



PRAYER AND LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

1:30 O'CLOCK P.M.

The following Bills were read a First Time and had their purposes outlined:

(No. 213) – The Health Services Insurance Amendment Act (Personal Care Home Staffing Guidelines)/Loi modifiant la Loi sur l'assurance-maladie (lignes directrices en matière de dotation applicables aux foyers de soins personnels)

(MLA ASAGWARA)

(No. 229) – The Transportation Infrastructure Amendment Act/Loi modifiant la Loi sur les infrastructures de transport

(MLA LINDSEY)

(No. 232) – The Catalytic Converter Identification Act/Loi sur l'identification des convertisseurs catalytiques

(Mr. MALOWAY)

Mr. MALOWAY, Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Public Accounts, presented its Second Report, which was read as follows:

Meetings

Your Committee met on the following occasions:

- July 9, 2014 at 2:00 p.m. (*3rd Session, 40th Legislature*)
- September 8, 2014 at 2:00 p.m. (*3rd Session, 40th Legislature*)
- April 19, 2022 at 6:00 p.m. (*4th Session, 42nd Legislature*)

Matters under Consideration

- **Auditor General's Report – Annual Report to the Legislature – dated March 2014**
 - *Chapter 4 – Helicopter Ambulance Program*
 - *Chapter 7 – Manitoba's Framework for an Ethical Environment*

- **Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Previously Issued Recommendations – dated May 2014**
 - *Section 7 – Personal Care Homes Program*
 - *Section 8 – Pharmacare Program – Part 2*
 - *Section 23 – Wireless Network Security*

- **Auditor General's Report – Manitoba Home Care Program – dated July 2015**

- **Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Previously Issued Recommendations – dated May 2015**
 - *Section 10 – Wireless Network Security*

- **Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Recommendations – dated May 2016**
 - *Wireless Network Security*
 - *Helicopter Ambulance Program*

- **Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Recommendations – dated March 2017**
 - *Helicopter Ambulance Program*
 - *Manitoba Home Care Program*

- **Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Recommendations – dated March 2018**
 - *Helicopter Ambulance Program*
 - *WRHA's Management of Risks Associated with End-user Devices*
 - *Manitoba Home Care Program*
 - *Improving Education Outcomes for Kindergarten to Grade 12 Aboriginal Students*

- **Auditor General's Report – Forensic Audits – dated October 2018**
 - *Rural Municipality of De Salaberry: Audit of Financial Irregularities*

- **Auditor General's Report – Management of Foster Homes – dated November 2019**

- **Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Recommendations – dated March 2019**
 - *WRHA's Management of Risks Associated with End-user Devices*
 - *Manitoba Home Care Program*
 - *Improving Education Outcomes for Kindergarten to Grade 12 Aboriginal Students*

- **Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Recommendations – dated March 2020**
 - *Improving Education Outcomes for Kindergarten to Grade 12 Aboriginal Students*
 - *Rural Municipality of De Salaberry: Audit of Financial Irregularities*

- **Auditor General's Report – Follow-Up of Previously Issued Audit Recommendations – dated March 2021**
 - *Rural Municipality of De Salaberry: Audit of Financial Irregularities*

Committee Membership

Committee Membership for the July 9, 2014 meeting:

- Mr. DEWAR
- Mrs. DRIEDGER
- Mr. EWASKO
- Mr. FRIESEN
- Hon. Mr. GERRARD
- Mr. HELWER (*Chairperson*)
- Mr. JHA
- Mr. MARCELINO
- Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS
- Mr. WIEBE (*Vice-Chairperson*)
- Ms. WIGHT

Substitution received prior to committee proceedings:

- Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS for Hon. Ms. HOWARD
- Mrs. DRIEDGER for Mr. PEDERSEN
- Mr. EWASKO for Mr. SCHULER

Committee Membership for the September 8, 2014 meeting:

- Mr. DEWAR
- Hon. Mr. GERRARD
- Mr. HELWER (*Chairperson*)
- Mr. MARCELINO
- Mr. MARTIN
- Mr. PEDERSEN
- Mr. SARAN
- Mr. SCHULER
- Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS
- Mr. WIEBE (*Vice-Chairperson*)
- Ms. WIGHT

Substitution received prior to committee proceedings:

- Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS for Hon. Ms. HOWARD
- Mr. SARAN for Mr. JHA
- Mr. MARTIN for Mr. FRIESEN

Committee Membership for the April 19, 2022 meeting:

- Mr. LAMONT
- MLA LINDSEY
- Mr. MALOWAY (*Chairperson*)
- Mr. MARTIN

- Mr. MICHALESKI
- Ms. NAYLOR
- Mr. NESBITT (*Vice-Chairperson*)
- Mr. SMOOK
- Mr. TEITSMA
- Mr. WASYLIW
- Mr. WISHART

Officials Speaking on Record at the July 9, 2014 meeting:

- Mr. Norm Ricard, Acting Auditor General
- Hon. Ms. SELBY, Minister of Health
- Ms. Karen Herd, Deputy Minister of Health

Officials Speaking on Record at the September 8, 2014 meeting:

- Mr. Norm Ricard, Acting Auditor General
- Hon. Ms. HOWARD, Acting Minister of Finance
- Ms. Lynn Romeo, Acting Deputy Minister of Finance and Civil Service Commissioner

Officials Speaking on Record at the April 19, 2022 meeting:

- Mr. Tyson Shtykalo, Auditor General of Manitoba
- Ms. Michelle Dubik, Deputy Minister of Families

Agreements:

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of *Chapter 4 – Helicopter Ambulance Program* of the Auditor General’s Report – Annual Report to the Legislature – dated March 2014.

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of *Chapter 7 – Manitoba’s Framework for an Ethical Environment* of the Auditor General’s Report – Annual Report to the Legislature – dated March 2014.

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of *Section 7 – Personal Care Homes Program* of the Auditor General’s Report – Follow-up of Previously Issued Recommendations – dated May 2014.

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of *Section 8 – Pharmacare Program – Part 2* of the Auditor General’s Report – Follow-up of Previously Issued Recommendations – dated May 2014.

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of *Section 23 – Wireless Network Security* of the Auditor General’s Report – Follow-up of Previously Issued Recommendations – dated May 2014.

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of *Section 10 – Wireless Network Security* of the Auditor General’s Report – Follow-up of Previously Issued Recommendations – dated May 2015.

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of *Wireless Network Security* of the Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Recommendations – dated May 2016.

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of *Helicopter Ambulance Program* of the Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Recommendations – dated May 2016.

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of *Manitoba Home Care Program* of the Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Recommendations – dated March 2017.

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of *Helicopter Ambulance Program* of the Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Recommendations – dated March 2017.

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of *Manitoba Home Care Program* of the Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Recommendations – dated March 2018.

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of *Helicopter Ambulance Program* of the Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Recommendations – dated March 2018.

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of *WRHA's Management of Risks Associated with End-user Devices* of the Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Recommendations – dated March 2018.

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of *Improving Education Outcomes for Kindergarten to Grade 12 Aboriginal Students* of the Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Recommendations – dated March 2018.

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of *Rural Municipality of De Salaberry: Audit of Financial Irregularities* of the Auditor General's Report – Forensic Audits – dated October 2018.

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of *WRHA's Management of Risks Associated with End-user Devices* of the Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Recommendations – dated March 2019.

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of *Improving Education Outcomes for Kindergarten to Grade 12 Aboriginal Students* of the Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Recommendations – dated March 2019.

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of *Manitoba Home Care Program* of the Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Recommendations – dated March 2019.

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of *Improving Education Outcomes for Kindergarten to Grade 12 Aboriginal Students* of the Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Recommendations – dated March 2020.

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of *Rural Municipality of De Salaberry: Audit of Financial Irregularities* of the Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Recommendations – dated March 2020.

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of *Rural Municipality of De Salaberry: Audit of Financial Irregularities* of the Auditor General's Report – Follow-Up of Previously Issued Audit Recommendations – dated March 2021.

Reports Considered and Passed

Your Committee considered and passed the following reports as presented:

- Auditor General's Report – Annual Report to the Legislature – dated March 2014
- Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Previously Issued Recommendations – dated May 2014
- Auditor General's Report – Manitoba Home Care Program – dated July 2015
- Auditor General's Report – Management of Foster Homes – dated November 2019

Reports Considered but not Passed

Your Committee considered the following reports but did not pass them:

- Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Previously Issued Recommendations – dated May 2015 (*Section 10 – Wireless Network Security – concluded consideration of*)
- Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Recommendations – dated May 2016 (*Wireless Network Security - Helicopter Ambulance Program – concluded consideration of*)
- Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Recommendations – dated March 2017 (*Helicopter Ambulance Program - Manitoba Home Care Program – concluded consideration of*)
- Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Recommendations – dated March 2018 (*Helicopter Ambulance Program - WRHA's Management of Risks Associated with End-user Devices - Manitoba Home Care Program - Improving Education Outcomes for Kindergarten to Grade 12 Aboriginal Students – concluded consideration of*)
- Auditor General's Report – Forensic Audits – dated October 2018 (*Rural Municipality of De Salaberry: Audit of Financial Irregularities – concluded consideration of*)
- Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Recommendations – dated March 2019 (*WRHA's Management of Risks Associated with End-user Devices - Manitoba Home Care Program - Improving Education Outcomes for Kindergarten to Grade 12 Aboriginal Students – concluded consideration of*)
- Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Recommendations – dated March 2020 (*Improving Education Outcomes for Kindergarten to Grade 12 Aboriginal Students - Rural Municipality of De Salaberry: Audit of Financial Irregularities – concluded consideration of*)
- Auditor General's Report – Follow-Up of Previously Issued Audit Recommendations – dated March 2021 (*Rural Municipality of De Salaberry: Audit of Financial Irregularities – concluded consideration of*)

On motion of Mr. MALOWAY, the Report of the Committee was received.

Hon. Mr. GOERTZEN presented:

Supplement to the Estimates of Expenditure 2022-2023 – Departmental Expenditure Estimates – Justice.

(Sessional Paper No. 26)

Hon. Mr. JOHNSON presented:

Supplement to the Estimates of Expenditure 2022-2023 – Departmental Expenditure Estimates – Agriculture.

(Sessional Paper No. 27)

Hon. Mr. HELWER presented:

Supplement to the Estimates of Expenditure 2022-2023 – Departmental Expenditure Estimates – Labour, Consumer Protection and Government Services.

(Sessional Paper No. 28)

Supplement to the Estimates of Expenditure 2022-2023 – Departmental Expenditure Estimates – Public Service Commission.

(Sessional Paper No. 29)

Supplement to the Estimates of Expenditure 2022-2023 – Departmental Expenditure Estimates – Employee Pensions and Other Costs.

(Sessional Paper No. 30)

Hon. Ms. GORDON, the Minister of Health, made a statement regarding National Organ and Tissue Awareness Week.

MLA ASAGWARA and, by leave, Hon. Mr. GERRARD commented on the statement.

Pursuant to Rule 27(1), Mr. TEITSMA, Mrs. SMITH (Point Douglas), Messrs. MARTIN and MOSES and Hon. Mr. FIELDING made Members' Statements.

The House resumed the Debate on the Proposed Motion of Hon. Mr. FRIESEN:

THAT this House approves in general the budgetary policy of the Government.

And the proposed amendment moved by Mr. KINEW as follows:

THAT the motion be amended by deleting all of the words after “House” and substituting:

therefore regrets that this budget neglects the priorities of Manitobans by:

- a) continuing with Brian Pallister's plan and failed approach to health care, education, reconciliation and the economy; and
- b) taking Brian Pallister's failed plan for health care cuts from Winnipeg to rural Manitoba; and
- c) instituting a de facto cut to hospitals, emergency rooms and clinics across Winnipeg, Brandon, Swan River, Dauphin, Selkirk, Gimli, Thompson, Flin Flon, The Pas, Churchill and many other rural, Northern and remote communities across the province; and
- d) offering more empty promises to fix the extremely high surgical and diagnostic caseload backlog that has only grown larger because of the inaction and refusal to work with front line workers and invest in real solutions; and
- e) refusing to stop the practice of sending seniors hundreds of kilometres away from home for health care because the PC cuts have removed capacity from the system; and
- f) failing to increase the amount of personal care home beds as Manitoba now has fewer personal care home beds today than when the Progressive Conservatives took power in 2016; and
- g) refusing to offer a comprehensive workforce agenda for the health care sector or for reversing their cut to health care coverage for International Students in Manitoba; and
- h) failing to present a plan for adult education or other supports for Manitobans;
- i) rejecting evidence of the effectiveness of safe consumption sites to address the addictions and mental health crisis as the province experienced the highest number of overdose deaths last year in its history; and
- j) continuing to underfund, underspend and cut the K-12 education system leading to larger classes and fewer supports in the classroom for students; and
- k) offering no plan to create the spaces needed in the early learning and child care sector, no real capital program or a workforce strategy to staff the sector; and
- l) failing to implement a universal school breakfast program to ensure every child succeeds in the classroom; and
- m) refusing to provide products in schools, to make sure no student is subjected to period poverty; and
- n) failing to provide for regular families as the cost of everyday essentials including electricity and natural gas bills increase; and

- o) making permanent a renters tax hike in the midst of the highest inflation in decades; and
- p) making life more unaffordable by increasing tuition for colleges and universities by millions while continuing to freeze support for post-secondary institutions across the province; and
- q) refusing to help municipalities deliver their essential services by not increasing the funding for municipalities for a 6th consecutive year; and
- r) underspending last year's infrastructure budget by nearly \$60 million dollars and freezing the maintenance and repair budget for provincial roads and highways for at least the next three years while refusing to invest in important projects like repairs to Highway 6 or improvements to Chief Peguis Trail; and
- s) continuing to send hundreds of thousands of dollars of Manitobans' money to a Texas based company in order to access our provincial parks while failing to fix the technical failings of the booking system; and
- t) ignoring the climate crisis by not offering a real plan or targets to address it, underfunding programs meant to support cleaner energy and not adopting measures to support transition like updated Building Codes; and
- u) failing to offer leadership or a plan to grow Manitoba's economy for the next ten years; and
- v) refusing to offer a real plan to create good jobs in rural and Northern Manitoba or to invest in the mining sector; and
- w) jeopardizing access to rural broadband by pursuing privatization and failing to provide investments to ensure rural and northern communities can get connected to highspeed internet; and
- x) ignoring the needs of small businesses who have been left behind by this Provincial Government while it rewards its friends and other well connected insiders; and
- y) lacking any real action on reconciliation with Indigenous peoples; and
- z) refusing to engage in good faith negotiation with rights holders like the Manitoba Métis Federation; and
- aa) failing to offer a plan to build or repair social housing in Manitoba, housing for seniors or a comprehensive plan to address homelessness; and

- bb) refusing to offer real support for settlement services for people fleeing the War in Ukraine while at the same time cutting funding for programs such as ‘Immigration pathways’; and
- cc) cutting funding to the Fair Registration Office after having failed to support Internationally Educated Nurses and other professionals in having their credentials recognized in Manitoba; and
- dd) failing to address the concerns of producers, including their concerns regarding increased lease costs, a failing crown lands program and closed Agriculture Offices across the province; and
- ee) rejecting the need to provide proper salaries for working people, failing to properly address the needs of workers in sectors like Community Living Disability Services or Home Care workers or other health care workers and refusing to address the challenges experienced by women, BIPOC and other marginalized groups to fully participate in a pandemic recovery; and
- ff) failing to learn the lessons of the pandemic by further cutting healthcare funding, refusing to release up to date data about the spread of COVID-19 and refusing to call for an independent investigation into the Provincial Government’s pandemic response.

As a consequence, the Provincial Government has thereby lost the confidence of this House and the people of Manitoba.

And the proposed sub-amendment moved by Mr. LAMONT as follows:

THAT the amendment be amended by adding after clause (ff) the following clauses:

- gg) failing to make new investments in improving the lives and abilities people of Manitoba, choosing instead to expand existing inequities and selecting the status quo over growth and innovation; and
- hh) failing to increase funding for the Emergency Measures Organization, despite two years of historic crises, including pandemics, fires and floods; and
- ii) failing to provide any sort of a plan for individuals seeking to escape wars in Ukraine and Afghanistan by partnering with local organizations to ensure a proper and smooth resettlement transition to Manitoba; and
- jj) failing to commit to equitable health and education funding for all Manitobans, choosing instead to continue concentrating services in Winnipeg; and
- kk) failing to provide adequate relief and support to smaller enterprises in Manitoba and mom and pop businesses who are struggling to survive after two years of pandemic struggles; and

- ll) failing to create an independent, non-political means of distributing \$50 million in venture capital, which is essential to establishing business confidence; and
- mm) failing to pursue fiscally sound measures, choosing to issue cheques with no lasting economic benefit that will have to be paid back by future generations, while shunning meaningful investments in growth and stability; and
- nn) failing to make desperately needed new investments in education, and in reducing barriers and obstacles that block Manitobans from meeting their full potential; and
- oo) failing to make proactive investments to avoid health concerns especially areas such as diabetes supplies and medications that can prevent death and disability; and
- pp) failing to provide a plan of relief for the thousands of Manitobans that have waited weeks, months, and sometimes years on a waiting list to have necessary medical needs addressed; and
- qq) failing to address the significant impact COVID-19 has had on the mental well being of Manitobans and the development of children by providing a plan that focuses on mental wellness and brain health to ensure that Manitobans are living healthy, fulfilled lives; and
- rr) failing to ensure children attending Manitoba schools receive a minimum of one meal or snack each day; and
- ss) failing to recognize that health care reforms to date have been a disaster, and choosing to build new hospitals across Manitoba while failing to recruit and hire enough hire doctors, nurses and other health professionals to staff existing facilities; and
- tt) failing to provide a seamless, integrated and effective approach to addictions where people can get the help they need at any time of day or night, instead of through RAAM clinics which have limited hours and therefore limited effectiveness; and
- uu) failing to close the wage gap to ensure that rural paramedics are given a wage incentive to live and work in rural Manitoba; and
- vv) failing to present a plan to address economic issues while at the same time making Manitoba more sustainable by making drastic reductions in net carbon dioxide, methane and nitrous oxide emissions; and
- ww) failing to allow Manitobans to take steps to reducing their own carbon footprint by following the Federal Government's lead by providing rebates for the purchase of electric vehicles, major retrofits to existing buildings and adaptations of agriculture.

Wednesday, April 20, 2022

And the debate continuing on the sub-amendment,

And Hon. Ms. GORDON, Messrs. ALTOMARE, KHAN, MOSES and TEITSMA, Hon. Messrs. GERRARD and REYES, Mr. BUSHIE and Hon. Ms. SQUIRES having spoken.

The debate was allowed to remain open.

The House then adjourned at 5:00 p.m. until 1:30 p.m. Thursday, April 21, 2022.

Hon. Myrna DRIEDGER,
Speaker.