

**JOURNALS**  
OF THE  
**LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY**  
OF  
**MANITOBA**



*Printed by Order of the Legislative Assembly*

**2<sup>ND</sup> SESSION OF THE 40<sup>TH</sup> LEGISLATURE**

FROM THE 19<sup>TH</sup> DAY OF NOVEMBER 2012  
TO THE 13<sup>TH</sup> DAY OF SEPTEMBER 2013

IN THE 61<sup>ST</sup> – 62<sup>ND</sup> YEARS OF  
THE REIGN OF OUR SOVEREIGN LADY  
QUEEN ELIZABETH THE SECOND

**WINNIPEG, MANITOBA**

VOLUME 160

# LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA



Lieutenant Governor of Manitoba .....	Hon. Philip LEE
Speaker of the Legislative Assembly .....	Hon. Daryl REID
Deputy Speaker / Chairperson of Committees of the Whole .....	Mr. Tom NEVAKSHONOFF
Deputy Chairpersons of Committees of the Whole .....	Mr. Rob ALTEMEYER Mr. Mohinder SARAN
Clerk of the Legislative Assembly .....	Ms. Patricia CHAYCHUK
Deputy Clerk of the Legislative Assembly .....	Mr. Rick YARISH
Clerk Assistant/Journals Clerk .....	Mr. Claude MICHAUD
Clerk Assistant/Committee Clerks .....	Ms. Monique GRENIER Mr. Andrea SIGNORELLI
Clerk Assistant/Research Officer .....	Mr. Greg RECKSIDLER
Translators .....	Mr. Alexandre COUTU Mr. Guy JOURDAIN Ms. Annick KIEFFERT Ms. Louise LAFONTAINE Mr. Youness MOUSTARZAK Ms. Michèle PILON



Philip LEE

Lieutenant Governor

PROVINCE OF MANITOBA

ELIZABETH II, Queen of Canada

## **P R O C L A M A T I O N**

With the advice and consent of the Executive Council of Manitoba, we convene the 2<sup>nd</sup> Session of the 40<sup>th</sup> Legislature of the Province of Manitoba on Monday, November 19, 2012, at 1:30 p.m.

HIS HONOUR PHILIP LEE  
Lieutenant Governor of the Province of Manitoba  
Winnipeg, Manitoba  
October 10, 2012

Honourable Andrew SWAN  
Minister of Justice and Attorney General

**INDEX**  
**TO THE**  
**JOURNALS**  
**VOLUME 160**  
**SECOND SESSION, FORTIETH LEGISLATURE**  
**61-62 ELIZABETH II, 2012-2013**

---

**ADDRESS IN REPLY TO THRONE SPEECH**

Moved by Mr. GAUDREAU, seconded by Mr. PETERSEN .....	21
<i>Debate</i> : Mr. GAUDREAU and Mr. PETERSEN. Allowed to remain open .....	21
<i>Debate continued</i> : Mr. PALLISTER. Amendment – Mr. PALLISTER. Ruled in order. <i>Debate continued (amendment)</i> : Hon. Mr. CHOMIAK, Mrs. DRIEDGER and Ms. WIGHT. Allowed to remain in the name of Ms. WIGHT .....	23-24
<i>Debate continued (amendment)</i> : Ms. WIGHT, Mrs. TAILLIEU, Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS, Mr. SCHULER, Hon. Mr. SWAN, Mrs. MITCHELSON and Messrs. NEVAKSHONOFF, HELWER, ALLUM and FRIESEN. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. FRIESEN.....	26-28
<i>Debate continued (amendment)</i> : Mr. FRIESEN, Hon. Ms. OSWALD and Messrs. GRAYDON, MALOWAY and PEDERSEN. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. PEDERSEN .....	30-31
<i>Debate continued (amendment)</i> : Mr. PEDERSEN, Hon. Mr. CHIEF, Mr. CULLEN, Hon. Mr. BJORNSON, Mrs. STEFANSON, Hon. Messrs. RONDEAU and GERRARD, Ms. BLADY and Mr. MAGUIRE. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. MAGUIRE .....	33-35
<i>Debate continued (amendment)</i> : Hon. Ms. SELBY, Mrs. ROWAT, Messrs. CALDWELL, BRIESE, SARAN and EWASKO and Hon. Mr. ASHTON. Allowed to remain in the name of Hon. Mr. ASHTON and Mr. MAGUIRE (by leave) .....	37-39
<i>Debate continued (amendment)</i> : Leave denied to have the matter remain in the name of Hon. Mr. ASHTON; Mr. MAGUIRE, Hon. Mr. KOSTYSHYN, Mr. SMOOK, Hon. Mr. ROBINSON and Messrs. GOERTZEN and JHA. Negatived, on division (20-35). <i>Debate continued (main motion)</i> : Mr. JHA (by leave). Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. JHA .....	41-43
<i>Debate continued (main motion)</i> : Messrs. JHA, WISHART, WHITEHEAD and EICHLER, Hon. Ms. MARCELINO (Logan) and Hon. Mr. SELINGER. Agreed to, on division (34-20).....	45-46

**ADMINISTRATOR**

Presents Speech from the Throne (November 19, 2012).....	1-14
--	------

**BILLS - GENERAL (see Appendix "A")**

**BILLS - NOT ASSENTED TO (see Appendix "C")**

# INDEX

## BILLS - PRIVATE (see Appendix "B")

## BILLS DEALT WITH IN THE HOUSE - BILL STATUS (see Appendix "D")

### BUDGET DEBATE

Moved by Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS, Tuesday, April 16, 2013

<i>Debate</i> : Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS. Adjourned (Mr. PALLISTER).....	90
<i>Debate continued</i> : Mr. PALLISTER. Amendment – Mr. PALLISTER. Ruled in order. <i>Debate continued (amendment)</i> : Hon. Mr. ASHTON, Mrs. STEFANSON, Mr. GAUDREAU and Mrs. ROWAT. Allowed to remain in the name of Mrs. ROWAT .....	94-95
<i>Debate continued (amendment)</i> : Mrs. ROWAT, Ms. WIGHT, Mr. HELWER, Hon. Ms. IRVIN-ROSS, Mr. PEDERSEN and Hon. Ms. MELNICK. Allowed to remain in the name of Hon. Ms. MELNICK .....	97
<i>Debate continued (amendment)</i> : Leave denied to have the matter remain in the name of Hon. Ms. MELNICK; Mr. CULLEN, Hon. Mr. SWAN, Mrs. MITCHELSON and Mr. NEVAKSHONOFF. Allowed to remain open.....	99
<i>Debate continued (amendment)</i> : Mr. EWASKO, Hon. Ms. OSWALD, Hon. Mr. GERRARD, Hon. Ms. SELBY, Mr. SCHULER, Hon. Mr. BJORNSON and Mr. EICHLER. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. EICHLER .....	101
<i>Debate continued (amendment)</i> : Messrs. EICHLER, PETTERSEN and SMOOK, Ms. BLADY, Mr. MAGUIRE, Hon. Mr. CHIEF, Mr. GOERTZEN and Hon. Ms. MARCELINO (Logan). Allowed to remain in the name of Hon. Ms. MARCELINO (Logan) .....	107-108
<i>Debate continued (amendment)</i> : Hon. Ms. MARCELINO (Logan), Mr. GRAYDON, Hon. Mr. KOSTYSHYN, Mr. BRIESE, Ms. CROTHERS, Mr. FRIESEN, Hon. Mr. RONDEAU and Mr. WISHART. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. WISHART .....	110-111
<i>Debate continued (amendment)</i> : Mr. WISHART, Hon. Mr. SELINGER, Mrs. DRIEDGER and Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS. Negatived, on division (17-36). <i>Main motion</i> – Agreed to, on division (36-18) .....	113-115

### BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE (see also Motions, Government)

House convened (November 19, 2012)

Unanimous consent to waive Rules 31(2) and 31(3) regarding the timing for submission and prioritizing of Private Members' Resolutions with the understanding that the time frames for submission and prioritization would be determined by the House Leaders and that in the interim, they could be announced a week in advance for consideration.....	21
Unanimous consent to have the English title of Bill 7 — The Planning Amendment and Winnipeg Charter Amendment Act (Affordable Housing), altered to read "The Planning Amendment and City of Winnipeg Charter Amendment Act (Affordable Housing)" .....	32
Rule 31(8) – the Government House Leader announced that the WE Day Resolution would be considered on Tuesday, December 4, 2012, if necessary .....	37
House agreed that the Throne Speech debate would remain in the name of the Member for Arthur-Virden with the understanding that the Member would speak as soon as it was possible within the normal speaking rotation.....	39

## INDEX

---

Rule 31(9) – the Opposition House Leader announced that the Matrimonial Property Rights on Reserves Resolution would be considered on Thursday, December 6, 2012 .....	45
Unanimous consent to have the Standing Committee on Human Resources meet concurrently with the House starting at 11:00 a.m. on Tuesday, December 4, 2012.....	48
House to deal with Second Reading of Bill (No. 201) (by leave) .....	53
Rule 31(8) – the Government House Leader announced that the Rural CancerCare Hubs Resolution would be considered on the next Tuesday of Private Members’ Business.....	53
Unanimous consent to allow Bill (No. 3), reported from the Standing Committee on Human Resources on Wednesday, December 5, 2012 to appear on the Order Paper of Thursday, December 6, 2012 for consideration .....	59
Rule 31(8) – the Government House Leader announced that the Rural CancerCare Hubs Resolution would be considered next Tuesday, April 30, 2013 .....	107
Rule 31(9) – the Opposition House Leader announced that the Provincial Taxation Broken Promises Resolution would be considered next Thursday, May 2, 2013 .....	110
House to deal with Second Reading of Bill (No. 203) (by leave) .....	120
Unanimous consent to have Bills (No. 2) and (No. 6) standing in the name of the former Member for Morris remain Open .....	120
Rule 31(8) – the Government House Leader announced that the 100 <sup>th</sup> Anniversary of the Provincial Exhibition of Manitoba’s "Dome Building" Resolution would be considered next Tuesday, May 7, 2013.....	121
Unanimous consent for the Leader of the Official Opposition and critics to have staff members join them during Estimates.....	121
Unanimous consent to extend the morning sitting of the House by 6 minutes due to time lost related to technical difficulties .....	122
Rule 28(3) – the Government House Leader announced that an Opposition Day Motion would be considered today, Wednesday, May 1, 2013 .....	129
Rule 31(9) – the Opposition House Leader announced that the Manitoba Hydro Rate Hikes Resolution would be considered next Thursday, May 9, 2013.....	131
House advised that notice had been received from the Leader of the Official Opposition that his unlimited speaking time on Bill (No. 9) had been designated to the Honourable Member for Steinbach.....	134
House advised that notice had been received from the Leader of the Official Opposition that his unlimited speaking time on Bill (No. 18) had been designated to the Honourable Member for Steinbach.....	139
Rule 31(8) – the Government House Leader announced that the Nick Ternette Resolution would be considered next Tuesday, May 14, 2013 .....	144
Rule 31(9) – the Acting Opposition House Leader announced that the Integrity of the Finance Minister Resolution would be considered next Thursday, May 16, 2013 .....	150
Rule 31(8) – the Government House Leader announced that the United Nations World Day for Cultural Diversity for Dialogue and Development Resolution would be considered next Tuesday, May 21, 2013.....	159
Rule 28(3) – the Government House Leader announced that an Opposition Day Motion would be considered on Wednesday, May 15, 2013 .....	161

## INDEX

---

Rule 31(9) – the Opposition House Leader announced that the 4-H Resolution would be considered next Thursday, May 23, 2013 .....	166
Rule 31(8) – the Acting Government House Leader announced that the Observance of Funeral Customs Resolution would be considered next Tuesday, May 28, 2013 .....	175
Unanimous consent to have the Speaker interrupt debate at 5:00 p.m. to call Second Reading of Bills (Nos. 33, 22, 21, 23, 25, 36, 38 and 43), with the understanding that the House would sit no later than 6:00 p.m. ....	175
Unanimous consent to waive quorum calls and defer any recorded votes arising in the House after 5:00 p.m. for Tuesday, May 21, 2013 .....	175
House advised that notice had been received from the Leader of the Official Opposition that his unlimited speaking time on Second Reading and all amendments arising from Second Reading of Bill (No. 20) had been designated to the Honourable Member for Steinbach .....	180
Rule 31(9) – the Opposition House Leader announced that the Declining Emergency Health Care in Manitoba Resolution would be considered next Thursday, May 30, 2013 .....	182
Unanimous consent to have the Speaker interrupt debate at 5:00 p.m. to call Second Reading of Bills (Nos. 29, 35, 40, 32, 34, 39, 28, 45, 26, 31 and 44), with the understanding that the House would sit no later than 6:00 p.m. ....	185
Unanimous consent to waive quorum calls and defer any recorded votes arising in the House after 5:00 p.m. for Thursday, May 23, 2013 .....	185
House advised that notice had been received from the Leader of the Official Opposition that his unlimited speaking time on Second Reading and all amendments arising from Second Reading of Bill (No. 33) had been designated to the Honourable Member for Arthur-Virden .....	192
Rule 31(8) – the Government House Leader announced that the Class Size Initiatives Resolution would be considered next Tuesday, June 4, 2013 .....	196
Rule 31(9) – the Opposition House Leader announced that the Support for Manitoba Hydro Smart Program Resolution would be considered next Thursday, June 6, 2013 .....	205
Rule 31(8) – the Government House Leader announced that the Northern Climate Change Research Resolution would be considered next Tuesday, June 11, 2013 .....	213
Rule 31(9) – the Opposition House Leader announced that the Decade of Mismanagement within Manitoba’s Child Welfare System Resolution would be considered next Thursday, June 13, 2013 .....	220
Rule 31(8) – the Government House Leader announced that the Provincial Initiatives to Support Children and Youth Resolution would be considered next Tuesday, June 18, 2013 .....	229
House advised that notice had been received from the Leader of the Official Opposition that his unlimited speaking time on Second Reading of Bill (No. 20) had been designated to the Honourable Member for Steinbach .....	230
Rule 31(9) – the Opposition House Leader announced that the Forced Municipal Amalgamations Resolution would be considered next Thursday, June 20, 2013 .....	234
Rule 31(8) – the Government House Leader announced that the Senate of Canada Resolution would be considered next Tuesday, June 25, 2013 .....	247
Unanimous consent to receive the agreement regarding Committee hearings for Bills (Nos. 18 and 20) and Committee of Supply sittings during the week of June 24 .....	256-257

## INDEX

---

Rule 31(8) – the Government House Leader announced that the Western Power Grid Resolution would be considered next Tuesday, July 2, 2013.....	262
Rule 31(9) – the Opposition House Leader announced that the Support for Manitoba Families with Autism Resolution would be considered next Thursday, July 4, 2013.....	271
Unanimous consent to have two sections of Committee of Supply meet in Rooms 254 and 255 to consider the estimates until 5:00 p.m., with the understanding that the Committee of Supply would sit in the Chamber until 6:00 p.m. and that the Committee of Supply would not sit on Friday, June 28, 2013 .....	272
Rule 31(8) – the Government House Leader announced that the Refugee Health Care Resolution would be considered next Tuesday, July 9, 2013.....	276
House to deal with Second Reading of Bill (No. 203) (by leave) .....	281
Rule 31(9) – the Opposition House Leader announced that the Equal Access to Services for all Manitobans Resolution would be considered next Thursday, July 11, 2013.....	284
Rule 31(8) – the Government House Leader announced that the Manitoba Home Care Program Resolution would be considered next Tuesday, July 16, 2013 .....	299
Unanimous consent to have the House sit until 7:00 p.m. Wednesday, July 10, 2013 and Thursday, July 11, 2013 in order to allow for all three sections of the Committee of Supply to continue consideration of departmental estimates.....	302
Unanimous consent to waive quorum calls and defer any formal votes arising after 5:00 p.m. on Wednesday, July 10, 2013 for Monday, July 15, 2013 .....	302
Unanimous consent that from 5:00 p.m. to 7:00 p.m., in the event that a formal vote is requested on any resolutions or motions, including the last remaining item for a department, the Committee is able to move on to the next department listed in the sequence, with the formal votes to be held starting Monday, July 15, 2013. ....	302
Rule 31(9) – the Opposition House Leader announced that The Need for Safe, Healthy and Sustainable Housing Resolution would be considered next Thursday, July 18, 2013.....	308
House to deal with Second Reading of Bill (No. 302) (by leave) .....	311
House to deal with Second Reading of Bill (No. 210) (by leave) .....	311
Rule 31(8) – the Government House Leader announced that the Investment in Flood Protection Initiatives Resolution would be considered next Tuesday, July 23, 2013.....	311
Rule 31(9) – the Opposition House Leader announced that the Protecting Manitoba’s Future Resolution would be considered next Thursday, July 25, 2013 .....	320
House to deal with Second Reading of Bill (No. 207) (by leave) .....	339
Rule 31(8) – the Government House Leader announced that the Nutritional Experiments on Aboriginal Peoples Resolution would be considered next Tuesday, July 30, 2013.....	342
Rule 31(9) – the Opposition House Leader announced that the Approach to Crime Resolution would be considered next Thursday, August 1, 2013.....	349
Rule 31(8) – the Government House Leader announced that the Supporting Malala’s Mission Resolution would be considered next Tuesday, August 6, 2013 .....	360
Rule 31(9) – the Opposition House Leader announced that the Provincial Government Fails Manitoba Youth Resolution would be considered next Thursday, August 8, 2013.....	368
House to deal with Second Reading of Bill (No. 205) (by leave) .....	369



## INDEX

---

Rule 31(8) – the Government House Leader announced that the Strong Public Health Care Resolution would be considered next Tuesday, August 13, 2013 .....	372
Rule 31(9) – the Opposition House Leader announced that the Repatriation Program for Manitoban International Medical Graduates (IMGs) Resolution would be considered next Thursday, August 15, 2013 .....	376
House to deal with Second Reading of Bill (No. 205) (by leave) .....	376
House to deal with Second Reading of Bill (No. 205) (by leave) .....	402
Rule 31(9) – the Opposition House Leader announced that the Manitoba’s Road to Economic Recovery Resolution would be considered next Thursday, August 22, 2013 .....	406
House to deal with Second Reading of Bill (No. 205) (by leave) .....	412
Rule 31(8) – the Government House Leader announced that the Senate of Canada Resolution would be considered next Tuesday, August 27, 2013 .....	417
House to deal with Second Reading of Bill (No. 205) (by leave) .....	425
Rule 31(9) – the Opposition House Leader announced that the Enhancing Respect for Manitobans Resolution would be considered next Thursday, August 29, 2013 .....	428
House to deal with Second Reading of Bill (No. 205) (by leave) .....	434
Rule 31(8) – the Government House Leader announced that the Investment in Flood Protection Initiatives Resolution would be considered next Tuesday, September 3, 2013 .....	439
House to deal with Second Reading of Bill (No. 210) (by leave) .....	443
Rule 31(8) – the Government House Leader announced that the Strong Public Health Care Resolution would be considered next Tuesday, September 10, 2013 .....	452
Rule 31(9) – the Opposition House Leader announced that the Declining Emergency Health Care in Manitoba Resolution would be considered next Thursday, September 12, 2013 .....	460
House to waive Private Members’ Business for Tuesday, September 10 and Thursday September 12, 2013 in order to deal with Second Reading of Government Bills (by leave) .....	468
House to deal with notices of Report Stage Amendments filed on Wednesday, September 11, 2013 by having the Report Stage Amendments distributed in the House on the morning of Thursday, September 12, 2013 during Private Members’ Business, by having the Bills listed under Report Stage Amendments on the Order Paper of Thursday, September 13, 2013 and by having the House sit until 7p.m. on Thursday, September 13, 2013. (by leave) .....	484
House to set aside the provisions of the Sessional Order for September 13, 2013 regarding Report Stage and Concurrence and Third Reading motions so that all requests for recorded votes on Report Stage amendments are deferred until 2:55 p.m. and that all requests for recorded votes on concurrence and third reading motions are deferred until 4:55 p.m., with the understanding that at both 2:55 p.m. and 4:55 p.m. the bells can ring for up to one hour on the first deferred item but that all successive deferred recorded votes are to take place without further bell ringing. (by leave) .....	532

# INDEX

## COMMITTEES OF THE HOUSE

### CROWN CORPORATIONS

First Report ( <i>Manitoba Lotteries Corporation</i> for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2011) presented.....	80-82
Second Report ( <i>Manitoba Public Insurance Corporation</i> for the fiscal year ending February 29, 2009) presented.....	82-84
Third Report ( <i>Manitoba Hydro-Electric Board</i> for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2009) presented.....	84-87
Fourth Report ( <i>Manitoba Liquor Control Commission</i> for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2010) presented.....	87-89

### HUMAN RESOURCES

First Report – (Bill No. 3) presented.....	57-59
Second Report – (Bill No. 18) reported, on division. Received, on division.....	509-520

### JUSTICE

First Report – (Bill Nos. 8, 10, 16, 21, 23, 25, 36 and 38) presented.....	379-382
--	---------

### LEGISLATIVE AFFAIRS

First Report ( <i>Re-appointment of the Conflict of Interest Commissioner; Re-appointment of the Information and Privacy Adjudicator</i> ) presented.....	68-69
Second Report ( <i>Report and Recommendations of the Judicial Compensation Committee</i> dated July 11, 2012) presented.....	70-80
Third Report ( <i>Annual Report of the Children’s Advocate</i> for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2012) presented.....	236-237
Fourth Report ( <i>Recommendation for Appointment of the Chief Electoral Officer; Process for hiring a new Auditor General and a new Ombudsman</i> ) presented.....	306-307

### PRIVATE BILLS

First Report – (Bill Nos. 204, 209, 300, 301 and 302) presented.....	414-416
--	---------

### PUBLIC ACCOUNTS

Fourth Report from 1 <sup>st</sup> Session (Auditor General's Report – <i>Audits of Government Operations</i> dated November 2009) presented.....	17-20
First Report (Auditor General's Report – <i>Operations of the Office</i> for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2012) presented.....	69-70
Second Report (Auditor General's Report – <i>Follow-Up of Previously Issued Recommendations</i> - dated January, 2012) presented.....	387-390

### SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

First Report – (Bill No. 20) presented, on division (6-4). Received, on division (33-19).....	287-295
Second Report – (Bill Nos. 2, 31, 34, 37, 40, 208 and 211) presented.....	464-468
Third Report – (Bill No. 33) presented. Received, on division (31-16).....	477-483

## COMMITTEE OF SUPPLY

House in. Proceedings interrupted at 5:00 p.m. with the understanding that the Committee of Supply would resume Friday, May 17, 2013 at 10:00 a.m.....	169
House in.....	216
House in. Proceedings interrupted at 5:00 p.m. with the understanding that the Committee of Supply would resume Friday, June 7, 2013 at 10:00 a.m.....	221

## INDEX

---

House in .....	238
House in .....	241
House in .....	261
House in .....	265
House in .....	268
House in .....	272
House in .....	276
House in. Proceedings interrupted at 5:00 p.m. with the understanding that the Committee of Supply would resume Friday, July 5, 2013 at 10:00 a.m. ....	285
House in .....	295
House in .....	299
House in .....	302
House in .....	308
House in .....	310
House in .....	313
House in .....	316
House in .....	320
Report presented (May 16, 2013 to July 18, 2013): Received, on division (34-19).....	322-337

In the section of the Committee of Supply sitting in Room 255 on June 13, 2012 considering the estimates of Finance, a voice vote was held on a motion moved by Mrs. DRIEDGER recommending that that the Minister's salary be reduced to \$1.08. Whereupon a count out vote was requested and Members sitting in Room 254 and Room 255 returned to the Chamber. A counted vote was held on the motion, which was defeated. (19-30)

In the section of the Committee of Supply sitting in Room 254 on June 17, 2013 considering the estimates of the Department of Health, a voice vote was held on a motion moved by Mr. FRIESEN recommending that the Minister's salary be reduced to \$1.08. Whereupon a count out vote was requested and Members sitting in Room 254 and Room 255 returned to the Chamber. A counted vote was held on the motion, which was defeated. (18-31)

In the section of the Committee of Supply sitting in the Chamber on June 24, 2013 considering the estimates of Executive Council, a voice vote was held on a motion moved by Mr. GOERTZEN recommending that the Premier's salary be reduced to \$1.08. Whereupon a count out vote was requested and Members sitting in Room 254 and Room 255 returned to the Chamber. A counted vote was held on the motion, which was defeated. (17-33)

In the section of the Committee of Supply sitting in the Chamber on June 26, 2013 considering the estimates of the Department of Family Services and Labour, a voice vote was held on a motion moved by Mrs. ROWAT recommending that the Minister's salary be reduced to \$1.08. Whereupon a count out vote was requested and Members sitting in Room 254 and Room 255 returned to the Chamber. A counted vote was held on the motion, which was defeated. (18-30)

## INDEX

---

In the section of the Committee of Supply sitting in Room 255 on June 27, 2013 considering the estimates of the Department of Agriculture, Food and Rural Initiatives, a voice vote was held on a motion moved by Mr. EICHLER recommending that the Minister's salary be reduced to \$1.08. Whereupon a count out vote was requested and Members sitting in Room 254 and Room 255 returned to the Chamber. A counted vote was held on the motion, which was defeated. (17-28)

In the section of the Committee of Supply sitting in Room 254 on July 2, 2013 considering the estimates of the Department of Justice, a voice vote was held on a motion moved by Mr. HELWER recommending that the Minister's salary be reduced to \$1.08. Whereupon a count out vote was requested and Members sitting in Room 254 and Room 255 returned to the Chamber. A counted vote was held on the motion, which was defeated. (19-35)

In the section of the Committee of Supply sitting in the Chamber on July 5, 2013 considering the estimates of the Department of Local Government, a voice vote was held on a motion moved by the Opposition House Leader recommending that the section of the committee rise. As per the Rules, since the Committee was sitting on a Friday and that the voice vote was not unanimous, the Chair indicated the question would be put again at the next sitting of the Committee of Supply. On July 8, the Chair ruled that no vote would be required since the motion had lapsed with the section of the Committee of Supply having risen on Friday, July 5. Whereupon the Chair's ruling was challenged and a count out vote was requested. Members sitting in Room 254 and Room 255 returned to the Chamber. A counted vote was held on the ruling, which was sustained. (33-19)

In the section of the Committee of Supply sitting in Room 254 on July 5, 2013 considering the estimates of the Department of Infrastructure and Transportation, a voice vote was held on a motion moved by Mr. EICHLER recommending that the Minister's salary be reduced to \$1.08. As per the Rules, since the voice vote was not unanimous, the chair indicated the question would be put again at the next sitting of the Committee of Supply. Whereupon a count out vote was required on July 9 and Members sitting in Room 254 and Room 255 returned to the Chamber. A counted vote was held on the motion, which was defeated. (18-30)

In the section of the Committee of Supply sitting in Room 255 on July 5, 2013 considering the estimates of the Department of Advanced Education and Literacy a voice vote was held on a motion moved by the Opposition House Leader recommending that the section of the committee rise. As per the Rules, since the Committee was sitting on a Friday and that the voice vote was not unanimous, the Chair indicated the question would be put again at the next sitting of the Committee of Supply. On July 9, the Chair ruled that no vote would be required since the motion had lapsed with the section of the Committee of Supply having risen on Friday, July 5. Whereupon the Chair's ruling was challenged and a count out vote was requested. Members sitting in Room 254 and Room 255 returned to the Chamber. A counted vote was held on the ruling, which was sustained. (30-18)

In the section of the Committee of Supply sitting in the Chamber on July 10, 2013 considering the estimates of the Department of Local Government, a voice vote was held on a motion moved by Mr. PEDERSEN recommending that the Minister's salary be reduced to \$1.08. Whereupon a count out vote was requested and Members sitting in Room 254 and Room 255 returned to the Chamber. A counted vote was held on the motion, which was defeated. (18-30)

In the section of the Committee of Supply sitting in Room 255 on July 10, 2013 considering the estimates of the Department of Advanced Education and Literacy, a voice vote was held on a motion moved by Mr. BRIESE recommending that the Minister's salary be reduced to \$1.08. Whereupon a count out vote was requested and Members sitting in Room 254 and Room 255 returned to the Chamber. A counted vote was held on the motion, which was defeated. (18-30)

## INDEX

---

In the section of the Committee of Supply sitting in the Chamber on July 10, 2013 considering the estimates of the Department of Aboriginal and Northern Affairs, a voice vote was held on a motion moved by Mrs. STEFANSON recommending that the Minister's salary be reduced to \$1.08, whereupon a count out vote was requested. As per the House agreement concluded on July 10, the vote was held over to Monday, July 15 when Members from Room 254 and Room 255 returned to the Chamber. A counted vote was held on the motion, which was defeated. (14-29)

In the section of the Committee of Supply sitting in Room 255 on July 11, 2013 considering the estimates of the Department of Education, a voice vote was held on a motion moved by Mr. GOERTZEN recommending that the Minister's salary be reduced to \$1.08. Whereupon a count out vote was requested and Members sitting in Room 254 and Room 255 returned to the Chamber. A counted vote was held on the motion, which was defeated. (18-31)

In the section of the Committee of Supply sitting in the Chamber on July 11, 2013 considering the estimates of the Department of Housing and Community Development, a voice vote was held on a motion moved by Mr. WISHART recommending that the Minister's salary be reduced to \$1.08, whereupon a count out vote was requested. As per the House agreement concluded on July 10, the vote was held over to Monday, July 15 when Members from Room 254 and Room 255 returned to the Chamber. A counted vote was held on the motion, which was defeated. (14-29)

In the section of the Committee of Supply sitting in the Chamber on July 11, 2013 considering the estimates of the Department of Innovation, Energy and Mines, a voice vote was held on a motion moved by Mr. SCHULER recommending that the Minister's salary be reduced to \$1.08, whereupon a count out vote was requested. As per the House agreement concluded on July 10, the vote was held over to Tuesday, July 16 when Members from Room 254 and Room 255 returned to the Chamber. A counted vote was held on the motion, which was defeated. (16-31)

In the section of the Committee of Supply sitting in Room 255 on July 11, 2013 considering the estimates for Entrepreneurship, Training and Trade, a voice vote was held on a motion moved by Mr. GRAYDON recommending that the Minister's salary be reduced to \$1.08, whereupon a count out vote was requested. As per the House agreement concluded on July 10, the vote was held over to Tuesday, July 16 when Members from Room 254 and Room 255 returned to the Chamber. A counted vote was held on the motion, which was defeated. (15-29)

In the section of the Committee of Supply sitting in Room 255 on July 11, 2013 considering the estimates for Immigration and Multiculturalism, a voice vote was held on a motion moved by Mrs. MITCHELSON recommending that the Minister's salary be reduced to \$1.08, whereupon a count out vote was requested. As per the House agreement concluded on July 10, the vote was held over to Tuesday, July 16 when Members from Room 254 and Room 255 returned to the Chamber. A counted vote was held on the motion, which was defeated. (15-32)

In the section of the Committee of Supply sitting in Room 255 on July 11, 2013 considering the estimates for Children and Youth Opportunities, a voice vote was held on a motion moved by Mr. SMOOK recommending that the Minister's salary be reduced to \$1.08, whereupon a count out vote was requested. As per the House agreement concluded on July 10, the vote was held over to Wednesday, July 17 when Members from Room 254 and Room 255 returned to the Chamber. A counted vote was held on the motion, which was defeated. (19-29)

In the section of the Committee of Supply sitting in Room 254 on July 11, 2013 considering the estimates for Conservation and Water Stewardship, a voice vote was held on a motion moved by Mr. MAGUIRE recommending that the Minister's salary be reduced to \$1.08, whereupon a count out vote was requested. As per the House agreement concluded on July 10, the vote was held over to Wednesday, July 17 when Members from Room 254 and Room 255 returned to the Chamber. A counted vote was held on the motion, which was defeated. (19-29)

## INDEX

---

In the section of the Committee of Supply sitting in Room 254 on July 11, 2013 considering the estimates for Healthy Living, Seniors and Consumer Affairs, a voice vote was held on a motion moved by Mr. CULLEN recommending that the Minister's salary be reduced to \$1.08, whereupon a count out vote was requested. As per the House agreement concluded on July 10, the vote was held over to Thursday, July 18 when Members from Room 254 and Room 255 returned to the Chamber. A counted vote was held on the motion, which was defeated. (17-29)

In the section of the Committee of Supply sitting in Room 254 on July 11, 2013 considering the estimates for Culture, Heritage and Tourism, a voice vote was held on a motion moved by Mr. EWASKO recommending that the Minister's salary be reduced to \$1.08, whereupon a count out vote was requested. As per the House agreement concluded on July 10, the vote was held over to Thursday, July 18 when Members from Room 254 and Room 255 returned to the Chamber. A counted vote was held on the motion, which was defeated. (16-30)

### Resolutions adopted:

Res. Nos. 1.1, 1.2, 1.3, 1.4, 1.5 and 1.6 (Legislative Assembly).....	326
Res. Nos. 2.1 and 2.2 (Executive Council).....	326
Res. Nos. 3.1, 3.2, 3.3, 3.4, 3.5, 3.6 and 3.7 (Agriculture, Food and Rural Initiatives).....	326-327
Res. Nos. 4.1, 4.2, 4.3, 4.4, 4.5, 4.6 and 4.7 (Justice) .....	327
Res. No. 6.1 (Employee Pensions and Other Costs) .....	327
Res. Nos. 7.1, 7.2, 7.3, 7.4, 7.5, 7.6, and 7.7 (Finance).....	327-328
Res. Nos. 9.1, 9.2, 9.3, 9.4, 9.5, 9.6 and 9.7 (Family Services and Labour).....	328
Res. Nos. 10.1, 10.2, 10.3, 10.4, and 10.5 (Entrepreneurship, Training and Trade).....	329
Res. Nos. 11.1 and 11.2 (Immigration and Multiculturalism).....	329
Res. Nos. 12.1, 12.2, 12.3, 12.4, 12.5, 12.6 and 12.7 (Conservation and Water Stewardship) .....	329-330
Res. Nos. 13.1, 13.2, 13.3, 13.4 and 13.5 (Local Government) .....	330
Res. Nos. 14.1, 14.2, 14.3, 14.4 and 14.5 (Culture, Heritage and Tourism).....	330-331
Res. Nos. 15.1, 15.2, 15.3, 15.4, 15.5, 15.6 and 15.7 (Infrastructure and Transportation).....	331
Res. Nos. 16.1, 16.2, 16.3, 16.4, 16.5, 16.6 and 16.7 (Education) .....	331-332
Res. Nos. 17.1 and 17.2 (Civil Service Commission) .....	332
Res. Nos. 18.1, 18.2, 18.3, 18.4, 18.5, 18.6 and 18.7 (Innovation, Energy and Mines) .....	332-333
Res. Nos. 19.1, 19.2 and 19.3 (Aboriginal and Northern Affairs).....	333
Res. Nos. 20.1, 20.2 and 20.3 (Children and Youth Opportunities).....	333
Res. Nos. 21.1, 21.2, 21.3, 21.4, 21.5, 21.6, 21.7, 21.8, 21.9 and 21.10 (Health) .....	333-334
Res. Nos. 26.1, 26.2, 26.3, 26.4 and 26.5 (Enabling Appropriations) .....	334
Res. Nos. 27.1, 27.2 and 27.3 (Other Appropriations) .....	334
Res. No. 28.1 (Sport) .....	335
Res. Nos. 30.1, 30.2, 30.3 and 30.4 (Housing and Community Development).....	335
Res. Nos. 34.1, 34.2, 34.3, 34.4 and 34.5 (Healthy Living, Seniors and Consumer Affairs) .....	335
Res. Nos. 44.1, 44.2, 44.3, 44.4, 44.5, 44.6 and 44.7 (Advanced Education and Literacy).....	335-336
House in ( <i>Interim Supply</i> ).....	337
Report presented (March 26, 2009): Interim Supply [\$7,703,032,000.00 – Part A (Operating Expenditure)] and [\$556,556,000.00 – Part B (Capital Investment)] adopted .....	337
House in ( <i>Capital Supply</i> ).....	468
Report presented. Received, on division (September 9, 2013): Capital Supply (\$2,952,495,000) adopted, on division.....	468-470
House in ( <i>Concurrence</i> ).....	470
House in ( <i>Concurrence</i> ).....	475
House in ( <i>Concurrence</i> ).....	496
Report presented (September 11, 2013): Concurrence motion. Report received, on division.....	496-497

## INDEX

---

In the combined sections of Committee of Supply meeting in the Chamber on September 11, 2013, a voice vote was held, whereupon a formal vote was requested and held on the motion previously moved by Hon. Ms. HOWARD on September 9, 2013, "THAT the Committee of Supply concur in all supply resolutions relating to the Estimates of Expenditure for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2014, which have been adopted at this session, whether by a section of the Committee of Supply or by the full Committee". The motion was carried, on division .....	496
<b>COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE (see also Appendices "A", "B", "C" and "D")</b>	
House in .....	346
Bill (No. 48) – The Interim Appropriation Act, 2013/Loi de 2013 portant affectation anticipée de crédits Considered and reported without amendment .....	346
House in .....	498
Bill (No. 49) – The Appropriation Act, 2013/Loi de 2013 portant affectation de crédits Considered and reported without amendment, on division .....	498
Bill (No. 50) – The Loan Act, 2013/Loi d'emprunt de 2013 Considered and reported without amendment, on division .....	498
<b>CONCURRENCE (see also Motions, Government)</b>	
Concurrence Motion moved in the House in accordance with subsection 11.1(28) of The Provincial Court Act .....	143
Concurrence Motion moved in Committee of Supply pursuant to Rule 78(1) reported .....	496
Concurrence Motion moved in the House pursuant to Rule 79(1). Agreed to, on division .....	497
<b>CONDOLENCES</b>	
To the family of the late:	
DRIEDGER, Albert <i>Speakers:</i> Hon. Mr. SELINGER, Mr. PALLISTER, Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS, Messrs. GOERTZEN, SMOOK and GRAYDON, Mrs. TAILLIEU, Mrs. MITCHELSON, Mr. MAGUIRE and Hon. Messrs. GERRARD and ASHTON .....	55
CHRISTIANSON, John A. <i>Speakers:</i> Hon. Mr. SELINGER and Messrs. PALLISTER and WISHART .....	56
MINAKER, George <i>Speakers:</i> Hon. Mr. SELINGER, Mr. PALLISTER, Ms. CROTHERS and Mr. SCHULER .....	56
FORBES, Thelma <i>Speakers:</i> Hon. Mr. SELINGER, Mr. PALLISTER, Hon. Ms. HOWARD, Mr. PEDERSEN, Hon. Mr. GERRARD and Mrs. ROWAT .....	59
USKIW, Samuel <i>Speakers:</i> Hon. Mr. SELINGER, Messrs. PALLISTER and GRAYDON and Hon. Messrs. CHOMIAK and GERRARD .....	59-60
DESJARDINS, Laurent <i>Speakers:</i> Hon. Mr. SELINGER, Mr. PALLISTER, Hon. Messrs. ASHTON, GERRARD and CHOMIAK and Mrs. MITCHELSON .....	60

# INDEX

---

BURRELL, Parker <i>Speakers: Hon. Mr. SELINGER, Mr. PALLISTER, Hon. Mr. KOSTYSHYN, Mrs. MITCHELSON and Hon. Messrs. STRUTHERS and GERRARD</i> .....	60
--	----

## DIVISIONS

### CONCURRENCE AND THIRD READINGS

Bill (No. 18) – September 13, 2013 Agreed to, on division (36-16) .....	548-549
Bill (No. 31) – September 13, 2013 Agreed to, on division (36-16) .....	545-546
Bill (No. 33) – September 13, 2013 Agreed to, on division (35-17) .....	544-545
Bill (No. 34) – September 13, 2013 Agreed to, on division (35-17) .....	546-547
Bill (No. 37) – September 13, 2013 Agreed to, on division (36-16) .....	547-548
Bill (No. 40) – September 13, 2013 Agreed to, on division .....	532
Bill (No. 48) – July 25, 2013 Agreed to, on division (31-18) .....	350
Bill (No. 49) – September 11, 2013 Agreed to, on division (32-17) .....	499-500
Bill (No. 50) – September 11, 2013 Agreed to, on division (32-17) .....	498-499
Bill (No. 211) – September 12, 2013 Agreed to, on division (49-0) .....	527-528

### FIRST READINGS

Bill (No. 20) – April 17, 2013 Agreed to, on division (35-18) .....	92-93
Bill (No. 33) – May 1, 2013 Agreed to, on division (32-19) .....	127-128
Bill (No. 47) – May 30, 2013 Agreed to, on division (32-19) .....	201-202
Bill (No. 49) – September 11, 2013 Agreed to, on division .....	497
Bill (No. 50) – September 11, 2013 Agreed to, on division .....	498

### HOIST MOTION

Bill (No. 20) – May 30, 2013 – Second Reading Negatived, on division (19-32) .....	205-206
---	---------



## INDEX

---

Bill (No. 33) – September 3, 2013 – Second Reading Negatived, on division (16-29) .....	452-453
<b>OTHER</b>	
Address in Reply to Throne Speech – Amendment – November 28, 2012 Negatived, on division (20-35) .....	41-43
Address in Reply to Throne Speech – Main Motion – November 29, 2012 Agreed to, on division (34-20) .....	45-46
Budget Motion – Amendment – April 26, 2013 Negatived, on division (17-36) .....	113-115
Budget Motion – Main Motion – April 26, 2013 Agreed to, on division (36-18) .....	113-115
Opposition Day Motion – Retail Sales Tax – May 1, 2013 Negatived, on division (19-33) .....	129-130
Opposition Day Motion – Retail Sales Tax related referendum – May 9, 2013 Negatived, on division (17-31) .....	151
Opposition Day Motion – Working with Manitoba municipalities – May 15, 2013 Negatived, on division (19-32) .....	164-165
Private Members’ Resolution – Integrity of the Finance Minister – May 16, 2013 Negatived, on division (19-31) .....	166-167
Committee Report – Social and Economic Development (Bill No. 20) – July 8, 2013 Received, on division (33-19) .....	287-295
Adjournment Motion (Bill No. 214) – July 11, 2013 Agreed to, on division (31-19) .....	303-304
Committee of Supply – Committee Report – July 22, 2013 Agreed to, on division (34-19) .....	336-337
Adjournment of the House – August 8, 2013 Negatived, on division (18-30) .....	382-383
Adjournment Motion (Bill No. 4) – August 8, 2013 Negatived, on division (17-30) .....	383-384
Adjournment of the House – August 15, 2013 Negatived, on division (17-31) .....	405-406
Committee of Supply – Capital Supply Report – September 9, 2013 Agreed to, on division .....	468-470
Committee Report – Social and Economic Development (Bill No. 33) – September 11, 2013 Received, on division (31-16) .....	477-483
Committee of Supply – Committee Report – Concurrence Motion – September 11, 2013 Agreed to, on division .....	496-497
Capital Supply Motion (\$2,952,495,000) Agreed to, on division .....	497
Concurrence Motion pursuant to Rule 79(1). Agreed to, on division .....	497

## INDEX

Main Supply Motion [\$11,850,818,000 – Part A (Operating Expenditure)] and [\$695,695,000 – Part B (Capital Investment)] Agreed to, on division.....	497
Committee of the Whole – Bill (No. 49) – The Appropriation Act, 2013/Loi de 2013 portant affectation de crédits Agreed to, on division.....	498
Committee of the Whole – Bill (No. 50) – The Loan Act, 2013/Loi d’emprunt de 2013 Agreed to, on division.....	498
Committee Report – Human Resources (Bill No. 18) – September 12, 2013 Received, on division.....	509-520
<b>PROCEDURE</b>	
April 23, 2013 – Challenge to Speaker's Ruling Sustained, on division (31-18) .....	102-103
April 23, 2013 – Challenge to Speaker's Ruling Sustained, on division (33-17) .....	103-104
April 23, 2013 – Challenge to Speaker's Ruling Sustained, on division (32-17) .....	104-105
April 29, 2013 – Challenge to Speaker's Ruling Sustained, on division (35-15) .....	117
April 29, 2013 – Challenge to Speaker's Ruling Sustained, on division (36-15) .....	118
April 30, 2013 – Challenge to Speaker's Ruling Sustained, on division (34-19) .....	124-125
April 30, 2013 – Challenge to Speaker's Ruling Sustained, on division (34-18) .....	125-126
May 2, 2013 – Challenge to Speaker's Ruling Sustained, on division (29-18) .....	134-135
May 6, 2013 – Challenge to Speaker's Ruling Sustained, on division (31-18) .....	138-139
May 21, 2013 – Challenge to Speaker's Ruling Sustained, on division .....	173-174
May 30, 2013 – Challenge to Speaker's Ruling Sustained, on division (32-19) .....	203-204
June 5, 2013 – Challenge to Speaker's Ruling Sustained, on division (33-19) .....	215-216
June 6, 2013 – Challenge to Speaker's Ruling Sustained, on division (31-16) .....	218-219
June 10, 2013 – Challenge to Speaker's Ruling Sustained, on division (52-0) .....	224-225
June 12, 2013 – Challenge to Speaker's Ruling Sustained, on division .....	231

## INDEX

June 18, 2013 – Challenge to Speaker's Ruling Sustained, on division (29-16) .....	245-247
June 24, 2013 – Challenge to Speaker's Ruling Sustained, on division (34-17) .....	260
July 3, 2013 – Challenge to Speaker's Ruling Sustained, on division (33-19) .....	279
July 11, 2013 – Challenge to Speaker's Ruling Sustained, on division .....	307-308
August 29, 2013 – Challenge to Speaker's Ruling Sustained, on division (47-0) .....	446-447
<b>REASONED AMENDMENT</b>	
Bill (No. 20) – May 14, 2013 – Second Reading Negated, on division (19-31) .....	161-162
<b>REPORT STAGE AMENDMENTS</b>	
Bill (No. 10) – Mr. HELWER – September 5, 2013 Amendment [clause 3] – Negated, on division .....	460-461
Bill (No. 18) – Mr. GOERTZEN – September 13, 2013 Amendment [#1 – clause 3] – Negated, on division (17-34).....	538-540
Amendment [#2 – clause 4(1) after clause (k.2)] – Negated, on division .....	534
Amendment [#3 – clause 4(1) after clause (t)] – Negated, on division (18-33) .....	540-541
Amendment [#4 – clause 4(1) after clause (z)] – Negated, on division .....	535
Amendment [#5 – clause 4(2)] – Negated, on division (18-33) .....	541-542
Amendment [#6 – clause 5(1)] – Negated, on division (18-33) .....	542-543
Amendment [#7 – clause 5] – Negated, on division .....	536
Amendment [#8 – clause 6] – Negated, on division .....	536-537
Amendment [#9 – clause 8] – Negated, on division .....	537
Bill (No. 20) – Mr. CULLEN – August 12, 2013 Amendment [#1 – clause 2(2.1) - <i>shopping</i> ] – Negated, on division (17-33) .....	391-392
Bill (No. 20) – Mr. CULLEN – August 13, 2013 Amendment [#2 – clause 2(2.1) - <i>seniors</i> ] – Negated, on division .....	396
Amendment [#3 – part 2] – Negated, on division (16-31) .....	397
Bill (No. 20) – Mr. CULLEN – August 14, 2013 Amendment [#4 – clause 4(4.1)] – Negated, on division.....	399-400
Amendment [#5 – clause 5(3)] – Negated, on division (17-31) .....	400-401
Bill (No. 20) – Mr. HELWER – August 19, 2013 Amendment [#1 – clause 2(2.1) - <i>inflation</i> ] – Negated, on division .....	409
Amendment [#2 – clause 2.1] – Negated, on division.....	409
Amendment [#3 – subsection 67.3(1)] – Negated, on division (18-32) .....	410-411
Bill (No. 20) – Mr. HELWER – August 20, 2013 Amendment [#4 – clause 4(3)] – Negated, on division.....	417
Amendment [#5 – clause 4(3) - <i>Hydro</i> ] – Negated, on division.....	417
Bill (No. 20) – Mrs. STEFANSON – August 20, 2013 Amendment [#1 – part 1] – Negated, on division .....	417-418
Amendment [#2 – clause 4(3)] – Negated, on division (18-29) .....	418

## INDEX

Bill (No. 20) – Mrs. STEFANSON – August 21, 2013	
Amendment [#3 – part 3] – Negatived, on division (17-29) .....	422-423
Amendment [#4 – clause 5(1)] – Negatived, on division .....	423
Amendment [#5 – title] – Negatived, on division .....	423
Bill (No. 20) – Mrs. DREIDGER – August 21, 2013	
Amendment [#1 – clause 2(2.1) - <i>poor</i> ] – Negatived, on division .....	424
Bill (No. 20) – Mrs. DREIDGER – August 22, 2013	
Amendment [#2 – clause 2(2.1) - <i>retail sales</i> ] – Negatived, on division .....	428-429
Amendment [#3 – subsection 67.3(1)] – Negatived, on division .....	429
Amendment [#4 – subsection 67.3(4) - <i>budget</i> ] – Negatived, on division .....	429
Amendment [#5 – subsection 67.3(4) - <i>audit</i> ] – Negatived, on division (16-30) .....	429-430
Bill (No. 21) – Mr. HELWER – September 5, 2013	
Amendment [clause 4(2)] – Negatived, on division .....	461
Amendment [clause 5(3)] – Negatived, on division .....	461-462
Bill (No. 23) – Mr. HELWER – September 5, 2013	
Amendment [clause 3(1)] – Negatived, on division .....	462
Amendment [clause 3(3)] – Negatived, on division .....	462
Bill (No. 33) – Mr. BRIESE – September 12, 2013	
Amendment [#3 – clause 7(1)] – Negatived, on division .....	521-522
Amendment [#4 – clause 7(2)] – Negatived, on division .....	522
Bill (No. 33) – Mr. PEDERSEN – September 12, 2013	
Amendment [#1 – clause 1(1)] – Negatived, on division .....	523
Amendment [#2 – clause 4] – Negatived, on division .....	523
Amendment [#3 – clause 3(1)] – Negatived, on division .....	523
Amendment [#4 – clause 3(4)] – Negatived, on division .....	523
Amendment [#5 – clause 3(6)] – Negatived, on division .....	524
Bill (No. 33) – Mr. GRAYDON – September 12, 2013	
Amendment [#1 – clause 7(2)] – Negatived, on division .....	524
Amendment [#2 – clause 12(2)] – Negatived, on division .....	524
Amendment [#4 – clause 14] – Negatived, on division .....	525
 SECOND READINGS	
Bill (No. 18) – August 29, 2013	
Agreed to, on division (32-14) .....	447-448
Bill (No. 20) – June 20, 2013	
Agreed to, on division (32-17) .....	255-256
Bill (No. 33) – September 5, 2013	
Agreed to, on division (30-18) .....	459-460
Bill (No. 47) – September 10, 2013	
Agreed to, on division .....	474
Bill (No. 48) – July 24, 2013	
Agreed to, on division (30-19) .....	345-346
Bill (No. 49) – September 11, 2013	
Agreed to, on division .....	497
Bill (No. 50) – September 11, 2013	
Agreed to, on division .....	498

# INDEX

## DOCUMENTS TABLED – NOT SESSIONAL PAPERS (see Appendix "E")

### ELECTION OF MEMBERS

Introduction of Mr. Brian PALLISTER .....	17
---	----

### ESTIMATES (see also Committee of Supply and Concurrence)

Presented and referred to Committee of Supply	
Capital Supply – S.P. No. 25.....	90
Main Supply – S.P. No. 24.....	90
Sequence for consideration of	
Hon. Ms. HOWARD – S.P. No. 31 .....	113

### FEES, REFUND OF

Ordered by House re: Bill 301 (by leave) .....	506
Ordered by House re: Bill 302 (by leave) .....	507
Ordered by House re: Bill 300 (by leave). Agreed to, unanimously .....	507

### GRIEVANCE, MATTERS OF

Mr. SCHULER – Taxes, PST increase .....	119
Mr. GRAYDON – St. Jean Baptiste Bridge.....	134
Mr. BRIESE – Lake Manitoba flood victims.....	139
Mr. CULLEN – 2013 budget .....	139
Mrs. STEFANSON – Taxation, PST increase .....	144
Mr. FRIESEN – PST increase .....	147
Mr. EWASKO –Highways around Powerview/Pine Falls .....	169
Mr. PEDERSEN – 10 year anniversary of the BSE crisis .....	174
Mrs. DRIEDGER – PST increase .....	179
Mrs. MITCHELSON – Government mismanagement and broken promises .....	191
Mr. HELWER – Condition of Highway no. 10.....	191
Mr. EICHLER – Flood compensation .....	204
Mr. GOERTZEN – Government disrespecting the law .....	208
Mr. MAGUIRE – Manitoba Hydro planning and programming deficiencies.....	213
Mr. SMOOK – Government lack of credibility .....	216
Mr. WISHART – Disregard for flood victims .....	220
Mrs. ROWAT – Lack of Government support for children with autism.....	229

### HOIST AMENDMENTS – SECOND READING

Bill (No. 20) – The Manitoba Building and Renewal Funding and Fiscal Management Act (Various Acts Amended)/Loi sur le financement du renouvellement des infrastructures et la gestion financière (modification de diverses dispositions législatives)	
Amendment – Mr. HELWER. Ruled in order.	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. GOERTZEN. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. GOERTZEN .....	179-180
<i>Debate continued:</i> Leave denied to consider the amendment as it had been printed. Mr. Speaker ruled the amendment out of order.....	185

## INDEX

Bill (No. 20) – The Manitoba Building and Renewal Funding and Fiscal Management Act (Various Acts Amended)/Loi sur le financement du renouvellement des infrastructures et la gestion financière (modification de diverses dispositions législatives)	
Amendment – Mr. MAGUIRE. Ruled in order.	
<i>Debate</i> : Mr. GOERTZEN. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. GOERTZEN .....	185-186
<i>Debate continued</i> : Messrs. GOERTZEN, SCHULER, EWASKO, SMOOK and CULLEN. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. CULLEN .....	196
<i>Debate continued</i> : Messrs. CULLEN, GRAYDON, EICHLER, PEDERSEN, BRIESE, FRIESEN and WISHART. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. WISHART.....	198-199
<i>Debate continued</i> : Leave denied to have the matter remain in the name of Mr. WISHART; Mrs. MITCHELSON, Mr. HELWER and Mrs. DRIEDGER. Negatived, on division (19-32).....	205-206
Bill (No. 33) – The Municipal Modernization Act (Municipal Amalgamations)/Loi sur la modernisation des municipalités (fusions)	
Amendment – Mr. GOERTZEN. Ruled in order.	
<i>Debate</i> : Mr. MAGUIRE. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. MAGUIRE .....	191-192
<i>Debate continued</i> : Leave denied to have the matter remain in the name of Mr. MAGUIRE; Hon. Mr. GERRARD and Messrs. CULLEN, EWASKO and EICHLER. Negatived, on division (16-29) .....	452-453

### HOIST AMENDMENTS – THIRD READING

Bill (No. 20) – The Manitoba Building and Renewal Funding and Fiscal Management Act (Various Acts Amended)/Loi sur le financement du renouvellement des infrastructures et la gestion financière (modification de diverses dispositions législatives)	
Amendment – Mr. GOERTZEN. Ruled in order.	
<i>Debate</i> : Mr. SMOOK. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. SMOOK .....	439
<i>Debate continued</i> : Mr. SMOOK, Mrs. ROWAT, Mrs. MITCHELSON and Messrs. BRIESE and PEDERSEN. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. PEDERSEN .....	442
<i>Debate continued</i> : Mr. PEDERSEN, Mrs. STEFANSON and Mr. HELWER. Adjourned (Hon. Ms. HOWARD) <i>To be reinstated during the 3<sup>rd</sup> Session of the 40<sup>th</sup> Legislature</i> .....	446

### INTERSESSIONAL AND SESSIONAL PAPERS (see Appendices "F" and "G")

#### LIEUTENANT GOVERNOR

Convenes Legislature (November 19, 2012)	
Assented to Bill: December 6, 2012 .....	66
Assented to Bill: July 29, 2013.....	354
Assented to Bills: September 11, 2013 .....	500-501
Assented to Bills: September 13, 2013 .....	549-551

#### McFADYEN, HUGH

Resignation of.....	16
---------------------	----

### MEMBERS' STATEMENTS (see Appendix "I")

## INDEX

### MESSAGES, BILLS (see also Appendices "A", "C" and "G")

Bill (No. 5) – S.P. No. 14.....	52
Bill (No. 12) – S.P. No. 12.....	49
Bill (No. 13) – S.P. No. 13.....	51
Bill (No. 20) – S.P. No. 38.....	145
Bill (No. 26) – S.P. No. 46.....	189
Bill (No. 34) – S.P. No. 44.....	187
Bill (No. 38) – S.P. No. 40.....	177
Bill (No. 39) – S.P. No. 45.....	188
Bill (No. 43) – S.P. No. 41.....	177
Bill (No. 44) – S.P. No. 47.....	189
Bill (No. 47) – S.P. No. 99.....	463

### MESSAGES, TRANSMITTING ESTIMATES

Capital Supply – S.P. No. 25 .....	90
Main Supply – S.P. No. 24 .....	90

### MINISTERIAL STATEMENTS (see Appendix "J")

### MOTIONS, GOVERNMENT – RESOLVED (see also Resolutions, Government)

Adjournment of House (Hon. Mr. SELINGER).....	15
Adjournment of House (Hon. Ms. HOWARD).....	90
Capital Supply (\$2,952,495,000) (Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS). Agreed to, on division.....	497
Concurrence Motion moved in the House pursuant to Rule 79(1). Agreed to, on division.....	497
Concurrence Motion moved in the House regarding the Report of the Standing Committee on Legislative Affairs respecting the Judicial Compensation in accordance with subsection 11.1(28) of The Provincial Court Act (Hon. Ms. HOWARD) <i>Debate:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD. Agreed to.....	144
Fees paid with respect to Bill (No. 301) – The Jewish Foundation of Manitoba Amendment Act/Loi modifiant la Fondation dénommée « The Jewish Foundation of Manitoba », be refunded, less the cost of printing (Ms. BLADY) (by leave).....	506
Fees paid with respect to Bill (No. 302) – Les Franciscaines Missionnaires de Marie Incorporation Amendment Act/Loi modifiant la Loi constituant en corporation Les Franciscaines Missionnaires de Marie, be refunded, less the cost of printing (Mr. GAUDREAU) (by leave).....	507
Fees paid with respect to Bill (No. 300) – The Brandon Area Foundation Incorporation Amendment Act/Loi modifiant la Loi constituant en corporation « The Brandon Area Foundation », be refunded, less the cost of printing (Mr. CALDWELL) (by leave) Agreed to, unanimously.....	507
Interim Supply [\$7,703,032,000.00 – Part A (Operating Expenditure)] and [\$556,556,000.00 – Part B (Capital Investment)] (Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS) .....	337
Main Supply [\$11,850,818,000 – Part A (Operating Expenditure)] and [\$695,695,000 – Part B (Capital Investment)] (Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS). Agreed to, on division.....	497
Sessional Order regarding the 2 <sup>nd</sup> and 3 <sup>rd</sup> Sessions of the 40 <sup>th</sup> Legislature (Hon. Ms. HOWARD) (by leave) <i>Debate:</i> Agreed to.....	484-496

## INDEX

Throne Speech, consideration of (Hon. Mr. SELINGER) .....	15
<b>MOTIONS, PRIVATE MEMBERS'</b>	
Adjournment of the House (Mr. GOERTZEN) Negatived, on division (18-30) .....	382-383
Adjournment of the House (Mr. HELWER) Negatived, on division (17-31) .....	405-406
Bill (No. 4) – Adjournment of Second Reading Debate (Mr. GOERTZEN) Negatived, on division (17-30) .....	383-384
Bill (No. 214) – Adjournment of Second Reading Debate (Mr. DEWAR) Agreed to, on division. (31-19) .....	303-304
<b>OPPOSITION DAY MOTIONS</b>	
Finding savings and efficiencies within government rather than raising the Retail Sales Tax (known as the Provincial Sales Tax) from 7% to 8%. (Mr. GOERTZEN) <i>Debate:</i> Mr. GOERTZEN, Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS, Mr. PALLISTER, Hon. Ms. OSWALD, Mrs. DRIEDGER, Hon. Ms. ALLAN, Mr. SCHULER, Hon. Ms. HOWARD, Mrs. STEFANSON, Hon. Mr. CHOMIAK and Mr. HELWER. Negatived, on division (19-33) .....	129-130
Seeking the approval of Manitobans through a referendum before raising the Retail Sales Tax (Mrs. STEFANSON) <i>Debate:</i> Mrs. STEFANSON, Hon. Mr. ASHTON, Mr. SMOOK, Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS and Messrs. GRAYDON, WISHART, PEDERSEN, EICHLER, EWASKO, CULLEN, BRIESE and HELWER. Negatived, on division (17-31) .....	151
Working co-operatively and respectfully with Manitoba municipalities (Mr. PEDERSEN) <i>Debate:</i> Mr. PEDERSEN, Hon. Mr. LEMIEUX, Mr. BRIESE, Hon. Mr. ASHTON, Messrs. MAGUIRE and CALDWELL, Mrs. ROWAT, Hon. Mr. BJORNSON, Messrs. EICHLER, EWASKO and CULLEN, Mrs. DRIEDGER, Hon. Mr. GERRARD and Mr. GRAYDON. Negatived, on division (19-32) .....	164-165
<b>PAGES</b>	
Appointment of Ms. Emily BIGGAR, Ms. Nicole GOMES .....	452
Appointment of Ms. Maya JANZEN .....	455
Appointment of Ms. Destiny OLIVEIRA, Mr. Nicolas CONNOR .....	459
Appointment of Ms. Cara MCCASKILL, Mr. Rory CHURCHILL-HENRY .....	484
Appointment of Mr. Eric SHILLBERG, Mr. Mathieu JUBINVILLE .....	520
<b>PETITIONS, GENERAL (see Appendix "H")</b>	
<b>PRIVILEGE, MATTERS OF (see SPEAKER'S RULINGS)</b>	
<b>REASONED AMENDMENT – SECOND READING</b>	
Bill (No. 20) – The Manitoba Building and Renewal Funding and Fiscal Management Act (Various Acts Amended)/Loi sur le financement du renouvellement des infrastructures et la gestion financière (modification de diverses dispositions législatives) Amendment – Mrs. DRIEDGER. Ruled in order. <i>Debate:</i> Messrs. SCHULER, PEDERSEN and FRIESEN. Allowed to remain Open .....	144-145



## INDEX

<i>Debate continued:</i> Mr. MAGUIRE, Hon. Mr. GERRARD and Messrs. EWASKO, SMOOK and BRIESE. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. BRIESE .....	148
<i>Debate continued:</i> Messrs. BRIESE and EICHLER, Mrs. MITCHELSON and Mr. GRAYDON. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. GRAYDON .....	157
<i>Debate continued:</i> Messrs. GRAYDON, CULLEN, WISHART and GOERTZEN, Mrs. STEFANSON, Mrs. ROWAT, and Mr. HELWER. Negatived, on division (19-31).....	161-162

### REPORTS – TABLED INTERSESSIONALLY (see Appendix "F")

### REPORTS – TABLED SESSIONALLY (see Appendix "G")

### REPORT STAGE (see also Appendices "A", "B", "C" and "D")

#### **(No. 10) – The Correctional Services Amendment Act/Loi modifiant la Loi sur les services correctionnels**

Amendment [clause 3] – Mr. HELWER	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. HELWER and Hon. Mr. SWAN. Negatived, on division.....	460-461

#### **(No. 18) – The Public Schools Amendment Act (Safe and Inclusive Schools)/Loi modifiant la Loi sur les écoles publiques (milieux scolaires favorisant la sécurité et l'inclusivité)**

Amendment [#1 – clause 3] – Mr. GOERTZEN	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. GOERTZEN, Hon. Ms. ALLAN, Mr. FRIESEN and Hon. Mr. GERRARD. Division deferred. ....	532-534
Negatived, on division (17-34). ....	538-540
Amendment [#2 – clause 4(1) after clause (k.2)] – Mr. GOERTZEN	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. GOERTZEN, Hon. Ms. ALLAN and Mr. EWASKO. Negatived, on division .....	534
Amendment [#3 – clause 4(1) after clause (t)] – Mr. GOERTZEN	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. GOERTZEN and Hon. Ms. ALLAN. Division deferred.....	534
Negatived, on division (18-33). ....	540-541
Amendment [#4 – clause 4(1) after clause (z)] – Mr. GOERTZEN	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. GOERTZEN and Hon. Ms. ALLAN. Negatived, on division.....	535
Amendment [#5 – clause 4(2)] – Mr. GOERTZEN	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. GOERTZEN, Hon. Ms. ALLAN, Hon. Mr. GERRARD and Mr. FRIESEN. Division deferred. ....	535
Negatived, on division (18-33). ....	541-542
Amendment [#6 – clause 5(1)] – Mr. GOERTZEN	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. GOERTZEN, Hon. Ms. ALLAN and Mr. FRIESEN. Division deferred. ....	535-536
Negatived, on division (18-33). ....	542-543
Amendment [#7 – clause 5] – Mr. GOERTZEN	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. GOERTZEN, Hon. Ms. ALLAN and Mr. EWASKO. Negatived, on division .....	536
Amendment [#8 – clause 6] – Mr. GOERTZEN	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. GOERTZEN, Hon. Ms. ALLAN and Mr. FRIESEN. Negatived, on division .....	536-537
Amendment [#9 – clause 8] – Mr. GOERTZEN	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. GOERTZEN and Hon. Ms. ALLAN. Negatived, on division.....	537

#### **(No. 20) – The Manitoba Building and Renewal Funding and Fiscal Management Act (Various Acts Amended)/Loi sur le financement du renouvellement des infrastructures et la gestion financière (modification de diverses dispositions législatives)**

Amendment [#1 – clause 2(2.1) - <i>shopping</i> ] – Mr. CULLEN	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. CULLEN, Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS, Mr. GRAYDON, Mrs. DRIEDGER, Messrs. MAGUIRE and FRIESEN, Hon. Mr. GERRARD and Mr. BRIESE. Negatived, on division (17-33).....	391-392
Amendment [#2 – clause 2(2.1) - <i>seniors</i> ] – Mr. CULLEN	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. CULLEN, Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS, Mrs. DRIEDGER, Mr. HELWER, Mrs. STEFANSON and Hon. Mr. GERRARD. Negatived, on division.....	396
Amendment [#3 – part 2] – Mr. CULLEN	
<i>Debate:</i> Messrs. CULLEN, GOERTZEN and EWASKO. Negatived, on division (16-31).....	397

## INDEX

Amendment [#4 – clause 4(4.1)] – Mr. CULLEN <i>Debate:</i> Mr. CULLEN, Mrs. DRIEDGER, Messrs. WISHART and EICHLER, Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS and Mr. SCHULER. Negatived, on division.....	399-400
Amendment [#5 – clause 5(3)] – Mr. CULLEN <i>Debate:</i> Mr. CULLEN. Negatived, on division (17-31).....	400-401
Amendment [#1 – clause 2(2.1) – <i>inflation</i> ] – Mr. HELWER <i>Debate:</i> Mr. HELWER, Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS, Mrs. DRIEDGER, and Hon. Mr. GERRARD. Negatived, on division .....	409
Amendment [#2 – clause 2.1] – Mr. HELWER <i>Debate:</i> Mr. HELWER, Mrs. DRIEDGER, Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS and Mr. PEDERSEN. Negatived, on division .....	409
Amendment [#3 – subsection 67.3(1)] – Mr. HELWER <i>Debate:</i> Mr. HELWER and Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS. Negatived, on division (18-32).....	410-411
Amendment [#4 – clause 4(3)] – Mr. HELWER <i>Debate:</i> Mr. HELWER, Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS, Mrs. ROWAT, Mrs. DRIEDGER and Mr. GRAYDON. Negatived, on division.....	417
Amendment [#5 – clause 4(3) - <i>Hydro</i> ] – Mr. HELWER <i>Debate:</i> Messrs. HELWER and SCHULER. Negatived, on division .....	417
Amendment [#1 – part 1] – Mrs. STEFANSON <i>Debate:</i> Mrs. STEFANSON and Mr. BRIESE. Negatived, on division.....	417-418
Amendment [#2 – clause 4(3)] – Mrs. STEFANSON <i>Debate:</i> Mrs. STEFANSON and Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS. Negatived, on division (18-29) .....	418
Amendment [#3 – part 3] – Mrs. STEFANSON <i>Debate:</i> Mrs. STEFANSON and Mr. SMOOK. Negatived, on division (17-29) .....	422-423
Amendment [#4 – clause 5(1)] – Mrs. STEFANSON <i>Debate:</i> Mrs. STEFANSON. Negatived, on division .....	423
Amendment [#5 – title] – Mrs. STEFANSON <i>Debate:</i> Mrs. STEFANSON and Mr. WISHART. Negatived, on division.....	423
Amendment [#1 – clause 2(2.1) - <i>poor</i> ] – Mrs. DRIEDGER <i>Debate:</i> Mrs. DRIEDGER and Hon. Mr. GERRARD. Negatived, on division.....	424
Amendment [#2 – clause 2(2.1) - <i>retail sales</i> ] – Mrs. DRIEDGER <i>Debate:</i> Mrs. DRIEDGER, Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS and Messrs. FRIESEN and EWASKO. Negatived, on division .....	428-429
Amendment [#3 – subsection 67.3(1)] – Mrs. DRIEDGER <i>Debate:</i> Mrs. DRIEDGER and Mr. EICHLER. Negatived, on division .....	429
Amendment [#4 – subsection 67.3(4) - <i>budget</i> ] – Mrs. DRIEDGER <i>Debate:</i> Mrs. DRIEDGER and Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS. Negatived, on division.....	429
Amendment [#5 – subsection 67.3(4) - <i>audit</i> ] – Mrs. DRIEDGER <i>Debate:</i> Mrs. DRIEDGER. Negatived, on division (16-30).....	429-430
 <b>(No. 21) – The Highway Traffic Amendment Act (Impoundment of Vehicles — Ignition-Interlock Program)/Loi modifiant le Code de la route (mise en fourrière des véhicules — programme de verrouillage du système de démarrage)</b>	
Amendment [#1 – clause 4(2)] – Mr. HELWER <i>Debate:</i> Mr. HELWER and Hon. Mr. SWAN. Negatived, on division.....	461
Amendment [#2 – clause 5(3)] – Mr. HELWER <i>Debate:</i> Mr. HELWER and Hon. Mr. SWAN. Negatived, on division.....	461-462
 <b>(No. 23) – The Highway Traffic Amendment Act (Increased Sanctions for Street Racing)/Loi modifiant le Code de la route (sanctions accrues en matière de courses sur route)</b>	
Amendment [#1 – clause 3(1)] – Mr. HELWER <i>Debate:</i> Mr. HELWER and Hon. Mr. SWAN. Negatived, on division.....	462
Amendment [#2 – clause 3(3)] – Mr. HELWER <i>Debate:</i> Mr. HELWER, Hon. Mr. SWAN and Mr. GOERTZEN. Negatived, on division .....	462

## INDEX

### (No. 33) – The Municipal Modernization Act (Municipal Amalgamations)/Loi sur la modernisation des municipalités (fusions)

Amendment [#1 – clause 4(2)] – Mr. BRIESE	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. BRIESE and Hon. Mr. LEMIEUX. Agreed to .....	521
Amendment [#2 – clause 5(2)] – Mr. BRIESE	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. BRIESE and Hon. Mr. LEMIEUX. Agreed to .....	521
Amendment [#3 – clause 7(1)] – Mr. BRIESE	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. BRIESE and Hon. Mr. LEMIEUX. Negatived, on division .....	521-522
Amendment [#4 – clause 7(2)] – Mr. BRIESE	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. BRIESE, Hon. Mr. LEMIEUX and Mr. PEDERSEN. Negatived, on division.....	522
Amendment [#1 – clause 1(1)] – Mr. PEDERSEN	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. PEDERSEN, Hon. Mr. LEMIEUX, Mr. EICHLER, Hon. Mr. GERRARD and Mr. GRAYDON. Negatived, on division.....	523
Amendment [#2 – clause 2] – Mr. PEDERSEN	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. PEDERSEN, Hon. Mr. LEMIEUX and Mr. EICHLER. Negatived, on division .....	523
Amendment [#3 – clause 3(1)] – Mr. PEDERSEN	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. PEDERSEN, Hon. Mr. LEMIEUX and Messrs. EICHLER and GRAYDON. Negatived, on division .....	523
Amendment [#4 – clause 3(4)] – Mr. PEDERSEN	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. PEDERSEN, Hon. Mr. LEMIEUX and Mr. GRAYDON. Negatived, on division.....	523
Amendment [#5 – clause 3(6)] – Mr. PEDERSEN	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. PEDERSEN and Hon. Mr. LEMIEUX. Negatived, on division .....	524
Amendment [#1 – clause 7(2)] – Mr. GRAYDON	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. GRAYDON, Hon. Mr. LEMIEUX and Mr. PEDERSEN. Negatived, on division.....	524
Amendment [#2 – clause 12(2)] – Mr. GRAYDON	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. GRAYDON and Hon. Mr. LEMIEUX. Negatived, on division .....	524
Amendment [#3 – clause 13] – Mr. GRAYDON	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. GRAYDON and Hon. Mr. LEMIEUX. Agreed to .....	524-525
Amendment [#4 – clause 14] – Mr. GRAYDON	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. GRAYDON, Hon. Mr. LEMIEUX and Mr. PEDERSEN. Negatived, on division.....	525

### RESIGNATION OF MEMBER

MCFADYEN, Hugh (Constituency of Fort Whyte) .....	16
TAILLIEU, Mavis (Constituency of Morris) .....	67

### RESOLUTIONS, PRIVATE MEMBERS' – RESOLVED

4-H – (No. 10) (Mr. PEDERSEN)	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. PEDERSEN, Hon. Mr. KOSTYSHYN, Mr. EICHLER, Ms. WIGHT, Mr. BRIESE, Hon. Ms. IRVIN-ROSS, and Messrs. GRAYDON, MAGUIRE, CALDWELL, SMOOK and WISHART. Agreed to, unanimously.....	181-182
100 <sup>th</sup> Anniversary of the Provincial Exhibition of Manitoba's "Dome Building" – (No. 5) (Mr. CALDWELL)	
<i>Debate:</i> Messrs. CALDWELL and HELWER, Hon. Ms. HOWARD, Mrs. ROWAT, Hon. Ms. ALLAN, Mr. MAGUIRE, Ms. WIGHT and Mr. CULLEN. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. CULLEN .....	141-142
<i>Debate continued:</i> Mr. CULLEN, Hon. Mr. KOSTYSHYN, Mr. BRIESE, Hon. Ms. MARCELINO (Logan) and Messrs. WISHART, PEDERSEN and PETERSEN. Agreed to, unanimously .....	412-413
Integrity of the Finance Minister – (No. 8) (Mr. CULLEN)	
<i>Debate:</i> Mr. CULLEN, Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS, Mr. EICHLER, Hon. Ms. HOWARD and Messrs. GRAYDON, NEVAKSHONOFF and GOERTZEN. Negatived, on division (19-31) .....	166-167

## INDEX

---

<p>Matrimonial Property Rights on Reserves – (No. 2) (Mr. PALLISTER)  <i>Debate:</i> Mr. PALLISTER, Hon. Mr. SWAN, Mrs. STEFANSON and Hon. Mr. ROBINSON.                      Amendment - Hon. Mr. ROBINSON. Ruled in order. <i>Debate continued (amendment):</i> Mr. PALLISTER (by leave). Agreed to. <i>Debate continued (main motion, as amended):</i> Hon. Mr. ROBINSON (by leave), Mrs. ROWAT and Hon. Mr. GERRARD. Agreed to, unanimously .....</p>	61-62
<p>Nick Ternette – (No. 7) – (Mr. ALTEMEYER)  <i>Debate:</i> Mr. ALTEMEYER, Mrs. ROWAT, Hon. Ms. HOWARD and Messrs. GOERTZEN, GAUDREAU and ALLUM. Agreed to, unanimously .....</p>	158-159
<p>Nutritional Experiments on Aboriginal Peoples – (No. 28) – (Mr. WHITEHEAD)  <i>Debate:</i> Mr. WHITEHEAD, Mrs. STEFANSON, Hon. Mr. ROBINSON, Mr. FRIESEN, Hon. Mr. ASHTON and Messrs. WISHART and PETERSEN. Agreed to, unanimously.....</p>	357-358
<p>Supporting Malala’s Mission – (No. 30) – (Mr. JHA)  <i>Debate:</i> Mr. JHA, Mrs. DRIEDGER, Ms. WIGHT, Hon. Mr. GERRARD, Messrs. PETERSEN and GOERTZEN and Ms. BLADY. Agreed to, unanimously .....</p>	369-370
<p>WE Day – (No. 1) – (Ms. WIGHT)  <i>Debate:</i> Ms. WIGHT, Mr. SMOOK, Hon. Mr. CHIEF and Messrs. EWASKO and WIEBE. Agreed to .....</p>	53-54
<b>RESOLUTIONS, PRIVATE MEMBERS’ – DEBATED</b>	
<p>Approach to Crime – (No. 29) (Mr. EICHLER)  <i>Debate:</i> Mr. EICHLER, Hon. Mr. SWAN, Mr. GOERTZEN, Ms. WIGHT, Mr. HELWER and Hon. Mr. RONDEAU. Allowed to remain in the name of Hon. Mr. RONDEAU .....</p>	365-366
<p>Class Size Initiatives – (No. 13) (Ms. CROTHERS)  <i>Debate:</i> Ms. CROTHERS, Mr. GOERTZEN, Hon. Ms. ALLAN, Mr. FRIESEN, Ms. BRAUN and Messrs. EWASKO, PETERSEN and CULLEN. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. CULLEN .....</p>	210-211
<p>Decade of Mismanagement within Manitoba’s Child Welfare System – (No. 16) (Mrs. ROWAT)  <i>Debate:</i> Mrs. ROWAT, Hon. Ms. HOWARD, Mrs. MITCHELSON, Ms. WIGHT and Hon. Messrs. GERRARD and CHIEF. Allowed to remain in the name of Hon. Mr. CHIEF.....</p>	234-235
<p>Declining Emergency Health care in Manitoba – (No. 12) (Mr. FRIESEN)  <i>Debate:</i> Mr. FRIESEN, Hon. Ms. OSWALD, Mr. SMOOK, Ms. WIGHT, Mr. GRAYDON, Ms. BLADY and Hon. Messrs. GERRARD and CHOMIAK. Allowed to remain in the name of Hon. Mr. CHOMIAK .....</p>	200-201
<p>Enhancing Respect for Manitobans – (No. 35) (Mr. GOERTZEN)  <i>Debate:</i> Mr. GOERTZEN, Hon. Mr. ASHTON, Messrs. SCHULER, ALLUM, EICHLER and MARCELINO (Tyndall Park), Mrs. STEFANSON and Hon. Ms. HOWARD. Allowed to remain in the name of Hon. Ms. HOWARD .....</p>	443-444
<p>Equal Access to Services for all Manitobans – (No. 23) (Mr. EWASKO)  <i>Debate:</i> Mr. EWASKO, Hon. Mr. BJORNSON, Mr. BRIESE and Hon. Mr. KOSTYSHYN. Allowed to remain in the name of Hon. Mr. KOSTYSHYN .....</p>	304
<p>Forced Municipal Amalgamations – (No. 18) (Mr. BRIESE)  <i>Debate:</i> Mr. BRIESE, Hon. Mr. KOSTYSHYN, Mr. PEDERSEN, Hon. Mr. BJORNSON, Mrs. ROWAT, Messrs. MALOWAY and GRAYDON and Hon. Mr. LEMIEUX. Allowed to remain in the name of Hon. Mr. LEMIEUX.....</p>	252-253
<p>Investment in Flood Protection Initiatives – (No. 26) (Mr. NEVAKSHONOFF)  <i>Debate:</i> Messrs. NEVAKSHONOFF, EICHLER, GAUDREAU and MAGUIRE, Hon. Mr. ASHTON and Mr. BRIESE. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. BRIESE.....</p>	339-340

## INDEX

<p><i>Debate continued:</i> Mr. BRIESE, Hon. Mr. KOSTYSHYN, Messrs. WISHART, PETERSEN and GRAYDON, Hon. Mr. BJORNSON, Mrs. ROWAT and Mr. GOERTZEN. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. GOERTZEN.....</p>	450
<p>Manitoba Home Care Program – (No. 24) (Ms. BRAUN)</p>	
<p><i>Debate:</i> Ms. BRAUN, Mr. WISHART, Ms. WIGHT, Mr. CULLEN, Ms. CROTHERS and Mr. EWASKO. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. EWASKO.....</p>	312
<p>Manitoba Hydro Rate Hikes – (No. 6) (Mr. SCHULER)</p>	
<p><i>Debate:</i> Mr. SCHULER, Hon. Mr. CHOMIAK, Messrs. CULLEN, MALOWAY and BRIESE, Hon. Mr. RONDEAU and Mr. DEWAR. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. DEWAR.....</p>	149-150
<p><i>Debate continued:</i> Messrs. DEWAR and PEDERSEN, Ms. WIGHT, Messrs. HELWER and PETERSEN, Mrs. STEFANSON, Hon. Mr. BJORNSON and Mr. MARCELINO (Tyndall Park). Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. MARCELINO (Tyndall Park).....</p>	458-459
<p>Manitoba’s Road to Economic Recovery – (No. 34) (Mr. GRAYDON)</p>	
<p><i>Debate:</i> Mr. GRAYDON, Hon. Mr. BJORNSON, Mr. EICHLER, Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS and Messrs. PEDERSEN, PETERSEN and DEWAR. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. DEWAR.....</p>	425-426
<p>Northern Climate Change Research – (No. 15) (Mr. PETERSEN)</p>	
<p><i>Debate:</i> Messrs. PETERSEN, MAGUIRE, WHITEHEAD and WISHART, Hon. Ms. MELNICK, Hon. Mr. GERRARD and Mr. HELWER. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. HELWER.....</p>	227-228
<p>Observance of Funeral Customs – (No. 11) (Mr. SARAN)</p>	
<p><i>Debate:</i> Messrs. SARAN and EWASKO. By leave, it was agreed to allow Mr. EWASKO to question the Member for the Maples. <i>Debate continued:</i> Messrs. WIEBE, CULLEN, GAUDREAU and WISHART, Ms. BRAUN and Mr. GOERTZEN. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. GOERTZEN.....</p>	193-194
<p>Protecting Manitoba’s Future – (No. 27) (Mrs. STEFANSON)</p>	
<p><i>Debate:</i> Mrs. STEFANSON, Hon. Mr. CHOMIAK and Messrs. SCHULER, PETERSEN, MAGUIRE and WIEBE. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. WIEBE.....</p>	348-349
<p>Provincial Government Fails Manitoba Youth – (No. 31) (Mr. SMOOK)</p>	
<p><i>Debate:</i> Mr. SMOOK, Hon. Mr. BJORNSON, Mr. EWASKO, Hon. Mr. CHIEF, Mr. FRIESEN and Ms. WIGHT. Allowed to remain in the name of Ms. WIGHT.....</p>	376-377
<p>Provincial Initiatives to Support Children and Youth – (No. 17) (Ms. BLADY)</p>	
<p><i>Debate:</i> Ms. BLADY, Mr. SMOOK, Hon. Mr. RONDEAU, Mr. GRAYDON, Hon. Mr. CHIEF and Mr. PEDERSEN. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. PEDERSEN.....</p>	242-243
<p>Provincial Taxation Broken Promises – (No. 4) (Mrs. DRIEDGER)</p>	
<p><i>Debate:</i> Mrs. DRIEDGER, Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS, Mrs. STEFANSON and Messrs. ALLUM, HELWER, MALOWAY and DEWAR. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. DEWAR.....</p>	131-132
<p><i>Debate continued:</i> Messrs. DEWAR, CULLEN and PETERSEN, Mrs. MITCHELSON, Hon. Mr. CHOMIAK, Mr. SARAN and Hon. Ms. MELNICK. Allowed to remain in the name of Hon. Ms. MELNICK.....</p>	269-270
<p>Refugee Health Care – (No. 22) (Mr. MARCELINO (Tyndall Park))</p>	
<p><i>Debate:</i> Messrs. MARCELINO (Tyndall Park) and FRIESEN, Hon. Ms. OSWALD, Mr. PEDERSEN, Hon. Ms. MELNICK, Mr. CULLEN and Mrs. DRIEDGER. Allowed to remain in the name of Mrs. DRIEDGER.....</p>	296-297
<p>Repatriation Program for Manitoban International Medical Graduates (IMGs) – (No. 33) (Mr. MAGUIRE)</p>	
<p><i>Debate:</i> Mr. MAGUIRE, Hon. Ms. OSWALD, Mr. FRIESEN, Hon. Mr. ASHTON and Messrs. CULLEN and ALLUM. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. ALLUM.....</p>	402-403
<p>Rural CancerCare Hubs – (No. 3) (Mr. DEWAR)</p>	
<p><i>Debate:</i> Messrs. DEWAR, FRIESEN, CALDWELL, HELWER, PETERSEN, EWASKO and GOERTZEN. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. GOERTZEN.....</p>	121-122

## INDEX

<i>Debate continued:</i> Messrs. GOERTZEN and CULLEN and Mrs. ROWAT. Allowed to remain in the name of Mrs. ROWAT .....	159-160
Senate of Canada – (No. 19) (Mr. ALLUM) <i>Debate:</i> Messrs. ALLUM and EICHLER, Ms. BRAUN and Messrs. PEDERSEN, MALOWAY and CULLEN. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. CULLEN .....	262-263
<i>Debate continued:</i> Messrs. CULLEN, NEVAKSHONOFF and GOERTZEN, Hon. Mr. KOSTYSHYN, Mrs. STEFANSON, Mr. PETERSEN and Mrs. ROWAT. Allowed to remain in the name of Mrs. ROWAT .....	434-435
Strong Public Health Care – (No. 32) (Mr. WIEBE) <i>Debate:</i> Messrs. WIEBE and FRIESEN, Hon. Ms. OSWALD and Messrs. MAGUIRE, GAUDREAU, CULLEN and EWASKO. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. EWASKO .....	393-394
Support for Manitoba Families with Autism – (No. 21) (Mrs. MITCHELSON) <i>Debate:</i> Mrs. MITCHELSON, Hon. Ms. HOWARD, Mrs. ROWAT, Hon. Ms. ALLAN, Mr. BRIESE and Hon. Messrs. CHIEF, BJORNSON and SWAN. Allowed to remain in the name of Hon. Mr. SWAN .....	281-282
Support for Manitoba Hydro Power Smart Program – (No. 14) (Mr. HELWER) <i>Debate:</i> Mr. HELWER, Hon. Mr. CHOMIAK and Messrs. PEDERSEN, GAUDREAU, SCHULER and MALOWAY. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. MALOWAY .....	217-218
The Need for Safe, Healthy and Sustainable Housing – (No. 25) (Mr. WISHART) <i>Debate:</i> Mr. WISHART, Hon. Ms. IRVIN-ROSS, Messrs. FRIESEN and GAUDREAU, Mrs. MITCHELSON and Ms. BRAUN. Allowed to remain in the name of Ms. BRAUN .....	317-318
United Nations World day for Cultural Diversity for Dialogue and Development – (No. 9) (Mr. GAUDREAU) <i>Debate:</i> Messrs. GAUDREAU and GOERTZEN, Hon. Ms. MARCELINO (Logan), Mr. EWASKO, Ms. CROTHERS, Mrs. STEFANSON and Mr. SCHULER. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. SCHULER .....	170-171
Western Power Grid – (No. 20) (Mr. MALOWAY) <i>Debate:</i> Messrs. MALOWAY and SCHULER, Hon. Mr. CHOMIAK and Messrs. PEDERSEN, GAUDREAU and HELWER. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. HELWER .....	273-274

### ROYAL ASSENT

Assented to Bill: December 6, 2012 .....	66
Assented to Bill: July 29, 2013 .....	354
Assented to Bills: September 11, 2013 .....	500-501
Assented to Bills: September 13, 2013 .....	549-551

### SESSIONAL AND INTERSESSIONAL PAPERS (see Appendices "F" and "G")

#### SITTINGS OF THE HOUSE

House convened (November 19, 2012)	
Pursuant to Rule 2(1), the House adjourned on Thursday, December 6, 2012.....	66
Pursuant to Rule 2(1), the House adjourned on Friday, September 13, 2013.....	551

## INDEX

Extended Sittings:	
May 2, 2013 (5:51 p.m.) .....	135
May 21, 2013 (5:58 p.m.) .....	177
May 23, 2013 (5:49 p.m.) .....	189
June 20, 2013 (7:34 p.m.) .....	257
June 24, 2013 (6:01 p.m.) .....	261
June 25, 2013 (6:01 p.m.) .....	265
June 26, 2013 (6:01 p.m.) .....	268
June 27, 2013 (6:01 p.m.) .....	272
July 10, 2013 (7:01 p.m.) .....	302
July 11, 2013 (6:20 p.m.) .....	308
August 8, 2013 (5:22 p.m.) .....	384
August 29, 2013 (5:38 p.m.) .....	448
September 12, 2013 (7:58 p.m.) .....	528
September 13, 2013 (6:25 p.m.) .....	551

### **SPEAKER OF THE HOUSE**

Informs the House:	
Appointment of Pages .....	452
Appointment of Pages .....	455
Appointment of Pages .....	459
Appointment of Pages .....	484
Appointment of Pages .....	520

### **SPEAKER'S RULINGS**

#### **OTHER**

Bill (No. 20) – Hoist Amendment – 2 <sup>nd</sup> Reading (Mr. Speaker) Ruled in order .....	179-180
Bill (No. 20) – Hoist Amendment – 2 <sup>nd</sup> Reading (Mr. Speaker) Ruled out of order .....	185
Bill (No. 20) – Hoist Amendment – 2 <sup>nd</sup> Reading (Mr. Speaker) Ruled in order .....	185-186
Bill (No. 20) – Hoist Amendment – 3 <sup>rd</sup> Reading (Mr. Speaker) Ruled in order .....	439
Bill (No. 20) – Reasoned Amendment – 2 <sup>nd</sup> Reading (Mr. Speaker) Ruled in order .....	144-145
Bill (No. 33) – Hoist Amendment – 2 <sup>nd</sup> Reading (Mr. Speaker) Ruled in order .....	191-192
Budget Speech – Amendment (Mr. Speaker) Ruled in order .....	94-95
Private Members' Resolution – Amendment (Mr. Speaker) Ruled in order .....	61-62
Throne Speech – Amendment (Mr. Speaker) Ruled in order .....	23-24

## INDEX

### PRIVILEGE, MATTERS OF

#### ISSUES RAISED IN THE 2<sup>nd</sup> SESSION OF THE 40<sup>th</sup> LEGISLATURE – RESOLVED

Privilege ( <i>prior to Routine Proceedings</i> ) – Hon. Mr. ASHTON – regarding a protest that occurred at the Portage Diversion allegedly supported by Members opposite. <i>Contributions:</i> Mr. GOERTZEN, Hon. Ms. HOWARD and Hon. Mr. GERRARD. Taken under advisement by Mr. Speaker.....	122
Mr. Speaker ruled there was no prima facie case of privilege.....	156-157
Privilege ( <i>during Oral Questions</i> ) – Hon. Mr. GERRARD – regarding the answers provided by the Honourable First Minister in question period. <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Mr. GERRARD and Hon. Mr. SELINGER. Mr. Speaker ruled there was no prima facie case of privilege. ....	129
Privilege ( <i>prior to Members' Statements</i> ) – Mr. WISHART – requesting an apology from the Member for Thompson to all victims of the 2011 flood. <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD. Taken under advisement by Mr. Speaker .....	157
Mr. Speaker ruled there was no prima facie case of privilege. Ruling challenged. Sustained, on division .....	173-174
Privilege ( <i>following the Prayer</i> ) – Mr. SCHULER – regarding comments made by the Minister of Innovation, Energy and Mines criticizing the School of Public Policy at the University of Calgary. <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD. Mr. Speaker ruled there was no prima facie case of privilege. Ruling challenged. Sustained, on division .....	231
Privilege ( <i>following the Prayer</i> ) – Mrs. ROWAT – regarding her inability to communicate with the media because of Government staff interference. <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD, Hon. Mr. GERRARD and Mr. GOERTZEN. Taken under advisement by Mr. Speaker.....	385
Mr. Speaker ruled there was no prima facie case of privilege.....	437-438
Privilege ( <i>following the Prayer</i> ) – Hon. Mr. GERRARD – regarding his cautioning from the Speaker during Oral Questions on Tuesday, September 10, 2013 for the use of the word "smug". <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD. Taken under advisement by Mr. Speaker.....	477
Mr. Speaker ruled there was no prima facie case of privilege.....	529-531
Privilege ( <i>prior to Routine Proceedings</i> ) – Mr. FRIESEN – regarding inaccurate information placed on the record by the Minister of Health with respect to the QuickCare Clinic in Selkirk. <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD. Mr. Speaker ruled there was no prima facie case of privilege .....	507-508

### PROCEDURE

Interjection – Mr. Speaker – requested that the words "this NDP Government has lied" spoken by the Honourable Member for Brandon West be withdrawn. Withdrawal by Mr. HELWER.....	94
Point of Order ( <i>during Oral Questions</i> ) – Mr. GOERTZEN – regarding the quality of the response provided by the Honourable First Minister. <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD. Mr. Speaker ruled that there was no point of order. Ruling challenged. Sustained, on division (31-18).....	102-103
Point of Order ( <i>during Oral Questions</i> ) – Mr. GOERTZEN – regarding the quality of answers provided by Ministers. <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD. Mr. Speaker ruled that there was no point of order. Ruling challenged. Sustained, on division (33-17).....	103-104



## INDEX

---

<p>Point of Order (<i>during Oral Questions</i>) – Mr. GOERTZEN – regarding the quality of answers provided by Ministers.  <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD. Mr. Speaker ruled that there was no point of order.  Ruling challenged. Sustained, on division (32-17).....</p>	104-105
<p>Interjection – Mr. Speaker – requested that the words "he lied to them" spoken by the Honourable Member for Steinbach be withdrawn. Withdrawal by Mr. GOERTZEN .....</p>	110
<p>Point of Order (<i>during Oral Questions</i>) – Mr. GOERTZEN – regarding the quality of answers provided by Ministers.  <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Mr. ASHTON. Mr. Speaker ruled that there was no point of order.  Ruling challenged. Sustained, on division (35-15).....</p>	117
<p>Point of Order (<i>during Oral Questions</i>) – Mr. GOERTZEN – regarding the quality of answers provided by Ministers.  <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD. Mr. Speaker ruled that there was no point of order.  Ruling challenged. Sustained, on division (36-15).....</p>	118
<p>Point of Order (<i>during the debate</i>) – Mrs. MITCHELSON – regarding comments made by the Honourable Member for Elmwood referring to the absence of an Honourable Member.  <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD. Taken under advisement by Mr. Speaker. ....  Mr. Speaker ruled there was no point of order. Ruling challenged. Sustained, on division (31-18) .....</p>	120 138-139
<p>Point of Order (<i>during Oral Questions</i>) – Mrs. ROWAT – regarding comments from the Honourable Member for Brandon East.  <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD. Taken under advisement by Mr. Speaker. ....  Mr. Speaker ruled there was no point of order.....</p>	124 156
<p>Point of Order (<i>following Oral Questions</i>) – Mr. GOERTZEN – regarding the answers provided by the Honourable First Minister in question period.  <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD. Mr. Speaker ruled that there was no point of order.  Ruling challenged. Sustained, on division (34-19).....</p>	124-125
<p>Point of Order (<i>following Members' Statements</i>) – Mr. GOERTZEN – regarding the answers provided by the Honourable First Minister in question period.  <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD. Mr. Speaker ruled that there was no point of order.  Ruling challenged. Sustained, on division (34-18).....</p>	125-126
<p>Point of Order (<i>during the debate</i>) – Hon. Mr. GERRARD – regarding quality of answers provided by Ministers in question period.  Mr. Speaker ruled that there was no point of order. Ruling challenged. Sustained, on division (29-18).....</p>	134-135
<p>Point of Order (<i>during the debate</i>) – Mr. GOERTZEN – regarding comments by the Minister of Infrastructure and Transportation referring to a matter taken under advisement.  <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD. Taken under advisement by Mr. Speaker. ....  Mr. Speaker ruled that there was a point of order .....</p>	143-144 163-164
<p>Interjection – Mr. Speaker – requested that the words "another lie by this Minister and this Government" spoken by the Honourable Member for Brandon West be withdrawn.  Withdrawal by Mr. HELWER .....</p>	150
<p>Interjection – Mr. Speaker – requested that the words "the Member for Agassiz is just being dishonest" spoken by the Honourable Minister of Finance be withdrawn. Withdrawal by Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS.....</p>	152
<p>Interjection – Mr. Speaker – requested that Honourable Members should be referred to by their their portfolio and asked the Honourable Member for Lac du Bonnet to withdraw his remark. Withdrawal by Mr. EWASKO. ....</p>	152

## INDEX

---

<p>Interjection – Mr. Speaker – requested that the words "the Premier lied to Manitobans" spoken by the Honourable Leader of the Official Opposition be withdrawn. Withdrawal by Mr. PALLISTER .....</p>	169
<p>Point of Order (<i>during the debate</i>) – Hon. Mr. CHOMIAK – requesting that the Honourable Member for Morden-Winkler table a document from which he was quoting. <i>Contributions:</i> Mr. GOERTZEN. Taken under advisement by Mr. Speaker.....</p>	180
<p>Interjection – Mr. Deputy Speaker – requested that the words "lies of the Premier" spoken by the Honourable Member for Arthur-Virden be withdrawn. Withdrawal by Mr. MAGUIRE.....</p>	192
<p>Interjection – Mr. Speaker – requested that the words "I've never met a liar like the Premier" spoken by the Honourable Member for Fort-Whyte be withdrawn. Withdrawal by Mr. PALLISTER .....</p>	203
<p>Point of Order (<i>during Oral Questions</i>) – Mr. GOERTZEN – regarding the conduct of Members towards each other and towards the institution, and a lack of respect by the Government for flood victims. <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD and Hon. Mr. GERRARD. Mr. Speaker ruled there was no point of order. Ruling challenged. Sustained, on division (32-19).....</p>	203-204
<p>Point of Order (<i>during Oral Questions</i>) – Mr. GOERTZEN – regarding the quality of questions answers provided by Members in question period. <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD. Mr. Speaker ruled that there was no point of order. Ruling challenged. Sustained, on division (33-19).....</p>	215-216
<p>Point of Order (<i>during Oral Questions</i>) – Mr. GOERTZEN – regarding the quality of answers provided by Members in question period. <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD. Mr. Speaker ruled that there was no point of order. Ruling challenged. Sustained, on division (31-16).....</p>	219-220
<p>Matter of Contempt (<i>during Oral Questions</i>) – Mr. GOERTZEN – regarding the undemocratic actions of the Member of Kirkfield Park. <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD. Taken under advisement by Mr. Speaker. ....</p>	224
<p>Mr. Speaker ruled that there was no matter of contempt. Ruling challenged. Sustained, on division (29-16).....</p>	245-247
<p>Point of Order (<i>during Oral Questions</i>) – Mr. GOERTZEN – regarding the quality of questions answers provided by Members in question period. <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD. Mr. Speaker ruled that there was no point of order. Ruling challenged. Sustained, on division (52-0).....</p>	224-225
<p>Point of Order (<i>following the Prayer</i>) – Hon. Mr. GERRARD – regarding the emergency recall of the House. <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD and Mr. GOERTZEN. Mr. Speaker ruled that there was no point of order.....</p>	239
<p>Point of Order (<i>during the debate</i>) – Mr. GRAYDON – regarding off the record comments made by another Member. <i>Contributions:</i> Mr. Goertzen. Taken under advisement by Mr. Speaker .....</p>	253
<p>Mr. Speaker did not rule on the matter.</p>	
<p>Point of Order (<i>during Oral Questions</i>) – Hon. Ms. HOWARD – stating that questions should not be asked of Government backbenchers. <i>Contributions:</i> Mr. GOERTZEN. Mr. Speaker ruled that there was a point of order. Ruling challenged. Sustained, on division (34-17) .....</p>	260
<p>Point of Order (<i>during Oral Questions</i>) – Mr. GOERTZEN – regarding the practice of having Legislative Assistants ask questions to Ministers. <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD. Mr. Speaker ruled there was no point of order. Ruling challenged. Sustained, on division (33-19) .....</p>	279

## INDEX

---

<p>Point of Order (<i>during the debate</i>) – Mrs. ROWAT – regarding the words "when are you coming out of the closet" allegedly spoken by the Minister of Innovation, Energy and Mines.  <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Ms. OSWALD. Taken under advisement by Mr. Speaker .....                      Mr. Speaker did not rule on the matter.</p>	281
<p>Point of Order (<i>during the debate</i>) – Hon. Mr. CHOMIAK – voluntarily apologized to the House if his comments had offended anyone.....</p>	281
<p>Interjection – Mr. Speaker – cautioned the Honourable Member for Arthur-Virden with regards to the use of the words "the Premier lied". Voluntary withdrawal by Mr. MAGUIRE .....</p>	296
<p>Point of Order (<i>during Oral Questions</i>) – Mr. GOERTZEN – stating that the Minister for Family Services and Labour was posing a question to the Leader of the Official Opposition.  <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD. Mr. Speaker ruled that there was no point of order.                      Ruling challenged. Sustained, on division .....</p>	307-308
<p>Point of Order (<i>during the debate</i>) – Mr. EICHLER – stating that Honourable Members should refer to other Members by their constituencies and should not refer to their absence from the House.                      Mr. Speaker ruled that there was a point of order. Voluntary withdrawal by Hon. Ms. IRVIN-ROSS.....</p>	318
<p>Interjection – Mr. Speaker – requested that the words "shut his trap" spoken by the Minister of Innovation, Energy and Mines be withdrawn. Withdrawal by Hon. Mr. CHOMIAK .....</p>	365
<p>Point of Order (<i>during Oral Questions</i>) – Mr. GOERTZEN – regarding the quality of answers provided by the Minister of Education in question period.  <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Mr. SWAN. Taken under advisement by Mr. Speaker.....                      Mr. Speaker ruled that there was no point of order.....</p>	382 436-437
<p>Interjection – Mr. Speaker – requested that the word "asinine" spoken by the Leader of the Official Opposition be withdrawn. Withdrawal by Mr. PALLISTER.....</p>	421
<p>Interjection – Mr. Speaker – requested that the words "I wish he would be an Honourable Member" spoken by the Honourable first Minister be withdrawn. Withdrawal by Hon. Mr. SELINGER .....</p>	441
<p>Point of Order (<i>during the debate</i>) – Mr. GOERTZEN – regarding the lack of Government Members debating Bill (No. 20).  <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD. Mr. Speaker ruled that there was no point of order.                      Ruling challenged. Sustained, on division (47-0).....</p>	446-447
<p>Point of Order (<i>during Oral Questions</i>) – Mr. GOERTZEN – regarding an answer given by the Minister of Innovation, Energy and Mines stating that he was reflecting on Members of the opposition with disrespectful language and tone.  <i>Contributions:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD. Taken under advisement by Mr. Speaker. ....                      Mr. Speaker ruled that there was no point of order.....</p>	468 520-521
<p>Interjection – Mr. Speaker – requested that the words "yapping on the other side" spoken by the Minister of Local Government be withdrawn. Voluntary apology by Hon. Mr. LEMIEUX.....</p>	475
<p>Interjection – Mr. Speaker – requested that the word "lied" spoken by the Honourable Member for Lakeside be withdrawn. Withdrawal by Mr. EICHLER.....</p>	520

## INDEX

---

### URGENT PUBLIC IMPORTANCE, MATTERS OF

Mr. EICHLER – the Provincial Government’s response to Country of Origin Labelling (COOL). <i>Debate on urgency:</i> Mr. EICHLER and Hon. Ms. HOWARD. Mr. Speaker ruled the motion out of order but given the willingness to debate put the Question, "Shall the debate proceed?" It was agreed to. <i>Debate:</i> Mr. EICHLER, Hon. Mr. KOSTYSHYN, Mr. GOERTZEN, Hon. Mr. BJORNSON, Messrs. GRAYDON, NEVAKSHONOFF, WISHART, PEDERSEN, BRIESE and MAGUIRE and Hon. Mr. GERRARD. The debate was then terminated .....	184-185
Mr. EWASKO – the Provincial Government’s violation if the Freedom of Information and Privacy Protection Act. <i>Debate on urgency:</i> Hon. Ms. HOWARD. Mr. Speaker ruled the motion out of order .....	445-446

### TAILLIEU, MAVIS

Resignation of.....	67
---------------------	----

### THRONE SPEECH

Presented by His Honour, the Administrator (November 19, 2012).....	1-14
Ordered to be taken into consideration by the House.....	15
Address in reply to, amendment	
November 20, 2012.....	21
November 21, 2012.....	23-24
November 22, 2012.....	26-28
November 23, 2012.....	30-31
November 26, 2012.....	33-35
November 27, 2012.....	37-39
November 28, 2012.....	41-43
November 29, 2012.....	45-46

### VOTES

RECORDED (see Divisions)



Philip LEE

Lieutenant Governor

PROVINCE OF MANITOBA

ELIZABETH II, Queen of Canada

## **P R O C L A M A T I O N**

With the advice and consent of the Executive Council of Manitoba, we prorogue the 2<sup>nd</sup> Session of the 40<sup>th</sup> Legislature of the Province of Manitoba on Monday, November 11, 2013, and convene the 3<sup>rd</sup> Session of the 40<sup>th</sup> Legislature of the Province of Manitoba on Tuesday, November 12, 2013, at 1:30 p.m.

HIS HONOUR PHILIP LEE  
Lieutenant Governor of the Province of Manitoba  
Winnipeg, Manitoba  
October 16, 2013

Honourable Andrew SWAN  
Minister of Justice and Attorney General