suggest that all municipal and city sewage analysis be published on the Internet and also how many million gallons or hectolitres are released. It would be a great education for the general public and would help to understand what is really happening.

When citizens elect their government representatives, they expect good leadership, integrity, honesty, and to be fair and reasonable to all citizens. What is the reason that a group of hard-working hog farmers are singled out since we are the

most regulated and inspected in agriculture? Why not all farmers?

This bill in its present form will destroy many small and family farms. It will be impossible to improve or expand. It is my personal opinion that the hog producers, compared to other livestock farmers, are regulated to very high standards, and I don't want to knock my fellow farmers whatever they do, but we sure, in the past, have been very careful not to do that and it's not my intention—I'm sure they have good intention and try to do a proper job.

A moratorium as proposed is absolutely not needed. If government wants to destroy small and family farms, colonies, et cetera, which are family farms, then bring in Bill 17. If this government truly wants to clean up the lakes, then take analysis of cities and municipal sewage and publish the results on the Internet. The outcome of these tests will bring about changes for cities and municipalities to the highest standard of hog producers regulations.

When several members of a family or others build one bigger barn together, rather than several small barns, which some of our radical people propose, it makes it more economical and easier to keep up with reasonable rules and regulations, easier for vet inspections, et cetera. I don't know whether all of you are aware, but in our barns, when the vet comes, they have to take showers, in and out. We have two showers in one barn. We have three showers in another barn. There are no ifs or buts about that; that's a must, especially for us because we are in multiplying and we are in genetics. This is practically impossible to do with little barns because also there's a time limit between going from one barn to the other, regardless whether we take showers or not.

Our colony friends are one good example of this. Assuming 15 families per colony, would it be more economical to build one big barn instead of 15 small barns? Can you see a veterinarian have to go to 15 little barns and pay the expense and wait two, three days in between each one?

I have personally the pleasure to do business with colonies' purchasing of equipment and hog sales and admire the way they operate their farms. It's always my intent and purpose to look at farmers who do better than I do to learn from them and learn to apply it at my own place.

I beg this government not to hide behind hog farmers for political reason. It will not improve our

lakes but will damage this government's reputation. Thank you for listening to my concerns.

**Mr. Chairperson:** Thank you, Mr. Van Schepdael. I open the floor to questions.

**Mr. Struthers:** Thank you very much, Joe. I appreciate your advice. You did mention that you had applied and injected soil for the last 18 years. That takes us back to 1990, and in 1990, there were about 3,150 barns. There was an average of 388 pigs per barn for a total of about 2.2 million. Eighteen years later, there are about 1,200 barns. There's about an average of 2,500 or so hogs per barn and we're at a total of 8.8 million pigs and most of those are in the area that we're considering for this Bill 17 and the moratorium.

I'm worried that the technology isn't keeping pace with that historic rate of expansion. In your opinion, what is the most significant improvement that has been made in terms of technology that's being used on farms today in Manitoba?

**Mr. Van Schepdael:** In terms of technology we continue to strive on improving not only with our buildings but the way we do things. In our particular case for several years already we worked with an engineer and also one of the ex-professors of the university. He is now retired. He probably will be speaking here today or tomorrow. We have accomplished to make these barns more proper to do the job they have to do.

We have brought in new technologies. However, we still run into problems. If, for instance, to deviate slightly, we've put in geothermal heat in my house. We put geothermal heat in my son's house who lives a quarter mile from my place and who slowly, he is making more and more decisions. I'm supposed to retire, but I'm really only going to do it when I'm dead. We just put in, a few months ago, purchased in Winnipeg, another geothermal unit, ten tonnes, in one of our shops, to keep the trucks and everything ready to go when we have to use them. We are talking on putting geothermal heat into the barns. However, the figure I heard so far in one of the barns would be \$200,000.

Two hundred thousand dollars on the operation, the way it is, we may have to increase production, expand the building, run into opposition by people that move in from the city, expecting not a combine when it's dry and not at night, no dust. They want paved roads. We run into these things consistently so we do improve our barns. We do in the one barn of

loose housing which is the latest trend and some people they harp on that but we used to do that. Government then advised we do it the other way—and agricultural advisors. We've now made the full turn and now we seem to want to go back to the open housing which means it's going to take more buildings and more space.

Now, I'm willing to do and I'm sure most producers are willing to go home and do things properly and better. But, to put a moratorium and a stop on things will not do that. We are already—I have soil tests, manure tests, back many, many, many years. I spent hundreds of dollars on that every year. We spent approximately at home roughly \$25,000, \$20,000 a year on applying the manure, injecting into the soil which is still the same operator of 18 years ago. We do the same on the other barn which is Synergy Swine, which also the family's involved in. We do supply permanent jobs for four, five employees, including at my own farm, plus the people that own the barns do some work in it, too.

I may be getting a little lost here and a little loud but stay with me. I do believe in progress. In fact, I enjoy improving things and making them better. I know there's those people that will say, well, I'm not for all these changes, and we just want to sit back. None of our ministers or our Premier (Mr. Doer) would come in today with horse and buggy. You don't want to go back to that. Neither do I. We have to look at the best we're doing and improve it.

\* (11:40)

But I think the sewage, the manure on the farms, like I say, the farmers I know, we do it properly. When you extract phosphate, nitrogen from the soil, for the plants you grow, you also, after, replenish. The way to do that is to do it properly. We leave a 40-foot buffer zone all around every field. We stake on it, inject the manure. We don't have to do 40 feet by law. I think we only have to do 15 or something, if I'm correct, but we do 40 because the equipment happened to be 40 feet. So we don't go near the edge of the field or near a ditch, et cetera. You know, we try to do all these things. I could have written you half a book here and brought it along, but I didn't want to do that because I'm sure some of it is repetitious.

Yes, we keep on going about improving it, but it costs money and costs more every year. So if government's going to make changes, I think it's proper to keep that in mind. I know a farm family right now which owns 8,000 acres of land south of

Winnipeg; several brothers, sisters together. They want to build another hog barn. They can't. To me, that's not progress. To me, what you should look at, do they have sufficient land and do they properly manage the manure into the soil according to the analysis and soil test. If they do that, what is wrong with it. I don't know.

**Mr. Peter Dyck (Pembina):** Thank you for your presentation, a very well thought out presentation and certainly I can sympathize with you. I have in—and I own a fourth-generation farm as well.

My question to you, though, is, that you were talking about your children and the education that they have. My son, who's managing the farm today, is a university graduate as well. Would you indicate that they are—your children, and I know they are, but I just wanted to confirm it from you, but that they're very knowledgeable when it comes to nutrition and the spreading of waste manure on the land and that, in fact, they do soil test on a regular basis. I know that on our farm, we've got a history of soil testing going years back. So there's a program that is followed and we also inject hog manure on our farm. I just wanted to know whether you do, as well, have a history of the soil from your soil analysis that you have on your farm.

**Mr. Van Shepdael:** Yes, definitely.

**Mr. Chairperson:** Mr. Van Shepdael.

**Mr. Van Shepdael:** I'm sorry, Mr. Chairperson. I can assure you that my son is very particular in doing things properly, even more so than I am. I am very particular to the point that sometimes I get a little bit heck if I want to do things too accurately, because I'm the kind of person that perhaps is never really satisfied with myself, I want to always do better. But, yes, they insist on taking soil test. They take feed test. They take analysis. They do whatever is necessary. They do it. So I have no complaint and they'll do it—I am not worried about my children. They are hard workers. They learn it from their parents. We set a good example. They follow the good example. So far, so good.

This is my basic point. If government sets a good example, analyzes and take test and make it available to the public, the public in turn will look at it and say, hey, maybe we can improve somewhere, let's do it. A good example always goes far.

**Mr. Chairperson:** Okay, we're over time, but I will allow Mr. Eichler a brief question.

**Mr. Eichler:** Thank you for your presentation and definitely a leader in your industry. My question's going to be quite short. In regards to—you talked about geotherm heating and how you have to pay for that. We know that those costs have to be recovered and that sometimes only has to be through expansion in order to do that, and I noticed the smile on the minister of water conservation's face when you were talking about being more green, and this is certainly a way we could do that.

Would you like to highlight on that just a short bit?

**Mr. Van Shepdael:** Yes, we, again, did this by looking at the future and, of course, I went to instructions and information with Manitoba Hydro and it all looks and makes common sense. We are also in an area that we have plenty of water. So, we use the well-to-well system. However, and I don't want to be really negative here, I am holding a little bit money back from Manitoba Hydro. However, dealing with all the departments and the permits, I have maybe more files than maybe government has pretty soon. I, really, it becomes really aggravating sometimes to do something. This is why some of the farmers told me, Joe, I was only going to get so much back, and I said the hell with it—pardon me, Mr. Chairman—it's not worth all the hassle. Maybe that's why it's done, I don't know.

But the Conservation Department, water permits and everything, or—local people in Lac du Bonnet have to ask for permit in Lac du Bonnet, by the way. Nobody in Selkirk, nobody in Brokenhead, where I live. Lac du Bonnet. Those people were very nice and co-operated and got me things. After a few weeks I got one permit. But I'm still waiting on some other ones and then finally after what—two, three, four months? I'll be able to send it in to Manitoba Hydro and get it. That's not going to stop us. Instead, maybe government can improve there, too, of a little less paperwork and bureaucracy. We use computers. In fact, I use two, three of them and they, amazingly, don't give me less work; I got more paper.

Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Thank you, the committee.

**Mr. Chairperson:** Thank you, Mr. Van Schepdael.

I call presenter No. 110, Mr. John Nickel. Mr. Nickel, do you have any written materials for the committee?

**Mr. John Nickel (Private Citizen):** I do.

**Mr. Chairperson:** You do? Okay. The Clerk will distribute them. You may proceed.

**Mr. Nickel:** Good morning and thank you for the opportunity to present. It's rather intimidating to face an audience like this. I'm used to leading staff meetings, those types of things, bankers, et cetera, but, to do this is, I find it a bit intimidating.

So, I guess I'm just here to tell my story and how it impacts me or us. I represent a farm that is owned and operated by two families together. We pooled our resources and developed the farm into a, some people would call it a larger farm over time. I guess I won't attempt to restate all the facts regarding the economic spinoffs from hog farming in Manitoba, but I would like to say that our farm provides 20 or so very well-paying jobs in communities where these people would not normally have that type of an opportunity unless they were prepared to travel outside their communities for some distance, 60, 70 kilometres one way to larger centres such as Steinbach or perhaps Winnipeg which would be even further commute. I see people doing that. When I'm on the road to the farm in the mornings, early morning, there are vehicles that I recognize, that I've learned to recognize and they probably recognize me as well, you know. We pass each other. I'm not driving that far; they're driving all the way to Winnipeg. I happen to know who some of those people are.

So I guess 20 jobs may not sound like a lot in the grand scheme of things, but what it represents or what it means to me it's, those are my people. Those are my employees, and I care about their futures as much as I care about ours. For myself, personally, I started off really young in this sector of agriculture. I think I was 16 at the time. Started part-time, entry level as an employee and, over the years, I have progressed to where I am actually now a major owner of the company that I started working for many, many years ago.

So that's my story. And there's been many steps along the way. That's where it is of my family and another family. We own the farming operation together. I happen to be the guy who has to look after the day-to-day stuff which is fun for the most part. The last year has been very challenging, as I'm sure you all know for our industry. The climate in which we operate from a business point of view has changed dramatically with the exchange rate, et cetera.

\* (11:50)



So I guess I take it quite personally when something like this is proposed. It feels like I'm in a game or that we are in a game where there's no referee and I'm being pummelled economically already. Then I've got—and it feels like the government is, you know, just kind of waiting there to pummel me some more and just knock me down.

The business that I'm in is very dynamic and ever-changing. I mean, I've been in it a long time, as you can see from the colour of my hair. I mean, there has been so much change over the years. In my mind, I guess, anytime that you would propose to trap a business in a certain model or size, such as is being proposed with Bill 17, you're limiting that business so it cannot really change to new economic realities or opportunities, if and when, they arise. To me that's the equivalent of saying to, I don't know, a Costco or a Walmart, and saying, this is it. This is your store, you cannot add that greenhouse at the side—like you see now that almost every Canadian Tire and Walmart and Home Depot and everybody has this greenhouse on the side—adding value. They've got the traffic. So now you'd be limiting and saying, no, you can't do that.

We were told that the proposed moratorium, Bill 17, does not prevent the industry from expanding, as it would still be possible to build in certain areas of Manitoba. In my mind that's a rather simplistic statement. What it fails to do is to look at individual situations such as ourselves. Two years ago we did purchase another farm. We did spend a lot of money renovating, upgrading the farm. About a quarter million dollars of that money was spent in anticipation of someday achieving a permit to expand that operation to a larger size to improve the economies of scale. So if this moratorium does go ahead, basically, I've wasted a quarter million dollars plus. For me that's a lot of money, lots of money, and the bank expects to get it all back from me.

I think what Bill 17 fails to do is to address situations such as that. If you can demonstrate that you can expand in a sustainable manner, you have the land base to spread the manure according to regulations, and if you have proven, if you have a good track record in the industry as a good operator, you have good rapport with your neighbours, it fails to recognize that. It just says that's it, that's all; everybody is covered or smothered with the same blanket. You're trapped in your business bottle. You cannot move on. You cannot change.

I guess, to me—my question is, how can you point your finger at me and call me a polluter, when I am being proactive and always endeavour to be a better steward. I am not perfect. We are not perfect. But our goal is always to improve, move forward, adopt new better practices as we can. How can you do that when you know that, perhaps, you're flushing a toilet in this building and it's going, more or less, directly into the Red River. It doesn't make sense. Like, yes, I make mistakes. I'm not perfect, but we have rules, we have the regulations. We try our very best to follow them, always trying to improve. So why is the finger being pointed at me? Why am I the scapegoat?

I think, as a group of hog farmers, we've always demonstrated that we're pro-active. We're a pretty dynamic group, and I think we want to be part of the solution, not part of the problem. Thank you.

**Mr. Chairperson:** Thank you for your presentation, Mr. Nickel. Questions.

**Mr. Struthers:** Thank you very much, John. Yesterday, a doctor of economics from Brandon University was here, and he talked about the economics that are being portrayed in a recent ad campaign on Bill 17. His contention is that those numbers were overblown, that they weren't accurate.

Take a minute to give me a good read on what the hog industry means to Oak Bluff.

**Mr. Nickel:** That is my mailing address. Sorry, that's just where I pick up my mail. Our farms are located in Lowe Farm, R.M. of Morris, and near Tolstoi, R.M. of Franklin. So, economically, our total investment is around \$8 million. Pretty much all we generate in revenue is, these days, more than gone paying bills, so it goes back into the community in many different forms. Obviously, labour, feed are big ones, supplies.

So it's—I'm not sure I've answered your question, but we do have a large investment in this business. It's my life. It has been my life since I was a young person. To me, if this bill goes forward, how can we have confidence in the industry? How can I—why would I be motivated to invest anything more than I barely have to, to keep up with technology to improve? I mean, the motivation wouldn't be there. There's no confidence in the industry. Why would anybody else want to come in and invest more dollars? You know, it's, in my mind, just really would be a very bad thing. Trapping us in a current business model not allowing us to adapt or change

would eventually cause our demise because we just—we couldn't change, we couldn't adapt to new environments.

**Mrs. Mavis Taillieu (Morris):** Thank you, Mr. Nickel, for your presentation.

I just wanted to ask you a question. It sort of relates to what a previous presenter said about the municipal waste water and city waste water, and if there was an opportunity to have the phosphorus and nitrogen levels in these areas posted on the Internet so everybody knew that there's issues everywhere and not just in hog farming. Certainly, then we could look at all the areas that need to be looked at and not just targetting hog producers.

I just wondered if you thought that maybe a better approach to looking at this might be to look at all sectors and have everybody in this province look at what they can do rather than just target one industry.

**Mr. Nickel:** Absolutely. I guess my wife and I enjoy kayaking. This is a little story that I like to tell, I guess, about what I see on the river when we kayak, what we see. We don't like to work that hard so we usually start upstream from Winnipeg and usually end up at The Forks.

So, for example, if you put in at Beaudry Park which is, I'm going to say it's about, I know I've done the Google Map thing, I think it's about 20-some odd clicks to The Forks. I mean, you know, what you see happening on the banks of the rivers sometimes is people, city people, maybe like to use their own backyard as a disposal site. That's an example of—

\* (12:00)

**Mr. Chairperson:** Order. We have reached the order of the day which is 12 o'clock. Is it the will of the committee to not see the clock to the end of this presentation? *[Agreed]* Continue, Mr. Nickel, you have an additional three minutes here.

**Mr. Nickel:** To me what that says is, yes, exactly, like, people don't realize that they are part of the problem as well. We all have a contribution to make to the solution. Absolutely. It's easy to ignore the problem when you're not being hauled up or called upon or put in the limelight. It's very easy to say, oh, it's the other guy's problem. He's the polluter. It's not the case. We're all responsible to do our best to improve it.

**Mr. Eichler:** Thank you for your presentation. I do want to talk specifically about the nutrient

management regulations that have just been put into place. Do you think they've had an opportunity to actually be put in place by most producers and whether or not they've had an opportunity to see whether or not they've worked, and I guess, then, would you say that Bill 17 is premature at this point in time in order to see whether or not those nutrient management regulations in fact will work?

**Mr. Nickel:** If you're speaking about the proposed regulations, for example, at one of our sites, we now presently have usable land base, or have available to us, a land base of up to 1,200 acres of which we use 85, up to 90 percent of it in a year to apply the manure. If I understand those regulations correctly, according to our agrologist, whom we work with very closely, we would need a land base of some over 4,000 acres to apply that same amount of manure. If that's the regulations you're talking about, certainly, no. We have not had an opportunity to prove that that will improve or not improve the situation.

**Mr. Chairperson:** Thank you, Mr. Nickel. A very brief question to Mr. Graydon.

**Mr. Graydon:** I just want to speak just briefly to the question that the minister put forward of community benefit, and because I have the opportunity of living in the R.M. of Franklin, I see the many benefits that your operation puts forward in that particular community. The question I have is very short and very direct. What advice would you have for this minister with this particular piece of legislation?

**Mr. Nickel:** I guess I would say, like Mr. Hacault, please put it in the recycle bin and allow us as hog farmers to continue to work with Conservation, closely with Conservation, to always improve and be better at what we do. I think we have shown you that we have the willingness to do that, maybe not every individual person but as a group, we certainly want to. We do not want to be part of the problem and allow us to continue to learn and get better at what we do.

**Mr. Chairperson:** Thank you, Mr. Nickel. As was announced in the House on June 4, this committee will sit today until—midnight? *[interjection]* Will sit again, starting at 6 p.m. Okay, we will sit at 6 p.m. this evening.

For the purposes of conserving paper, it would be appreciated if committee members could leave behind any unused copies of the bill.

The hour being 12 o'clock, committee rise.

**COMMITTEE ROSE AT:** 12:04 p.m.

**WRITTEN SUBMISSIONS PRESENTED  
BUT NOT READ**

Bill 17

Je me présente devant vous aujourd'hui pour vous communiquer mon opposition au projet de loi 17. Permettez-moi de plaider ma cause.

Un peu d'histoire:

Je suis propriétaire d'une entreprise de 4000 cochons,

- début typique, ancêtres sont arrivés avec un boeuf
  - ajoutent des poules, des cochons et commencement à défricher le terrain
- ferme passée de génération à génération
  - grand-père achète le premier boeuf de race-production de crème
  - père change à la livraison de lait en vrac et bâtit une étable
  - j'ajoute une nouvelle étable
    - le troupeau augmente
    - défrichons et cultivons plus de terrain
    - embauchons des employés
  - mon fils s'intéresse à l'entreprise familiale
- aujourd'hui - entreprise diversifiée - vaches laitières et porcherie
  - 2 fermes familiales - 2 différentes voies - travaillent ensemble
  - avantage - la porcherie produit l'engrais nécessaire pour les récoltes qui nourrissent le troupeau laitier (les deux se complètent avec succès)
- les fermes grandissent mais les nombres d'opérations diminuent
  - permet aux villes et aux villages de grandir (choix de style de vie; options d'emploi)
  - possibilité d'emploi dans les communautés rurales sur les fermes

Résultat:

- les fermes grandissent - nombre de fermiers baisse

- le fermier n'a plus de voix

- le fermier est devenu une minorité parmi une population qui a perdu l'attachement à la terre et la compréhension d'où vient leur nourriture

- la population en général ne voit pas les efforts et les changements qu'a fait l'industrie porcine afin de devenir plus responsable envers l'environnement - l'industrie la plus réglementée dans ce domaine

- c'est facile de mettre le blâme et la responsabilité sur le fermier

- si c'est le fermier qui a tort, la population en général n'a pas de changements à faire dans leur façon de vivre

- moratoire sur les porcheries au lieu de regarder aux autres sources telles que les villes et villages et les autres industries qui contribuent au problème de phosphate

Adrien Grenier  
Private Citizen

\* \* \*

Bill 17

Bonjour. Mon nom est Paul Grenier. J'ai 17 ans.

Vous vous demandez probablement ce qu'un jeune de 17 ans de la campagne vient faire dans la grosse ville. J'ai décidé que je devais me rendre ici aujourd'hui afin de faire ma part pour protéger le future de cette province, tout un défi pour quelqu'un qui finit son secondaire cette année.

Comme jeune manitobain intéressé à faire ma vie dans le domaine agricole, je dois regarder à mon futur à long terme, contrairement au parti politique au pouvoir qui ne regarde que quatre années à la fois, c'est-à-dire, jusqu'à la prochaine élection. Après tout, il semble très important pour ce parti s'assurer un autre terme.

Comme jeune de la campagne, je suis habitué de faire le trajet jusqu'à Winnipeg, que ce soit pour des rendez-vous, participer à différents organismes tel que le Parlement-Jeunesse, des activités scolaires ou même pour rendre visite à des parents et amis. Au contraire, les jeunes de Winnipeg ne connaissent pas cette situation. Il y a une plus grande chance que je fasse le trajet d'une heure et demi à Winnipeg que des jeunes de la ville fassent l'inverse. Ces trajets m'ont permis de découvrir beaucoup de différences entre l'urbain et le rural. Par exemple, pour un jeune

de campagne il est essentiel d'obtenir un permis de conduire puisque nous ne profitons pas d'un système de transport public. Pour les jeunes de la ville qui a rarement de grandes distances à parcourir, un permis est un privilège. Pour les jeunes de la campagne, un permis est une nécessité. En plus, j'ai remarqué que la majorité des jeunes de la ville se promènent avec leur téléphone cellulaire. Dans la région rurale d'où je viens, nous n'avons même pas de réception. En plus notre région n'est même pas considérée pour le service Internet à haute vitesse. Mais, malgré ces lacunes je préfère encore la vie dans une région rurale.

Pour moi, la découverte la plus flagrante dont j'ai fait est que les gens des régions urbaines sont en majorité ignorants de comment les choses se passent en région rurale, et surtout au sujet des entreprises agricoles. En majorité, ils ont l'image qui est trop souvent propagée que les fermiers sont des exploiters de la nature qui font tout pour l'argent, tout en détruisant l'environnement. Moi, je sais que cette image est complètement fausse.

Pendant les dernières années j'ai constaté que même dans les régions qui sont fort en agriculture, les élèves tombent victimes de la propagande et adoptent cette mentalité de fermier exploitateur sans limite. Ce qui est plus triste encore c'est que plusieurs des jeunes qui font partie d'une entreprise agricole ont peur de parler en défense de l'agriculture et certains en ont même honte. Ceci se passe dans une école rurale où plusieurs étudiants travaillent sur les entreprises agricoles ou les commerces qui dépendent de l'agriculture. Dans cette dernière année j'ai eu beaucoup de difficulté à parler ouvertement de l'agriculture dans les couloirs de l'école. Les médias on fait un travail tel que le fermier est perçu comme un diable que nous devons anéantir.

Moi je représente la 5<sup>ième</sup> génération de ma famille à vivre dans ma petite communauté qui est depuis ses débuts et continue d'être en plus grande part agricole. L'entreprise de notre famille s'est diversifiée. Pendant plusieurs années nous pouvions voir une ferme sur chaque quart de section. À présent nous avons des entreprises (vaches laitières, vaches à boeuf, bisons, porcs, cerfs, moutons) moins nombreuses mais plus étendues. Ces fermes étant plus grandes offrent des possibilités d'emploi au gens de la région, ce qui permet à de jeunes familles de s'établir dans le coin. Je dois ajouter que les gens qui vivent dans ma communauté qui ne travaillent pas sur les fermes doivent se déplacer aux prochains villages, le plus proche étant 50 km, et allant jusqu'à

Winnipeg à 150 km d'ici. L'autre option est de déménager de la région complètement et c'est un option qui est souvent pratiquée.

Les terres d'ici sont cultivées depuis au-delà de 100 ans. Elles produisent encore de bonne récoltes et les niveaux de nutriments sont encore très bons. Oui, nous étendons de l'engrais naturel sur nos terres. Avec les tests du sol et du purin et en considération du type de sol, nous étendons l'engrais pour qu'il soit effectif, et pas plus! Après tout, nous sommes intéressés à continuer de travailler la terre pour les années à venir. Notre but est de diminuer le montant d'engrais chimique sur lequel nous devons encour dépendre pour remplacer les nutriments utilisés par les récoltes. Le fait que ma famille prenne soin du terrain et de l'environnement en général m'indique qu'il y a un futur pour moi dans le domaine de l'agriculture.

Après toutes toutes ces années, la ferme sur laquelle nous vivons évolue encore. Mon frère détient un diplôme en agriculture et travaille directement dans l'industrie. Pour moi-même, je planifie de suivre des études en « bio-systems engineering » à l'Université du Manitoba. Je crois que c'est une bonne façon de faire ma part dans le futur de l'agriculture au Manitoba.

J'ai lu le rapport de la Commission de protection de l'environnement. Nul part dans le rapport est-ce que c'est indiqué qu'un moratoire devait être imposé. Le gouvernement agit contrairement à ce que le rapport a recommandé. Pour quelles raisons?

Je crois que le gouvernement devrait passer plus de temps et d'effort sur l'éducation. Les gens ont besoins de réaliser d'où vient leur nourriture. Nos politiciens doivent immédiatement cesser d'abaisser les industries agricoles, surtout l'industrie porcine.

L'industrie porcine est l'industrie la plus réglementée et peut-être que les autres industries devraient montrer une telle initiative avant que le gouvernement impose son moratoire sur l'industrie porcine.

Le temps est venue où chaque industrie ainsi que les villes doivent prendre responsabilité pour leurs actions, au même niveau que l'industrie porcine. Si vous frappez, frappez avec égalité.

Je vous remercie de votre temps et je souhaite que vous serez justes dans vos conclusions.

Paul Grenier  
Private Citizen

\* \* \*

Bill 17

Messieurs, Dames, députés du comité permanent de l'assemblée législative,

Je me présente, mon nom est Marcel Hacault. J'ai passé ma jeunesse sur une ferme avec des vaches, des animaux à boeufs, et parfois quelques cochons vers Mariapolis.

Nous avions des grandes cultures de lin, canola, blé et de l'orge. Nous étions neuf dans famille, j'étais l'ainé. Avec l'encouragement de mon père j'ai poursuivie des études et j'ai choisi de compléter mon diplôme universitaire en agriculture. Ensuite, bien sûr, je voulais faire la ferme. Hélas, mon père n'était pas prêt à prendre sa retraite, et j'ai cherché de m'acheter une ferme.

Vu que mon épouse est d'origine Mennonite et moi francophone nous avons cherché pour une ferme dans la municipalité de Hanover, ou les deux cultures ce trouve.

La ferme que j'ai acheté était une porcherie, 100 truies naissant-finissant. La ferme était situer sur 46.8 acres, qui m'inquiétait un peu, (manque de superficie pour répandre le lisier) mais je n'avais pas les moyens d'acheter plus de terre, et il me semblait que les voisins en avait beaucoup. Avec cette petite ferme nous avons eu trois enfants et une vie très confortable. A la fin de vingt ans de production j'ai du décider mon avenir dans l'industrie porcine.

En 2003 j'ai exploré mes options. Le secteur banquier m'encourageait de bâtir grand et m'intégrer avec d'autre producteurs. La municipalité m'a dit que je pouvais construire sur mon site mais il faudrait être conforme aux normes provinciales. Mes options étaient très limitées. J'ai décidé de vidé mes étables.

Entre temps des changements de la part du gouvernement sont mis en place. Si je veut continuer en production il faudrait que je construise une citerne de lisier que me permettrais a être conforme a la norme qui interdit l'épandage de lisier en hiver. J'ai aussi besoin une autorisation de la municipalité pour modifier la zone de séparation.

Je suis un peu déprimer, avec le prix du porc dernièrement et la multitude de réglementation il serait très difficile de revenir en production!!! Mais si je voulais, je pourrais.

Arrive la loi modifiant la loi sur l'environnement (interdiction permanente visant la construction ou l'agrandissement d'installations réservées aux procs)

Quand je pense à tout l'argent que l'industrie porcine a investi dans la recherche pour assurer la production durable, et l'argent et le temps investie par la municipalité de Hanover à planifier le développement de toute la production animale je suis stupéfait.

Quand je pense à l'importance de la base économique de la production porcine et animale à la province, je suis stupéfait.

Quand je pense à l'impact que la modification va avoir sur l'environnement je me secoue la tête. néanmoins je reconnais que le ministre doit croire que sa proposition mérite d'être considérée.

Comme Manitobain vous décrit mon impact :

*It will have the following impact on me as a Manitoban:*

1. Pas de chance à continuer dans la production de porcs chez moi.....même si je peu faire preuve que je peu être conforme a les nouvelles normes.
2. Pas d'options pour mes jeunes à continuer dans l'industrie sans ce déplacer.
3. J'ai des étables qui sont vides, et que je ne peu pas remettre en production.
4. Je suis taxé sur une entreprise qui m'a été exproprié par la province.

Je propose :

1. Jette la loi modifiant la loi sur l'environnement dans la poubelle. Encore mieux, faites application pour un permit de épandage, et répandez la d'une façon durable.
2. Quand à moi, e suis victime d'une action en expropriation par la province et je devrais avoir accès à des frais payables pour l'expropriation de mes étables.
3. Comme j'ai déjà soumis au ministre de finance, je demande un paiement du gouvernement de la valeur résiduel de mes étables tel qu'indiquer sur mes taxes municipales, et les frais de démolition. La facture et soumis avec ma présentation.

Je vous prie d'agréer, députés du comité permanent de l'assemblée législative du Manitoba, l'expression de ma haute considération.

Marcel L. Hacault  
agronome

The Legislative Assembly of Manitoba Debates and Proceedings  
are also available on the Internet at the following address:

**<http://www.gov.mb.ca/legislature/hansard/index.html>**