

Monday, March 16, 1998



LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS No. 18

FOURTH SESSION, THIRTY-SIXTH LEGISLATURE

PRAYERS

1:30 O'CLOCK P.M.

The following petitions were presented:

Mr. DEWAR - Minister of Health to put an end to the centralization and privatization of Winnipeg hospital food services (L. McBain, L. Griffin and L. Anderson Boyd)

Mr. MALOWAY - Minister of Health to put an end to the centralization and privatization of Winnipeg hospital food services (V. Milinkovic, A. Horner, D. Naskar and others)

Mr. SANTOS - Minister of Health to consider immediately cancelling the hospital food proposal and concentrate on delivering quality health care instead of using health dollars to provide contracts for private firms (T. R. Horn, S. F. Fowler, G. Robinson and others)

During Oral Questions, Hon. Mr. McCRAE rose on a point of order regarding the word "bully" used by the Honourable Member for Osborne in reference to the Honourable Minister of Education,

And Mr. ASHTON having spoken to the point of order,

WHEREUPON Madam Speaker requested that the word be withdrawn.

Ms. McGIFFORD withdrew her remark.

Subsequently, during Oral Questions, Mr. ASHTON rose on a point of order regarding comments made by the Honourable First Minister in reference to the Honourable Member for St. James,

WHEREUPON Hon. Mr. FILMON voluntarily withdrew his remarks.

Monday, March 16, 1998

Subsequently, during Oral Questions, Madam Speaker interjected and requested the word "hooligan" used by the Honourable Member for St. James in reference to the Honourable Minister of Education be withdrawn,

WHEREUPON Ms. MIHYCHUK withdrew her remarks.

Following Oral Questions, Madam Speaker made the following rulings:

During Question Period on June 23, I took under advisement a point of order raised by the Opposition House Leader respecting words spoken by the First Minister in response to a question asked by the Honourable Member for St. Johns. The Opposition House Leader asked that the words be withdrawn, and stated that they contravened Beauchesne citation 484 as well as being unparliamentary. The words in question were "I know that the Member opposite does not have issues of substance, so he chooses to look for substance of slime when he comes to Question Period."

The Opposition House Leader did have a point of order. Citation 484 states that a Member will not be permitted to impute unworthy motives to the actions of another Member. I would ask the First Minister to withdraw the words he spoke.

WHEREUPON Hon. Mr. FILMON withdrew his remarks.

-- --

On June 25, the Deputy Speaker took under advisement a point of order raised by the Opposition House Leader respecting words the Premier allegedly spoke from his seat during a speech by the Honourable Member for The Maples during a matter of privilege. The words spoken, according to the Opposition House Leader, were "phoney tactical crap" and he asked that the words be withdrawn. When taking the matter under advisement, the Deputy Speaker indicated that if the words in question had been picked up in Hansard, a ruling would come back to the House.

The words which appear in the Hansard record are "phoney tactical".

Speakers in Manitoba and other Canadian jurisdictions have ruled that words not spoken on the record cannot be the subject of intervention. These rulings are based on Beauchesne citation 486(4) which states that "*Remarks which do not appear on the public record and are therefore private conversations not heard by the Chair do not invite the intervention of the Speaker, although Members have apologized for hurtful remarks uttered in such circumstances.*" Therefore, I cannot ask that the words be withdrawn, but I would ask the Premier to be prudent in the choice of his language.

Pursuant to Rule 20(1), Messrs. HELWER and MARTINDALE, Mrs. RENDER and Messrs. SANTOS and DYCK made Members' Statements.

Monday, March 16, 1998

The House resumed the Interrupted Debate on the Proposed Motion of Hon. Mr. STEFANSON:

THAT this House approve in general the budgetary policy of the government.

And the Proposed Motion of Mr. DOER in amendment thereto:

THAT the motion be amended by deleting all the words after "House" and substituting the following:

Therefore regrets this Budget ignores the present and future needs of Manitobans by:

- (a) failing to address the crisis in health care;
- (b) failing to relieve the stresses in our education system;
- (c) failing to provide new hope for Manitoba children; and,
- (d) failing to provide new opportunities for Aboriginal Manitobans.

And the debate continuing on the amendment,

And Hon. Mr. PRAZNIK concluding his remarks,

And Messrs. ASHTON, PENNER, JENNISSEN and Hon. Mrs. MITCHELSON having spoken,

And Mr. HICKES speaking at 6:00 p.m.,

The debate was allowed to remain in his name.

The House then adjourned at 6:00 p.m. until 1:30 p.m. tomorrow.

Hon. Louise Dacquay,
Speaker.